

**Biodiversity Conservation
and Resource Management Programme**

PNG/93/G31

**REPORT OF THE
FINAL PROJECT EVALUATION MISSION**

JANUARY 24 - FEBRUARY 7, 1998

**Graham Baines
John Duguman
Colleen Peacock-Taylor**

February, 1998

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acronyms	4
I. Executive Summary	5
II. Background to the Evaluation	7
III. Project Concept and Design	10
A. Context	11
B. Project document	11
IV. Project Implementation	12
A. Activities	12
B. Quality of monitoring and backstopping	29
V. Project Results	30
A. Relevance	30
B. Efficiency	30
C. Outputs	31
D. Immediate objectives	35
E. Development objective	38
F. Effectiveness	39
G. Capacity building	39
H. Impact	40
I. Sustainability	41
J. Contribution to PNG's obligations under the Convention on Biological Diversity	41
K. The "climate" for biodiversity conservation in PNG	42
L. Overall appraisal	43
Annex 1: List of individuals consulted by the Mission.	46
Annex 2: Summary assessment of the status of Programme activities, as at January, 1998	49
Annex 3: List of reports produced, and training conducted, since the MTR	55

Annex 4: Social background to Bismarck-Ramu: the Social Feasibility Study Report.	60
Annex 5: Community mobilisation in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI	63
Annex 6: Development support with the Sepu community of the Bismarck-Ramu AOI	66
Annex 7: Conservation education through churches in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI	68

ACRONYMS

ACIAR	-	Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research
AusAID	-	Australian International Development Assistance Bureau
CDT	-	Community Development Team
CNA	-	Conservation Needs Assessment
CRC	-	Conservation Resource Centre
CRI	-	Christensen Research Institute
CATF	-	Conservation Area Task Force
CTF	-	Conservation Trust Fund
DAL	-	Department of Agriculture and Livestock
DEC	-	Department of Environment and Conservation
GEF	-	Global Environment Facility
GoPNG	-	Government of Papua New Guinea
ICAD	-	Integrated Conservation and Development area
IUCN	-	International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (World Conservation Union)
MEF	-	Melanesian Environment Foundation
MTR	-	Mid Term Review
NEC	-	National Executive Council
NFA	-	National Forest Authority
NFCAP	-	National Forestry and Conservation Action Programme
NGO	-	Non Government Organisation
PHF	-	Pacific Heritage Foundation
PNG	-	Papua New Guinea
Prodoc	-	UNDP Project Document
SNDCPS	-	Strengthening National and Decentralised Planning Systems Project
TPR	-	Tripartite Review
WMA	-	Wildlife Management Area

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The mission's terms of reference required it to evaluate the period following project design changes arising from the TPR following the mid-term review and, also, the whole five year period since Programme inception.

Solid evidence of political commitment to biodiversity conservation remains elusive. However, this needs to be judged in relation to the fact that the power to determine land use on the 97% of PNG land which is under customary tenure is in the hands of local "landowner/resource owner" groups. The importance of political commitment is, therefore, less than in countries where the State has sovereign power over land.

The Project was designed to address the need to work at landowner level. From lessons learned in the course of Project implementation, there is now an even stronger focus on activities at this level. The Evaluation Mission confirms that lasting biodiversity conservation in PNG requires a long-term, community based effort leading to the incremental establishment of conservation areas so guided that they eventually can be amalgamated into a large area of a size which fits ICAD criteria. This "incremental" approach is different from that provided for in the project design.

Overall, the Project is judged to have partially met its Development Objective of expanding the conservation system in PNG. While not having achieved an increase in the area under conservation, certain Project outputs have contributed significantly - through ICAD methodology, biodiversity information collection, management and dissemination, capacity building, and the development of the concept for a trust fund to finance community based conservation activities - towards building the type of national conservation system needed for lasting biodiversity conservation.

