Assignment: TF097091

Burkina Faso: Grant for Ouagadougou Transport Modal Shift project

GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000242676 - Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto
Approving Manager: 00000014098 - Pierre Guislain

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TF Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recipient Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executed By</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Start Date / End Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Original Grant Amount</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant Amount</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outstanding Commitments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative Disbursements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disbursed 07/01/2013 to 06/30/2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements.
OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:
The project objective is to improve the efficiency of travel by testing, on a small-scale basis, measures designed to encourage users to forego individual modes of transport in favor of collective transport on Line 3 of the SOTRACO public transport buses and contribute to preparing a clear institutional environment for urban transport.

The keys outcome indicators to be used to track project implementation of the project are:
# Existence of a well-defined institutional framework and clear strategy enabling a shift from individual to public transport
# Access to and efficiency of public transport improved through consolidation of the process of reducing traffic congestion and air pollution.
# Strengthened capacity and increased awareness in stakeholders and transport institutions to improve transport efficiency

Expected outcomes:

By creating such an environment for the sustainable development of the urban transport system in Ouagadougou, the project proposed with GEF financing will contribute to a more environmentally sustainable urban transport system. The project will bring sustained environmental benefits for the population and includes assistance in the areas of institutional assessment and strengthening, policy and strategy work, capacity building, and pilot investments for a shift in use of transport mode. The strategy and concrete options to induce a transport modal shift and reduce the traffic congestion and the greenhouse gas emissions on the pilot line scale will be based on a public awareness campaign and an increasing condition of using SOTRACO. A further benefit of the project is an improved urban environment through a reduction of gasoline consumption and related ambient air pollutants.

Overall progress from 07/01/2013 to 06/30/2014 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:
Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2013 )
Comment:
Project activities started very slowly due to a lack of capacity of the project team in implementing IDA project and even any kind of project. The hand-on support of bank team has helped improve the client capacity during the past 6 months even though some improvement are still needed to reach the desired level of performance. The overall progress has improved but is still Moderately Satisfactory

Overall progress from 07/01/2013 to 06/30/2014 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:
Rating: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2013 )
Comment:
Important improvement has been made in the project implementation with Bank team close support and advice on implementation in general, financial management and procurement lead to a completion of most of the activities. The component related to construction of terminuses has started very late but with an important pressure from every side the works have been substantially completed. The multiple changes of sites allocated for the terminuses to SOTRACO by the commune are the main reason of this delay. The final site is located at Balkuy on an extension of the bus line 3 toward the south of the city. Also the works related to the construction of bus shelters are completed as well as installation of roads signs. The institutional arrangement (project mainstreamed in the Ministry In charge of Environment) didn’t work properly and has been the really bottlenecks for the project completion on initial planned time. In fact, the personal in charge of the project implementation were not fully engaged in the project implementation as they are in charge of other tasks. All the studies planned under the projects were completed and the settlement of AOUTU is effective with the adoption of a arête by the mayor of Ouagadougou. The fully implementation of the regulatory body will be financed under an upcoming project under preparation. With the construction of the bus shelters and the increase of buses on the pilot line, clients on this route have experienced substantial waiting condition improvement.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:
An extension of the closing date has been provided and the new date is June 30, 2015

Expected follow up (if any): Follow up Bank project/loan/credit/grant

Comment on follow up:
This project is a pilot, and it is expected that the results of the project be used for scaling up and to leverage funds from IDA and other donors. A number of studies have been realized under the project and action plan activities are potentially available to feed upcoming projects. 1) first of all there is a gap of fund for the current project in its investment component. 2) Many studies ended with activities to be funded but this project has no fund for. Some studies provided with a deep knowledge on urban mobility challenges in Ouagadougou like the case of the urban transport organizational body which is created and will implemented during the infrastructure project under preparation. The study has shown a need to help this new structure with capacity building, and institutional support to be on board regarding its important mandate. Ouagadougou has a master plan in which many actions have been identified for urban mobility but not implemented due to lack of money. A strategy of urban transport is also prepared with an investment plan.

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:
An extension of the closing date has been provided and the new date is June 30, 2015

Activity Risk
Rating: Negligible or Low Risk (Original Risk Rating is Modest Risk)
Comment:
For this project, there is no room for conflict of interest for the Bank. The project is managed by the client and the Bank role of supervision is funded through a supervision budget.
The project team nevertheless is paying attention to any unforeseen activity which may put the team in a conflict of interest situation.

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention
Summary of key issue and pending actions for management attention are listed below.

Critical Issues:
The project development objectives achievement is Moderately satisfactory. Its implementation performance remains moderately satisfactory eventhough despite some delays in completing works. During the last six months, a new dynamic was seen by the new coordinator. This has allowed to move on the construction agenda substantially and completion is possible in the few days remaining for some detailed tasks. The institutional arrangement of meanstreaming the project inside the Ministry of Environment and the weak capacity of key staff have plaid negatively on the project progress. Added to that, the site determination for the terminuses were a challenge and were definitely clarified very late in the project implementation calendar slowing the construction start and completion. The sites have been changed three times. The last site identified was assessed technically and the recommendation of the Bank is to refrain from starting any work without the proof of the final acquisition of the site and related safeguards measures clarification (eventhough they are minors) were satisfied. The team has closely followed up the situation and obtained the extension of the closing date to June 30, 2015.
Implement the ESMP prepared during the project preparation
By Whom: Project coordination unit
By When: April 2013
Status: Completed
Date Resolved: 04/30/2015

Undertake the social assessment and prepare the probable resettlement action plan if needed for the terminuses construction
By Whom: Project coordination unit
By When: June 30, 2013
Status: Completed
Date Resolved: 01/30/2015

Get the acquisition paper from the Mayor for the terminuses sites
By Whom: SOTRACO
By When: Before works start
Status: Completed
Date Resolved: 12/30/2014

Launch the bids for terminuses
By Whom: Project coordination unit
By When: immediately
Status: Completed
Date Resolved: 01/30/2014

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 07/01/2013 to 06/30/2014

Grant Outcome Indicators
Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

Rate of increase in passenger ridership on SOTRACO Line 3 compared to rate of increase on other SOTRACO lines.

