

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF056176  
Printed On: 12/15/2011

Reporting Period: 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Draft

Assignment: TF056176

## GEF MSP-ALBANIA: BUTRINT NATIONAL PARK: BIODIVERSITY & GLOBAL HERITAGE CONSERVATION PROJECT

### GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000187561 - Drite Dade  
Approving Manager: 00000018780 - Benoit Paul Blarel

Summary Information	
TF Status	LCLS
Recipient Country	Albania
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	1885 - ECSSD
Grant Start Date / Closing Date	01/14/2008 to 03/30/2011
Program Manager	
Original Grant Amount	950,000.00
Grant Amount	275,458.60
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	275,458.60 as of 06/30/2011
Disbursed 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011	275,458.60
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

*This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements, Internal Comments.*

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF056176  
Printed On: 12/15/2011

Reporting Period: 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Draft

## OVERVIEW

### Overall Assessments and Ratings

#### Grant Objectives:

The purpose of the Grant is to assist in the financing of the Integrated Coastal Zone Management and Clean-Up Project (the Project), which has as main objective to protect Albania's coastal and marine natural resources and to promote sustainable tourism development, through building the right incentives at the local level for sustainable land management, and through strengthening the broader regulatory and enforcement framework for coastal zone management in Albania.

#### Overall progress from 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

**Rating:** Moderately Satisfactory( Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010 )

#### Comment:

The global environmental objective of the Butrint National Park Biodiversity and Global Heritage Conservation Project is to support long-term protection of ecosystems by linking biodiversity conservation and sustainable ecosystem management with world heritage conservation in the Butrint wetland complex as an integral part of the implementation of the Albania Integrated Coastal Zone Management and Clean-up Program (ICZMCP). The rating of achieving of this objective is moderately satisfactory because several grant activities could not be completed by the grant closing date.

#### Overall progress from 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

**Rating:** Moderately Unsatisfactory( Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010 )

#### Comment:

The implementation of grant activities has been slow, due to the initial delays of Project start-up and low capacities of Park management to manage the project. In addition, IDA credit suspension for more than a year slowed down the implementation of the GEF grant and other Project components. To date only the Park management plan has been prepared and designs for archeological, cultural and tourist signage and interpretations, and tourist information centers and parking lots were prepared but could not be implemented by the grant closing date. Despite the revising of project activities in December 2009, which included the dropping up of the small grant facility and financing key infrastructure investments (namely tourist information centers, bird watching towers, wetland restoration) identified in the Park Management Plan, the project unit and BNP administration did not manage to finalize these investments by the grant closing date.

### Grant follow-up and structure

#### Description and context of Grant:

**Expected follow up (if any):** Follow up Bank project/loan/credit/grant

**Comment on follow up:**

**End Date of Last Site Visit:** 09/15/2010

#### Restructuring of Grant:

In December 2009, the activities related with the setting up of the small grant facility were dropped and decision was taken to finance key park infrastructure instead - identified in the Park Management Plan, namely tourist information centers, bird watching towers, wetland restoration etc. This was related to the failure of the Park administration and ICZMCP/ PCU to hire consultants to manage the small grant facility (because of low expression of interest from experts - the selection process failed twice) and the insufficient time to finalize all grant activities within the current closing date of September 30, 2010.

### Activity Risk

**Rating:** Substantial Risk

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF056176	Reporting Period:	01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011
Printed On:	12/15/2011	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Draft

## Comment:

The main threats to Butrinti National Park (BNP) come from:

(i) uncontrolled developments and expansion of Ksamilli village which is located in the recreational zone of the BNP;

(ii) increased ecological pressure from agricultural activities, stone extraction/quarries and lack of environmental infrastructure;

(iii) lack of coordination of public investments financed by different government agencies which do not take into account the special status of a world heritage site and national park.

All these issues were identified during project preparation and the implementation support team has closely overseen the whole preparation process of the Park management plan. Given the need to mitigate the risks to the Park's integrity and potential reputational risk for the Bank, the BNP Management Plan was supported by a Social and Legal Assessment (SLA), an additional activity to complement the Social Survey carried out during project preparation. The SLA defined (i) social impacts of the proposed investments in the BNP; (ii) potential impacts of current zoning; (iii) social benefits of the implementation of the BNP management plan; (iv) the analyses of the current legal frame for the establishment and functioning of BNP and (v) stakeholders' new roles, responsibilities and incentives to promote sustainable natural resource management. Although the grant was closed on September 30, 2010 the Bank team has closely followed developments that are likely to affect the integrity of the national park through official letters and dialogue with the MOEFWA.

## Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

Summary of key issue and pending actions for management attention are listed below.

### Critical Issues:

The key actions include: (i) finalization of the Social and Legal Assessment by September 15, 2010; (ii) Finalization of procurement of all packages by August 15, 2010. Although the final draft management plan was prepared on time, agreement was reached with the Government not to officially approve it until the social and legal assessment is complete. This assessment will be an integral part of the Plan. Given the fast approaching closing date and the risk that investments in park infrastructure may not be finalized, the Government is intending to request an extension of six months to the current grant closing date. The approval of such a request will be conditional on the satisfactory completion of the management plan and preparation of an action plan for the extended period.