Even though a continuing decline in the staffing and funding of the Department of Environment and Conservation has frustrated the important Project objective of institutional strengthening, there has been a favourable impact, in the Biodiversity Assessment Branch of the Nature Conservation Division. A Conservation Resource Centre has been established and has performed well. Since it is an important key to future efforts in biodiversity conservation in PNG it is a matter of serious concern that the Government of Papua New Guinea has yet to take the steps necessary to ensure that the Centre's work is appropriately located, staffed, and funded for the future.

Of the two ICAD "Areas of Interest" in which Project activities have been carried out, in the **Bismarck-Ramu** (Madang Province), vital early stages in the community development process have been achieved, and there is emerging evidence of moves by communities which, through a gradual incremental process, could eventually lead to an ICAD of viable size. In the **Lak** area (New Ireland Province), from which the Project was forced to withdraw in August, 1996, there appears to be a re-emergence of interest in the ICAD concept, reinforcing the view that the earlier Project intervention, though wrongly timed, should not be regarded as a failure.

A notable area of Project success is the ICAD community development methodology which it has developed and refined. This is considered to have had a positive impact not only on biodiversity

conservation in PNG but potentially on all aspects of rural development. Madang Province is keen to adopt this approach for its extension officers.

The readiness, and skill, with which the Project has documented, discussed and analysed both its failures and its successes has had a favourable impact on PNG organisations engaged in conservation and rural development, and may have encouraged greater transparency and information exchange.

A conservation trust fund feasibility study has been competently undertaken. This has met with widespread acceptance, making the prospect of a CTF real and its advent, close. No action has been taken to implement the provision of the Conservation Areas Act, 1980, for the formation of a National Conservation Council but this is not viewed by the Mission as being a significant lapse as more recent legal opinion has it that other legal options better fit the “incremental” approach to ICAD establishment.

Through the Project, good support has been given to GoPNG in executing its obligations under the Convention on Biological Diversity, in the form of an excellent Country Study, and a draft Strategy.

One of the weaknesses of the original project design is that it makes no provision for monitoring and evaluation of Project activities, either internal or external. This and other design weaknesses are identified.

Administrative backstopping by UNDP/PNG, appears to have been adequate, but this office was not in a position to provide technical support. The need for technical backstopping has been a matter of particular concern.

II. BACKGROUND TO THE EVALUATION

The Programme was commenced in April, 1993, funded from the GEF under pilot project criteria, executed by the United Nations Office for Project Services (represented in PNG by UNDP), and implemented by DEC. It was subject to an independent review in June, 1995 and a mid-term review in November, 1996.

The objective of the final evaluation was to **carry out an independent and overall evaluation of the Biodiversity Conservation and Resource Management Programme’s performance and management.**

The Final Evaluation Mission was specifically required to make its evaluation on the basis of the revised objectives, outputs and activities which emerged from the Tripartite Review Meeting of 13th December, 1996 (these are included in the minutes of the report of that meeting as an Appendix 2).

The Mission was made up of three independent consultants, Graham Baines (Environment Pacific, Brisbane, Australia; Team Leader, and Biodiversity Conservation Management Specialist), John Duguman of the University of Papua New Guinea (National Expert on Biodiversity Conservation and Management); and Colleen Peacock-Taylor (Community Development Specialist).

The Programme had been subject to an independent mid-term review in November, 1996, from which the following recommendations had emerged:

