

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TF054135

GEF3 MSP - GRANT FOR THE TRANSBOUNDARY DIAGNOSTIC ANALYSIS AND STRATEGIC ACTION PLAN

GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000220025 - Ladisy Komba Chengula
Approving Manager: 00000012577 - Marjory-Anne Bromhead

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Africa
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	6571 - AFTS2-HIS
Grant Start Date / Closing Date	09/07/2004 to 04/30/2007
Program Manager	
Original Grant Amount	1,000,000.00
Grant Amount	1,000,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	958,249.86 as of 06/30/2007
Disbursed 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007	958,249.86
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:

TO PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC GROWTH BY UNDERTAKING A

Overall progress from 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Rating: Satisfactory(Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Comment:

Through stakeholders consultative process, the preparation of both the national (five) and a regional Transboundary Diagnostic Analysis (TDA), together with the Strategic Action Program (SAP) were completed, under the coordination of the Lake Victoria Basin Commission (LVBC) of the East African Community (EAC).

Overall progress from 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

Rating: Satisfactory(Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2006)

Comment:

The preparation of the five national TDAs was completed by June 2006. Further, the preparation of the regional TDA was completed in December 2006. The regional SAP was completed in March 2007, and adopted by the East African Community (EAC) Council of Ministers on Lake Victoria basin in April 2007.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

Expected follow up (if any):

Comment on follow up:

This risk is managed by using LVEMP 2 as a catalytic instrument, whereby interventions aimed mainly at addressing key transboundary issues and their associated incremental costs are funded under this project. Other interventions proposed under the TDA and SAP will be recommended for incorporation into the respective national/sectoral project and programs.

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:

Objectives have not changed.

Activity Risk

Rating: Negligible or Low Risk

Comment:

Although the regional TDA and SAP have been adopted by the Council of Ministers on Lake Victoria, prioritized investment opportunities to stimulate economic development and reduce environmental stress may not be fully incorporated in the Second Phase of the Lake Victoria Environmental Management Project (LVEMP 2).

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

There are currently no issues and actions for Management attention.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007

The main outcome would be a joint commitment by five countries to implement the adopted SAP, which aims at addressing key transboundary issues, by promoting sustainable economic growth and reducing environmental stress in the Lake Victoria basin.

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

SATISFACTORY TDA PRODUCED

Baseline There are no Lake Victoria basin TDAs in place.

Value:

Date: 06/30/2006

Progress to Five national TDAs and a regional TDA of satisfactory quality are prepared by the participating countries.

Date:

Date: 11/30/2006

Target Value: National TDAs are endorsed by respective governments and a regional TDA is adopted by the Council of Ministers on Lake Victoria.

Date: 03/30/2007

SATISFACTORY SAP APPROVED BY MINISTERS

Baseline Lake Victoria basin SAP not in place.

Value:

Date: 06/30/2006

Progress to Satisfactory SAP is prepared using participatory process and cleared by the Regional Policy Steering Committee on Lake Victoria basin.

Date:

Date: 02/28/2007

Target Value: Satisfactory SAP approved by the Council of Ministers on Lake Victoria

Date: 03/30/2007

COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

Output and Implementation by Component

TRANSBOUNDARY DIAGNOSTIC ASSESSMENT (TDA)

Implementation Satisfactory

Rating:

Status: Completed

Planned Output: The TDA, which identifies the key transboundary environmental concerns that could be addressed by LVEMP 2 is prepared.

Actual Output: The five (Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania, and Uganda) national TDAs and a regional TDA have been prepared, and adopted by the Council of Ministers on the Lake Victoria basin.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

STRATEGIC ACTION PROGRAM (SAP)

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory

Status: Completed

Planned Output: The LVBC management did not fully involve Burundi and Rwanda in discussing the regional TDA and SAP due partly to some logistical problems.

Actual Output: The SAP completed in December 2006 was adopted by the Council of Ministers in April 2007, but interventions prioritization could be improved using costs-benefit and impacts analyses.

Comment on planned and actual Output

The TDA and SAP documents have inserted a requirement for the review of the implementation progress every after two years. In a way, these two documents are live, thus mandatory regular review process would ensure focus on results and quality improvement.

Comment on component implementation progress

The consultative process involving five countries and coordinated by the regional body, the Lake Victoria Basin Commission (LVBC) is complex and required more time to accomplish. However, this task was completed, albeit with some difficulties, and outputs (TDAs and SAP) are of satisfactory quality.

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P085782 - 3A-GEF Lk Victoria Trnsbndry SIL (FY05)
Project Status: Lending
Global Focal Area: International waters
Product Line: GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: EAST AFRICAN COMMUNITY SECRETARIAT
Contact: DR. TOM OKURUT
Address: P.O. BOX 1096, ARUSHA, TANZANIA
Phone: 255-27-2504253 Email: TOMOKURUT@EACHQ.ORG
Website:

Implementation performance ratings from 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007 with regard to:

Project Management: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Not Applicable on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

The LVBC management did not fully involve Burundi and Rwanda in discussing the regional TDA and SAP due partly to some logistical problems.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF054135	Reporting Period:	09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Printed On:	11/21/2011	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

Financial Management: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Not Applicable on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

There was delays in submitting the audit report for FY06.