Baseline Value:
Rate of increase in passenger ridership on SOTRACO Line 3 compared to rate of increase on other SOTRACO lines.
Date: 09/30/2010
Progress to Date:
Progress: 51%
Date: 05/31/2015
Target Value:
Target Value: 10%
Date: 06/30/2014
COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

Output and Implementation by Component

Component A: Institutional framework and strategy (Total US$284,000 of which GEF financing US$228,000):

Implementation: Satisfactory
Rating: Completed
Planned Output: Decrees clarifying the roles of different actors signed
Actual Output: Arrete creating AOUTU adopted

Component B: Physical investments (Total US$474,000 financed by GEF):

Implementation: Moderately Satisfactory
Rating: Completed
Planned Output: 100% of physical investment planned by the project is completed
Actual Output: 100% of physical investment planned by the project is completed

Component C: Capacity-building of the relevant authorities to manage traffic and awareness campaign of transport-related environment

Implementation: Satisfactory
Rating: Completed
Planned Output: Key staff of the institutions responsible for transport policy and transport management have benefited from training on traffic and pollution management.
Actual Output: Key staff of the institutions responsible for transport policy and transport management have benefited from training on traffic and pollution management.

Component D: Management of the implementing agency, monitoring and evaluation of the proposed project (Total US$95,000 of which GEF

Implementation: Moderately Unsatisfactory
Rating: Completed
Planned Output: Monitoring and evaluation conducted
Actual Output: Project status reports written and submitted on time. Project financial reports delayed

Comment on planned and actual Output

Comment on component implementation progress
EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

- **Project ID / Name:** P087630 - BF-GEF Ouagadougou Transport Modal Shift
- **Project Status:** Lending
- **Global Focal Area:** Climate change
- **Product Line:** GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

Implementing agency and contact details

- **Agency:** Ministry in charge of Environment (MoE),
- **Contact:** General Directorate for Improving Living Environment (Direction Générale d'Améli
- **Address:** Avenue Pr. Joseph Ki-Zerbo, Ouagadougou
- **Phone:** +226 50 30 77 51  
- **Email:** barthelemy_kere@yahoo.fr;
- **Website:** www.environnement.gov.bf

Implementation performance ratings from 07/01/2013 to 06/30/2014 with regard to:

**Project Management:** Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2013)
- **Brief Comment:**
  The site for the terminus ias defined and worked are final stage. The project despite its implementation difficulties has made important achievement such as bus shelters, roads signalisation, terminus and capacity building.

**Financial Management:** Moderately Unsatisfactory (Previously Rated Unsatisfactory on 06/30/2013)
- **Brief Comment:**
  Financial management is Moderately unsatisfactory. There are many delays in providing the reports. and mistakes in the DRFs. IDA team has requested and obtained the hiring of a consultant. to support the team to finalize documents for the closing

**Counterpart Funding:** Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2013)
- **Brief Comment:**
  Counterfunds are required to support the project implementation are fully received

**Procurement:** Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2013)
- **Brief Comment:**
  Project is very slow with back and forth due weak quality of documents and limited capacity of the project management unit team. Efforts have been made and the project ended well

**Monitoring and Evaluation:** Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 06/30/2013)
- **Brief Comment:**
  PWith the new coordinator, the projects reporting has improved.

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:
PROCESSING

Manager’s comments on this GRM report:
Date:06/30/2015 User ID:WB14098 Name:Mr Pierre Guislain Operation performed:Approved by Manager approved.

GRM report history - Requested on 09/16/2014,due on 09/30/2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Created</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/23/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/23/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/23/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail sent to Reviewer</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Draft</td>
<td>06/25/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submitted for Approval</td>
<td>Aguiratou Savadogo-Tinto</td>
<td>Submitted</td>
<td>06/29/2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approved by Manager</td>
<td>Pierre Guislain</td>
<td>Approved</td>
<td>06/30/2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DOCUMENTS

List of documents attached to this GRM
1) GRM Report 20140630

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date From</th>
<th>Date To</th>
<th>Planned Cumulative</th>
<th>Planned Period</th>
<th>Actual Cumulative</th>
<th>Actual Period</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2011</td>
<td>12/31/2011</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2012</td>
<td>06/30/2012</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>199,296.60</td>
<td>199,296.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2012</td>
<td>12/31/2012</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>199,296.60</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2013</td>
<td>06/30/2013</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>261,992.66</td>
<td>62,696.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2013</td>
<td>12/31/2013</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>321,753.40</td>
<td>59,760.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2014</td>
<td>06/30/2014</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>467,291.29</td>
<td>145,537.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Reporting Period</td>
<td>Amount</td>
<td>Budget</td>
<td>Status</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2014</td>
<td>12/31/2014</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>467,291.29</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01/01/2015</td>
<td>06/30/2015</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>676,330.52</td>
<td>209,039.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07/01/2015</td>
<td>12/31/2015</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>