Assignment: TF052189

GEF2 MSP-MOROCCO: ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT UPGRAADING OF THE INDUSTRIAL PARK OF SIDI BERNOUSSI ZENATA, CASABLANCA

GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000068419 - Nourredine Bouzaher
Approving Manager: 00000152294 - Reynold Duncan

Summary Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TF Status</th>
<th>LCLS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recipient Country</td>
<td>Morocco</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executed By</td>
<td>Recipient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Unit</td>
<td>7023 - MNSIF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Start Date / Closing Date</td>
<td>07/02/2003 to 04/30/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Grant Amount</td>
<td>750,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Amount</td>
<td>749,265.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outstanding Commitments</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative Disbursements</td>
<td>749,265.00 as of 06/30/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disbursed 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007</td>
<td>749,265.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donor</td>
<td>TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements.
OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:
DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMERCIALLY VIABLE ENERGY EFFICIENCY INVESTMENTS, ENHANCED KNOWLEDGE AND MECHANISMS NECESSARY FOR FINANCIERS AND END-USERS TO FUND ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROJECTS AND SUSTAINABILITY AND CONTINUATION OF ENERGY MANAGEMENT AND RELATED ACTIVITIES.

Overall progress from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:
Rating: Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)
Comment:
The grant will have contributed to the removal of barriers to energy efficiency but looks set for coming short on the achievement of project outcomes listed in the project documentation such as the increase in the number of energy efficiency investments, drop in energy and water bills of industrial units, drop in emissions of air pollutants, stronger level of private and financial sector involvement and replication in other industrial parks.

Overall progress from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:
Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2006)
Comment:
50 audits were carried out and agreements have been signed to implement 6 of them. Furthermore, 21 detailed designs were also carried out and several bid documents have been prepared. Of the 21 detailed designs, five are being implemented. Important efforts were made in terms of information and dissemination about energy efficiency and its advantages most notably through workshops and publications. An international workshop to share experience in energy efficiency in industrial parks was held in April 2005 in Casablanca.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

Expected follow up (if any): Dissemination of new knowledge/technology/best practice

Comment on follow up:

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:

Activity Risk
Rating:
Comment:

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention
There are currently no issues and actions for Management attention.
OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007

DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMERCIAL VIABLE ENERGY EFFICIENCY INVESTMENTS, ENHANCED KNOWLEDGE AND MECHANISMS NECESSARY FOR FINANCIERS AND END-USERS TO FUND ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROJECTS AND SUSTAINABILITY AND CONTINUATION OF ENERGY MANAGEMENT AND RELATED ACTIVITIES.

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

ELECTRICITY SAVINGS
Baseline 21 GWh annually
Value:
  Date: 05/03/2003
Progress to 0
Date:
  Date: 06/08/2006
Target Value: 63
  Date:

FUEL SAVINGS
Baseline 11,250 tonnes annually
Value:
  Date: 05/03/2003
Progress to 0
Date:
  Date: 06/08/2006
Target Value: 33750
  Date:

AVOIDED GhG EMISSIONS IN T EQ CO2
Baseline 50,000 tons per year
Value:
  Date: 05/03/2003
Progress to 0
Date:
  Date: 06/08/2006
Target Value: 150000
  Date:
COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

Output and Implementation by Component

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Implementation: Moderately Satisfactory
Rating: 
Status: Completed
Planned Output: workshop
Actual Output: satisfactory

Comment on planned and actual Output

Comment on component implementation progress

The grant will have contributed to the removal of barriers to energy efficiency but looks set for coming short on the achievement of project outcomes listed in the project documentation such as the increase in the number of energy efficiency investments, drop in energy and water bills of industrial units, drop in emissions of air pollutants, stronger level of private and financial sector involvement and replication in other industrial parks.

