

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TF050094

GEF2 MSP-INDONESIA : CONSERVATION OF KEY FORESTS IN THE SANGHIE-TAULAD ISLANDS

GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000059916 - Anthony J. Whitten
Approving Manager: 00000020516 - Susan S. Shen

Summary Information	
TF Status	LCLS
Recipient Country	Indonesia
Executed By	Bank
Managing Unit	6991 - EASRE
Grant Start Date / Closing Date	12/03/2001 to 12/31/2006
Program Manager	
Orig. Grant Amount	815,500.00
Grant Amount	815,499.15
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	815,499.15 as of 06/30/2007
Disbursed 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007	815,499.15
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements, Internal Comments.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:

TO CONSERVE THE BIOLOGICAL SIGNIFICANT AND THREATENED ENDEMIC BIRD HABITATS IN SANGHI-TALAUD ISLANDS.

Overall progress from 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Rating: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Comment:

Overall, the achievement of grant objectives is rated as Satisfactory, due to the successful completion of the majority of planned activities and the extension to new activities identified during project implementation. The project successfully piloted a community-level approach to forest management and protection, by the development of village-level conservation agreements and regulations, and the incorporation of these agreements into district-level strategies for integrated forest management. Local government ownership of this approach was high, with inter-agency teams established to implement the district forest strategies, and in the case of Sangihe, budget allocated to begin work with communities. On Sangihe, clearance of primary level forest was almost halted during project implementation; results on Karakelang island regarding encroachment were less clear, but the trade in red-and-blue lorries was much diminished during project implementation. See attached ICM for further details.

Overall progress from 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

Rating: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Comment:

Implementation of the grant has been strong, with high quality local and national staff enabling concrete conservation outcomes. BirdLife Indonesia's project staff have developed a firm relationship with local government, resulting in a high level of ownership over project activities and extension of the project approach through government channels.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

The grant is given to:

Strengthen protection and improve management of natural forests and biodiversity on Mt. Sahendaruman, Sangihe
Strengthen protection and improve management of forests and biodiversity within the Conservation Area on Karakelang Island, Talaud.
Strengthen awareness, commitment and capacity for forest and wildlife conservation at local level
Monitor baselines and conservation assessments in place for key habitats and species

Expected follow up (if any):

Comment on follow up:

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:

Activity Risk

Rating:

Comment:

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

There are currently no issues and actions for Management attention.

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007

The project has no defined GDO, but its aims are

##To conserve, for the long-term, the distinct centre of endemism and speciation in the key forests of Sangihe and the Talaud islands;

##To develop replicable approaches to biodiversity conservation on a small Indonesian Island system and at District (Kabupaten) level, which target the local community and local government.

In both these regards the project is considered to have achieved the desired outcomes; the level of ownership over the approach by local government and the support from local communities is pleasing. Whether the project will achieve success in the long-term is still unclear, and would only be revealed by future monitoring.

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

NO SIGNIFICANT DECLINES IN B POPULATIONS

Baseline Baseline surveys completed during project, or taken from literature published from previous surveys
Value:

Date:

Progress to 2003-2005: No major decreases in location or estimated density of surveyed birds on Sangihe. Red-and-blue lory
Date: populations on Karakelang have slightly increased.

Date:

Target Value: Same or greater

Date:

Clearance of primary forest halted

Baseline Baseline value
Value:

Date:

Progress to Clearance of primary forest on Sangihe halted, successful prosecution of illegal loggers. Northern part of
Date: Karakelang is still the target of clearing by local people.

Date:

Target Value: No decline

Date:

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

At least one local NGO strengthened

Baseline Zero

Value:

Date:

Progress to A number of NGOs, community organisations and groups strengthened - see attached ICM.

Date:

Date:

Target Value: One

Date:

There is no successful legal or illegal

Baseline Absent

Value:

Date:

Progress to No reports of commercial exploitation planned in forests of Karakelang Wildlife reserve.

Date:

Date:

Target Value: Absent

Date:

Evidence of increased public concern abo

Baseline Low

Value:

Date:

Progress to Public surveys revealed increased concerns about environmental issues, although results are mixed. See ICM.

Date:

Date:

Target Value: High

Date:

The area of forest inside the protected

Baseline Baseline value

Value:

Date:

Progress to Participative monitoring reveals there is no more clearing of natural forest in Sahendaruman. The northern part of Karakelang is under pressure from clearing.

Date:

Date:

Target Value: Less

Date:

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

COMPONENTS

Output and Implementation by Component

NATURAL FORESTS - MT SAHENDARUMAN, SANGIHE

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory
Status: Completed
Planned Output: 1. Strategy produced to maintain and enhance forest protection on Mt. Sahendaruman. 2. Strategy institutionalised at Kecamatan and Kabupaten level. 3. Initiatives underway in support of strategy.
Actual Output: Local government has begun implementing district level regulation on forest management, facilitating conservation agreements and regulations in 5 villages.