## OUTCOME

### Comments on outcome achieved from 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011

The GEF financed project is part of the Integrated Coastal Zone management and Clean-up Project and it uses the same Results Matrix for this Project. The specific outcome indicators for this grant are : Improved protection and sustainable use of biodiversity in 13,500 hectares of protected areas and wetlands and Increased support for protected areas regime and biodiversity conservation demonstrated by increased participation of local communities in implementation of protected areas management plan and conservation activities.

### Grant Outcome Indicators

No Outcome indicators are defined or used for this grant.

## COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

### Output and Implementation by Component

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF056176	Reporting Period:	01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011
Printed On:	12/15/2011	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Draft

## A. PROTECTED AREAS MANAGEMENT STRENGTHENING ACTIVITIES

**Implementation Rating:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)  
**Status:** Under Implementation  
**Planned Output:** Preparation of the Management Plan for Butrinti National Park  
**Actual Output:** Draft final plan prepared by the local consultants hired by the Gov't. The plan will be endorsed after the legal and social assessment is complete.

## B. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AND SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC ACTIVITIES###

**Implementation Rating:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)  
**Status:** Under Implementation  
**Planned Output:** Technical assistance provided to BNP; and provision of park infrastructure investment. Establishment of the small grant facility was dropped  
**Actual Output:** Local consultants for forestry, agriculture and legal issues have been hired.

## C. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT ACTIVITIES

**Implementation Rating:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)  
**Status:** Under Implementation  
**Planned Output:** Hiring of Grant manager was dropped; incremental operating costs  
**Actual Output:** The selection process for the grant manager has failed twice, due to the unavailability of qualified and experienced consultants to be stationed in Saranda

## Comment on planned and actual Output

## Comment on component implementation progress

## EXECUTION

### Bank project related to the grant

**Project ID / Name:** P085089 - BUTRINT GLBL BIODIV & HRTG (GEF MSP)  
**Project Status:** Lending  
**Global Focal Area:** Biodiversity  
**Product Line:** GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

### Implementing agency and contact details

**Agency:** Butrint National Park Administration -Ministry of Tourism, Culture, Youth, Sport  
**Contact:** Dr. Ylli Cerova  
**Address:** Parku Pombetar i Butrintit, Sarande  
**Phone:** 0682077521 **Email:** butrint@albaniaonline.net  
**Website:** www.butrint.org

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF056176	Reporting Period:	01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011
Printed On:	12/15/2011	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Draft

## Implementation performance ratings from 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011 with regard to:

**Project Management:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)

**Brief Comment:**

None

**Financial Management:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)

**Brief Comment:**

None

**Counterpart Funding:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)

**Brief Comment:**

None

**Procurement:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)

**Brief Comment:**

None

**Monitoring and Evaluation:** (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2010)

**Brief Comment:**

None

## Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:

The pace of GEF grant implementation has been slow. The overall Project on Integrated Coastal Zone Management and Cleanup Project has been under suspension for more than a year. The capacities of the BNP administration in project management are low and hiring of full time qualified consultants in Saranda city has been very difficult. In December 2009 the ICZMCP was restructured and GEF funded activities related with the setting up of the small grant facility were dropped and decision was taken to finance key infrastructure investments identified in the Park Management Plan, namely tourist information centers, bird watching towers, wetland restoration etc. Todate only the Park management plan has been prepared and few consultancies (on Park archeological, cultural and tourist signage and interpretations, and designs) are either under preparation or contracted. Considering that the Project Closing Date is only a few months away, it is important that the Park administration and PCU follow very closely to be able to complete utilization of the remaining funds.

## PROGRAM

### Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement -
2. Please rate government commitment -
3. Please rate safeguard performance -
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability -

### Program Specific Questions

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF056176  
Printed On: 12/15/2011

Reporting Period: 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Draft

## 1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged

### COMPLETION

#### Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated

Comment:

Bank Performance: Rated

Comment:

#### Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated

Comment:

Mobilization of other resources: Rated

Comment:

Knowledge exchange : Rated

Comment:

Client's policy / program implementation : Rated

Comment:

Efficiency : Rated

Comment:

Replicability: Rated

Comment:

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF056176  
Printed On: 12/15/2011

Reporting Period: 01/14/2008 to 06/30/2011  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Draft

## PROCESSING

### Manager's comments on this GRM report:

None

### GRM report history - Requested on 06/22/2011, due on 09/30/2011

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	Drite Dade	Draft	08/01/2011

## DOCUMENTS

None

## DISBURSEMENTS

### Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
01/01/2008	06/30/2008	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2008	12/31/2008	0.00	0.00	95,000.00	95,000.00
01/01/2009	06/30/2009	0.00	0.00	136,173.71	41,173.71
07/01/2009	12/31/2009	0.00	0.00	161,889.73	25,716.02
01/01/2010	06/30/2010	0.00	0.00	199,135.60	37,245.87
07/01/2010	12/31/2010	0.00	0.00	272,268.22	73,132.62
01/01/2011	06/30/2011	0.00	0.00	275,458.60	3,190.38

## INTERNAL COMMENTS

None