1. The outputs of immediate objective 1 be revised so as to accommodate the changed approach to ICAD establishment;
2. the overall Programme design be presented in logframe format with more clearly worded activities and with a set of success criteria suitable for the next review;
3. delays in the implementation of immediate objectives 2 and 3 be addressed through urgent action;
4. the community participatory process currently underway at the Programme's sole ICAD "site" (Bismarck-Ramu) be supported, and that the draft Framework Plan for Bismarck-Ramu be revised and presented to the GoPNG for formal acceptance;
5. in anticipation of the prospect of a major open cut nickel-cobalt mine being established outside but very close to the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD site approaches should be made to Highlands Gold and also the Environment section of the Department of Mining and Petroleum, and the Madang Province, to open up a dialogue about future social and environmental scenarios so that the involved parties might identify and take pre-emptive measures to address any threats to biodiversity conservation which might arise from the presence of a mine;
6. a "watching brief" be maintained by DEC on developments in the area at Lak where ICAD activities were carried out, 1995-96, with a view to keeping open prospects for any future interventions which might be appropriate and which could lead to a measure of community based biodiversity conservation in a diminished social and environmental context which is not uncommon in PNG and so should not be ignored;
7. customary land use rights be afforded by the Programme the respect and attention given them in custom, and care be taken to avoid actions which might undermine these rights, particularly in respect of the risks which can arise through application of the Incorporated Land Groups Act;
8. an incremental approach be considered for the establishment of a conservation regime in Bismarck-Ramu, a simple first step towards which might be documentation of land group resource management policy and rules, followed by declaration of a Wildlife Management Area and, building on this experience, a later progression to biodiversity protection according to the more demanding requirements of the Conservation Areas Act;
9. renewed efforts be made to effect closer integration of the CRC within DEC, to assist generally in the development of the capabilities of DEC staff, and to allocate more DEC staff to field roles in the Programme;
10. an improved system be developed for the distribution of information arising through the CRC and that, among other things, this provide for consultant seminars, trainee seminars, preparation of briefs for the DEC Executive Management Committee, and the rotational secondment of DEC officers to the CRC;

11. criteria and guidelines be developed for the style and, most importantly, the content of reports produced within the CRC and circulated outside it, that peer review procedures be established, and that authors be required to make verbal presentations to appropriate PNG audiences and that simply worded summaries be prepared with a view to improved comprehension and, in some cases, translation into the lingua franca, *tok pisin*;
12. the location and the role of the Conservation Resource Centre be re-examined in the light of experience to date, and mindful of the fact that as a result of the Programme's ICAD experience the CRC now embraces a wide range of experience and information on community based sustainable development which is relevant to all divisions of DEC and also to a number of other government departments and to the NGO community, and taking note of how the CRC might effectively relate to a workshop recommendation for the establishment of a national Environment and Natural Resource Centre"¹;
13. active consideration be given to finding ways through which the implementation of the Biodiversity Programme can contribute to the practical establishment of the new DEC structure, with particular reference to the proposed DEC Total Catchment Management Area teams;
14. government officers of departments with roles related to community based natural resource management (forestry, fisheries, agriculture, education, etc.) be provided with opportunities to benefit from information, ideas and training emerging from the Programme;
15. following on from earlier workshop successes, and mindful of NGO requests and the GTZ initiative in bringing NGOs together to exchange ICAD experiences, more workshop activities for the exchange of information and experience in ICAD work in PNG be conducted;
16. the GoPNG policy regarding decentralisation be accommodated in the implementation of Programme activities and that a close, interactive, relationship be developed between the Programme and relevant elements of the concerned Provincial administrations;
17. a comprehensive training plan be prepared, including criteria and guidelines for the selection of candidates and with indications of how the identified training opportunity relates to the roles of candidates; and that DEC staff from all divisions be regarded as eligible and, to the extent practicable, staff of other government departments also;
18. a fresh and more systematic approach to Programme management be developed, with clear delineation of management structure, definition of roles and responsibilities, channels of communication and measures for problem solving;
19. more serious attention be given to gender issues in Programme implementation;
20. Given the special circumstances of PNG, the GEF Secretariat to provide good technical backstopping for UNDP/PNG in monitoring this most important initiative in biodiversity

¹ Proceedings of a UNDP/DEC Environment and Natural Resources Management Workshop, Port Moresby, PNG, 1-2 July, 1996.

conservation and, also, that arrangements be made for Programme specialist staff to participate in global biodiversity information exchange.

The Mission commenced work on 24th January, 1998, meeting with Project staff over the weekend. A UNDP briefing was provided on Monday, 26th. Following further meetings with individuals associated with the Project, a teleconference was held between UNDP Port Moresby staff, the Project evaluation team, and key UNDP/GEF staff in New York, on 27th². Immediately after this, the team met with senior officials of the Department of Environment and Conservation.

