

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF052189
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TF052189

GEF2 MSP-MOROCCO:ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT UPGRADING OF THE INDUSTRIAL PARK OF SIDI BERNOUSSI ZENATA, CASABLANCA

GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000068419 - Nourredine Bouzaher
Approving Manager: 00000152294 - Reynold Duncan

Summary Information	
TF Status	LCLS
Recipient Country	Morocco
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	7023 - MNSIF
Grant Start Date / Closing Date	07/02/2003 to 04/30/2007
Program Manager	
Original Grant Amount	750,000.00
Grant Amount	749,265.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	749,265.00 as of 06/30/2007
Disbursed 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007	749,265.00
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF052189
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:

DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMERCIALY VIABLE ENERGY EFFICIENCY INVESTMENTS, ENHANCED KNOWLEDGE AND MECHANISMS NECESSARY FOR FINANCIERS AND END-USERS TO FUND ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROJECTS AND SUSTAINABILITY AND CONTINUATION OF ENERGY MANAGEMENT AND RELATED ACTIVITIES.

Overall progress from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Rating: Unsatisfactory(Previously Rated Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Comment:

The grant will have contributed to the removal of barriers to energyefficiency but looks set for coming short on the achievement of projectoutcomes listed in the project documentation such as the increase in thenumber of energy efficiency investments, drop in energy and water bills of industrial units, drop in emissions of air pollutants, stronger level of private and financial sector involvement and replication in other industrial parks.

Overall progress from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

Rating: Moderately Satisfactory(Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Comment:

50 audits were carried out and agreements have been signed to implement 6 of them. Furthermore, 21 detailed designs were also carried out and several bid documents have been prepared. Of the 21 detailed designs, five are being implemented. important efforts were made in terms of information and dissemination about energy efficiency and its advantages most notably through workshops and publications. An international workshop to share experience in energy efficiency in industrial parks was held in April 2005 in Casablanca.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

Expected follow up (if any): Dissemination of new knowledge/technology/best practice

Comment on follow up:

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:

Activity Risk

Rating:

Comment:

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

There are currently no issues and actions for Management attention.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF052189
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007

DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMERCIALY VIABLE ENERGY EFFICIENCY INVESTMENTS, ENHANCED KNOWLEDGE AND MECHANISMS NECESSARY FOR FINANCIERS AND END-USERS TO FUND ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROJECTS AND SUSTAINABILITY AND CONTINUATION OF ENERGY MANAGEMENT AND RELATED ACTIVITIES.

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

ELECTRICITY SAVINGS

Baseline 21 GWh annually

Value:

Date: 05/03/2003

Progress to 0

Date:

Date: 06/08/2006

Target Value: 63

Date:

FUEL SAVINGS

Baseline 11,250 tonnes annually

Value:

Date: 05/03/2003

Progress to 0

Date:

Date: 06/08/2006

Target Value: 33750

Date:

AVOIDED GhG EMISSIONS IN T EQ CO2

Baseline 50,000 tons per year

Value:

Date: 05/03/2003

Progress to 0

Date:

Date: 06/08/2006

Target Value: 150000

Date:

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF052189
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

Output and Implementation by Component

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Implementation Rating: Moderately Satisfactory
Status: Completed
Planned Output: workshop
Actual Output: satisfactory

Comment on planned and actual Output

Comment on component implementation progress

The grant will have contributed to the removal of barriers to energy efficiency but looks set for coming short on the achievement of project outcomes listed in the project documentation such as the increase in the number of energy efficiency investments, drop in energy and water bills of industrial units, drop in emissions of air pollutants, stronger level of private and financial sector involvement and replication in other industrial parks.

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P074686 - MA-Energy & Environment Upgrading
Project Status: Lending
Global Focal Area: Climate change
Product Line: GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: ASSOCIATION IZDIHAR
Contact: MS. DOUNIA OUADGHIRI
Address: CENTRE DE FORMATION ONE, CASABLANCA
Phone: (212) 22 66 69 80/81 Email: DOUNIA.OUADGHIRI@IZDIHAR.MA
Website:

Implementation performance ratings from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007 with regard to:

Project Management: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:
lack focus on results

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF052189	Reporting Period:	07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Printed On:	11/21/2011	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

Financial Management: Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

None

Counterpart Funding: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

None

Procurement: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

a single contract with EID

Monitoring and Evaluation: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

failing to report on results but only on potential

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:

As noted earlier under the overview tab, it looks unlikely that the project will achieve its objective as indicated by the performance indicators.

PROGRAM

Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement - Moderately Satisfactory
2. Please rate government commitment - Unsatisfactory
3. Please rate safeguard performance - Moderately Satisfactory
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability - Unsatisfactory

Program Specific Questions

1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged

Resources were also provided by the French environmental fund. The French fund is continuing its support for the program.

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

- Develop realistic objectives and targets, including a realistic implementation period
- Involve stakeholders in the design of the project very early in the process and start raising awareness about energy efficiency issues and benefits well ahead of the project.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated Uncertain

Comment:

As explained earlier sustainability is at best uncertain.

Bank Performance: Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

the Bank regularly supervised the project and draw attention on implementation shortcomings to the Association

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF052189
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Modest

Comment:

The Association IZDIHAR is struggling to establish itself as a viable long term institution

Mobilization of other resources: Rated Substantial

Comment:

French GEF

Knowledge exchange : Rated Modest

Comment:

There have been workshops and ESMAP publications on the IZDIHAR experience but the audience remains limited.

Client's policy / program implementation : Rated Modest

Comment:

The Association IZDIHAR is assisted by a consultant in the implementation of the project. Own implementation capacity is limited. The French GEF assistance is continuing.

Efficiency : Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory

Comment:

Even though the time elapsed is too short to measure the results of the project, it is clear that it will not achieve all of its objectives. In this sense the assistance provided was not cost effective

Replicability: Rated Uncertain

Comment:

The replicability of the same project design does not appear likely.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

The involvement of stakeholders should be sought earlier and meaningfully

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

Request for this type of assistance should be carefully screened to make sure that the operation has a significant chance of success.

PROCESSING

Manager's comments on this GRM report:

Date:08/29/2007 User ID:WB152294 Name:Mr Reynold Duncan Operation performed:Approved by Manager

Converse to the suggested lesson on realism, the necessary support and commitment needed to achieve the objectives should have been ensured at the preparation stage.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF052189
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

GRM report history - Requested on 06/29/2007, due on 06/30/2008

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	06/29/2007
Changed	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	06/29/2007
Changed	Khalid Boukantar	Draft	08/21/2007
Changed	Khalid Boukantar	Draft	08/21/2007
Changed	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	08/28/2007
Changed	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	08/28/2007
Changed	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	08/29/2007
Changed	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	08/29/2007
Changed	Nourredine Bouzaher	Draft	08/29/2007
Submitted for Approval	Nourredine Bouzaher	Submitted	08/29/2007
Approved by Manager	Reynold Duncan	Approved	08/29/2007

DOCUMENTS

List of documents attached to this GRM

- 1) Final ICM MOROCCO SIDI BERNOUSSI.doc

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
07/01/2003	12/31/2003	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2004	06/30/2004	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2004	12/31/2004	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2005	06/30/2005	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2005	12/31/2005	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2006	06/30/2006	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2006	12/31/2006	0.00	0.00	74,926.50	74,926.50
01/01/2007	06/30/2007	0.00	0.00	149,853.00	74,926.50