Counterpart Funding: Not Applicable (Previously Rated Not Applicable on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

None

Procurement: Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Not Applicable on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

Although there were some delays in employing the SAP consultant, the work was finally completed in time.

Monitoring and Evaluation: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Not Applicable on 06/30/2006)

Brief Comment:

The LVBC management monitored the TDA and SAP contracts reasonably well.

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:

The project implementation improved after the Coordinator and Operations officers gained some procurement experience after attending a procurement course on Bank Guidelines for the Selection and Employment of consultants. Some of the procurement processes were slowed down by the EAC's requirement of the LVBC to move to its headquarters from Arusha (Tanzania) to Kisumu, Kenya.

PROGRAM

Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement - Highly Unsatisfactory
2. Please rate government commitment - Satisfactory
3. Please rate safeguard performance - Not Applicable
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability - Moderately Unsatisfactory

Program Specific Questions

1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged

EAC provided conference and meeting facilities throughout the regional consultation process. Some countries provided counterpart funds to meet the local costs of TDA/SAP process. Other stakeholders met their own costs to attend both the national and regional consultation meetings. Sida supported other delegates and financed the Coordinator and Operations Officer positions after the FEF-MSP closed in December 2005.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

1. A positive lesson stems from GEF's insistence that a basin-wide approach must be adopted in order to address transboundary concerns.
2. The financing of the TDA and SAP should reap long-term benefits in terms of directing policies, and investment projects in a more productive manner.
3. Collaboration with Sida is excellent, and ways to bring in more development partners should be explored e.g., possibilities for improving donor coordination, such as the EU on fisheries management.
4. Implementation of regional projects is complicated by different national priorities and capacity development. It therefore requires a full political support to succeed.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated Likely

Comment:

Institutional sustainability is likely because the TDA and SAP processes were handled by the national and regional institutions, which have gained experience. Mechanisms for financial sustainability must be developed under the LVEMP 2.

Bank Performance: Rated Moderately Satisfactory

Comment:

The Bank task team did not have incremental budget for closely supervising the GEF-MSP. Instead, it relied on the IDA-BB available for LVEMP 2 lending operation.

Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Modest

Comment:

The GEF-MSP was used to hire a Coordinator and Operations Officer to manage the TDA and SAP processes at the regional level.

Mobilization of other resources: Rated Substantial

Comment:

The TDA and SAP documents would be used to mobilize GEF, IDA, Bilateral, Multilateral, and local resources to address the key transboundary environmental concerns already identified.

Knowledge exchange : Rated Substantial

Comment:

The GEF-MSP enabled the five participating countries to exchange knowledge through regional consultative meetings, sharing of documents, and interaction with international experts on TDA and SAP processes.

Client's policy / program implementation : Rated Modest

Comment:

Lack of experience with Bank procedures initially hampered the process, but later during the implementation the situation improved and satisfactory outputs were delivered.

Efficiency : Rated Moderately Satisfactory

Comment:

Given the geographic span of the Lake Victoria basin and the need to bring together five governments and the LVBC to make commitment on collaboration, these outputs were produced at the most cost-effective way.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Replicability: Rated Likely

Comment:

The TDA and SAP process of the Lake Victoria basin could be replicated in any other transboundary lake basin.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

The technical capacity of the recipient (the regional entity managing the grant) is still weak. therefore, it should be strengthened, as one of the objectives of the planned LVEMP2 Project. LVEMP 2 design should look at long term commitments and sustainability of the proposed interventions, including policy, legal, and institutional reform.

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

The GEF and Bank managers and staff must have realistic expectations when working with regional institutions that have low capacity.

PROCESSING

Manager's comments on this GRM report:

Date:09/11/2007 User ID:WB12577 Name:Ms Marjory-Anne Bromhead Operation performed:Approved by Manager

Seen and approved. it will be useful to disseminate the results of this TDA widely to other country teams. It's also important to be quite realistic about what can be achieved re trans-boundary investments, given institutional constraints and the need for country budget contributions.

GRM report history - Requested on 06/29/2007, due on 06/30/2008

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Mail sent to Reviewer	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	08/01/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF054135
 Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 09/07/2004 to 06/30/2007
 Report Type: Completion
 Report Status: Approved

Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Changed	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Draft	09/07/2007
Submitted for Approval	Ladisy Komba Chengula	Submitted	09/07/2007
Approved by Manager	Marjory-Anne Bromhead	Approved	09/11/2007

DOCUMENTS

None

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
07/01/2004	12/31/2004	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2005	06/30/2005	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2005	12/31/2005	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2006	06/30/2006	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2006	12/31/2006	0.00	0.00	317,118.92	317,118.92
01/01/2007	06/30/2007	0.00	0.00	485,139.74	168,020.82