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P074686 - MA-Energy & Environment Upgrading
Project Status: Lending
Global Focal Area: Climate change
Product Line: GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: ASSOCIATION IZDIHAR
Contact: MS. DOUNIA OUADGHIRI
Address: CENTRE DE FORMATION ONE, CASABLANCA
Phone: (212) 22 66 69 80/81 Email: DOUNIA.OUADGHIRI@IZDIHAR.MA
Website:

Implementation performance ratings from 07/02/2003 to 06/30/2007 with regard to:

Project Management: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:
lack focus on results
Financial Management: Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)
   Brief Comment:
   None

Counterpart Funding: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)
   Brief Comment:
   None

Procurement: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)
   Brief Comment:
   a single contract with EID

Monitoring and Evaluation: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2006)
   Brief Comment:
   failing to report on results but only on potential

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:
As noted earlier under the overview tab, it looks unlikely that the project will achieve its objective as indicated by the performance indicators.

PROGRAM

Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement - Moderately Satisfactory
2. Please rate government commitment - Unsatisfactory
3. Please rate safeguard performance - Moderately Satisfactory
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability - Unsatisfactory

Program Specific Questions

1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged
   Resources were also provided by the French environmental fund. The French fund is continuing its support for the program.

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:
- Develop realistic objectives and targets, including realistic implementation period
- Involve stakeholders in the design of the project very early in the process and start raising awareness about energy efficiency issues and benefits well ahead of the project.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated Uncertain
Comment:
As explained earlier sustainability is at best uncertain.

Bank Performance: Rated Satisfactory
Comment:
the Bank regularly supervised the project and draw attention on implementation shortcomings to the Association
Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Modest
Comment:
The Association IZDIHAR is struggling to establish itself as a viable long term institution.

Mobilization of other resources: Rated Substantial
Comment:
French GEF

Knowledge exchange: Rated Modest
Comment:
There have been workshops and ESMAP publications on the IZDIHAR experience but the audience remains limited.

Client’s policy / program implementation: Rated Modest
Comment:
The Association IZDIHAR is assisted by a consultant in the implementation of the project. Own implementation capacity is limited. The French GEF assistance is continuing.

Efficiency: Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory
Comment:
Even though the time elapsed is too short to measure the results of the project, it is clear that it will not achieve all of its objectives. In this sense the assistance provided was not cost effective.

Replicability: Rated Uncertain
Comment:
The replicability of the same project design does not appear likely.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:
The involvement of stakeholders should be sought earlier and meaningfully.

Main recommendations to Bank Management:
Request for this type of assistance should be carefully screened to make sure that the operation has a significant chance of success.

PROCESSING

Manager’s comments on this GRM report:
Date:08/29/2007 User ID:WB152294 Name:Mr Reynold Duncan Operation performed:Approved by Manager
Converse to the suggested lesson on realism, the necessary support and commitment needed to achieve the objectives should have been ensured at the preparation stage.
GRM report history - Requested on 06/29/2007, due on 06/30/2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Created</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/29/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/29/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Khalid Boukantar</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>08/21/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Khalid Boukantar</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>08/21/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>08/28/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>08/29/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>08/29/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>08/29/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submitted for Approval</td>
<td>Nourredine Bouzaher</td>
<td>Submitted</td>
<td>08/29/2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approved by Manager</td>
<td>Reynold Duncan</td>
<td>Approved</td>
<td>08/29/2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DOCUMENTS

List of documents attached to this GRM

1) Final ICM MOROCCO SIDI BERNOUSSI.doc

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date From</th>
<th>Date To</th>
<th>Planned Cumulative</th>
<th>Planned Period</th>
<th>Actual Cumulative</th>
<th>Actual Period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2003</td>
<td>12/31/2003</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2004</td>
<td>06/30/2004</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2004</td>
<td>12/31/2004</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2005</td>
<td>06/30/2005</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2005</td>
<td>12/31/2005</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2006</td>
<td>06/30/2006</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>74,926.50</td>
<td>74,926.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2006</td>
<td>12/31/2006</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>149,853.00</td>
<td>74,926.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2007</td>
<td>06/30/2007</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>149,853.00</td>
<td>74,926.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>