NATURAL FOREST - CONSERVATION AREA KARAKELANG

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory
Status: Completed
Planned Output: Status of hunting reserve changed to wildlife sanctuary. ##Enhanced capacity of PHKA (government).##Future direction agreed by all primary stakeholders.##
Actual Output: 5 villages have completed village conservation regulations. Bupati has issued decree on forest management strategy and established coordinating team. KSDA are patrolling reserve.

PUBLIC AWARENESS

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory
Status: Completed
Planned Output: Increased public awareness and support for conservation.
Actual Output: Awareness program completed in Sangihe and Karakelang, including development of resource booklet.

MONITORING AND MANAGEMENT

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory
Status: Completed
Planned Output: Monitoring of forest cover and biodiversity on Mt. Sahendaruman and Karakelang Wildlife Sanctuary
Actual Output: Bird surveys carried out on both islands. Trade in red-and-blue lorries from Karakelang monitored. Thematic maps (soils, forest cover, land use etc.) developed.

CO-ORDINATING OFFICE

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory
Status: Completed
Planned Output: Coordinating office established. Staff recruited, formal collaboration with Government and NGO partners. Effective work planning, reporting and monitoring.
Actual Output: Main office has been moved to Karakelang, with monitoring visits to Sangihe. Presence and activities are being maintained by NGO after formal close of project.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Comment on planned and actual Output

See attached ICM for more details.

Comment on component implementation progress

PROGRAM

Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement - Satisfactory
2. Please rate government commitment - Satisfactory
3. Please rate safeguard performance - Satisfactory
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability - Satisfactory

Program Specific Questions

1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged

The project effectively leveraged resources from local government during implementation - Sangihe District government received budget allocations from the central government for the implementation of the Bupati's decree on forest management, and carried out other initiatives in support of the project activities. Cofinancing was also provided by the Talaud District government. The project was able to raise the profile of Karakelang Wildlife Reserve with the regional conservation agency in Manado, and also in Jakarta, increasing the amount of funding which was provided to the Karakelang Wildlife Reserve Management, and increasing the number of staff. BirdLife assisted communities on Karakelang to develop a proposal to Seacology - an NGO based in Bali # for the funding of a community health centre, construction of which has now begun. A second proposal to support Elung Banua to continue with participatory monitoring and forest protection is under consideration, and may be supported in 2008. After project close, Sangihe District government continues to facilitate coordination between different agencies in relation to the implementation of the Bupati's decree on forest management, although funds have not yet been allocated in

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

2007 for the continuation of facilitation at the village level. Both Sangihe and Talaud district governments have accessed funds from the national rehabilitation program (GERHAN), to restore degraded sections of forest (Rp 4.5 bn for Sangihe, including reforestation of watershed protection forest of Mt. Sahendaruman; Rp 2.25 bn for reforestation on Karakelang). KSDA Talaud have received an operational budget of Rp 110 million in 2007 for patrolling and monitoring wildlife trade from Karakelang.

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

See attached ICM

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated Uncertain

Comment:

See attached ICM

Bank Performance: Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

See attached ICM

Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Modest

Comment:

See attached ICM

Mobilization of other resources: Rated Modest

Comment:

See attached ICM

Knowledge exchange : Rated Modest

Comment:

See attached ICM

Client's policy / program implementation : Rated Not Applicable

Comment:

See attached ICM

Efficiency : Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

See attached ICM

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Replicability: Rated Likely

Comment:

See attached ICM

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

See attached ICM

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

See attached ICM

PROCESSING

Manager's comments on this GRM report:

None

GRM report history - Requested on 06/29/2007, due on 07/31/2007

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/09/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/17/2007
Changed	Bryony Morgan	Draft	07/17/2007
Changed	Anthony J. Whitten	Draft	07/26/2007
Mail sent to Reviewer	Anthony J. Whitten	Draft	07/26/2007
Submitted for Approval	Anthony J. Whitten	Submitted	07/30/2007
Mail Sent to PM	Anthony J. Whitten	Submitted	07/30/2007
Approved by Manager	Susan S. Shen	Approved	07/30/2007

DOCUMENTS

List of documents attached to this GRM

- 1) Sangihe Talaud ICM.doc
- 2) Activity progress against targets.doc
- 3) SATAL_mett_compilation.doc

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF050094
Printed On: 11/28/2007

Reporting Period: 12/03/2001 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
07/01/2001	12/31/2001	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2002	06/30/2002	0.00	0.00	206,712.00	206,712.00
07/01/2002	12/31/2002	0.00	0.00	229,153.15	22,441.15
01/01/2003	06/30/2003	0.00	0.00	328,485.56	99,332.41
07/01/2003	12/31/2003	0.00	0.00	328,485.56	0.00
01/01/2004	06/30/2004	0.00	0.00	471,201.15	142,715.59
07/01/2004	12/31/2004	0.00	0.00	471,201.15	0.00
01/01/2005	06/30/2005	0.00	0.00	664,933.76	193,732.61
07/01/2005	12/31/2005	0.00	0.00	664,933.76	0.00
01/01/2006	06/30/2006	0.00	0.00	773,933.76	109,000.00
07/01/2006	12/31/2006	0.00	0.00	773,933.76	0.00

INTERNAL COMMENTS

None