From that point a wide range of consultations was held by the Mission. The Community Development Specialist travelled to Madang and undertook a close investigation of the Project activities undertaken from that base, while the remaining members of the Mission travelled to Rabaul, with the purpose of following up on MTR recommendation 6.

Interactive consultation with stakeholders was fundamental to the approach to the review, with one notable exception - as at the time of the MTR it was again impracticable to meet with communities in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD Area of Interest. The Mission accepted the reasoning advanced by the Community Development Teams, that the short term appearance of outsiders in the ICAD area at the current delicate stage in the process of “community development” could disrupt the relationship being developed with communities of the area. The limited time available for travel into this remote area was also a consideration. In any case, the Mission came to realise that a truly independent evaluation could not be undertaken by a newcomer except after a period of settling in and becoming acquainted with the community. Even then, the absence of any success indicators against which to evaluate the process would have meant only a subjective evaluation could be done, and of only one or two communities, and these not “typical” of this socially diverse area.

Nevertheless, the Community Development Specialist was able to indirectly assess community perspectives, through extended individual interviews with Papua New Guineans of the Community Development Teams. On 29th February the Community Development Specialist travelled to Madang for this purpose and for discussions with Project staff engaged in the Bismarck-Ramu activities. She was joined, on 2nd February, by the National Expert on Biodiversity Conservation and Management, whose major task there was to meet with key Madang Province staff to assess implications for the project in the light of recent and continuing changes in Provincial and local government.

Prior to this the National Expert and the Team Leader had spent 30th January to the 1st February in Rabaul, where they met with four representatives of the communities of the Lak area of New Ireland, including a woman. They had been brought to Rabaul for this purpose, and were joined in the discussions by the Officer-in-Charge of one of the Local Government centres in southern New Ireland.

A briefing was held for Project staff and consultants, and DEC officers on the emerging draft final evaluation report on the morning of 5th February, at which comments and feedback were sought and obtained. At a “round table” meeting with NGOs and donors, later that day at which DEC and

² Kevin Hill, RBAP/GEF Biodiversity/International Waters; Eduardo Fuentes, Principal Biodiversity Adviser, UNDP/GEF; and Nikhil Sekhran, UNDP/GEF.

Project staff were also present, the team reported its interim findings and obtained further feedback prior to finalisation of this written report.

On 6th February, a final debriefing with UNDP staff was conducted. A draft copy of the report was handed over to UNDP/PNG at this point. The final draft report was subsequently completed and e-mailed to UNDP/PNG.

A list of key individuals consulted in the course of the review is at Annex 1.

III. PROJECT CONCEPT AND DESIGN

A. Context

The context in which the Project concept was developed and the design prepared, has been accurately described in the Prodoc, and comprehensively documented in the PNG Country Study on Biological Diversity initiated by the CRC soon after Project implementation. In brief, it is a situation of rich tropical rainforest biodiversity, virtually all of which is under customary tenure, but being degraded primarily by unsustainable logging, despite an innovative Constitution which provides “for Papua New Guinea’s natural resources and environment to be used for the collective benefit of us all, and to be replenished for the benefit of future generations.” This constitutional provision, and associated legislation is commonly ignored.

B. Project document

The Biodiversity and Conservation Resource Management Programme’s immediate objectives can be paraphrased as:

- trial the establishment of conservation areas using an integrated conservation and development area concept (ICAD) through which conservation objectives are achieved through community participation and development.
- with respect to conservation area development, assist in the strengthening of the institutional and management capacity of the Department of Environment and Conservation (DEC); and
- establish a framework for the expansion and maintenance of the conservation areas system.

The Prodoc accurately identified the problems to be addressed, and properly linked the designed activities to the DEC Strategic Plan of 1992.³ However, a number of weaknesses is apparent in the design and in the provisions arising from it:

- an ICAD - Integrated Conservation and Development - approach was presented as being fundamental to the Project and yet this was defined narrowly as “to provide income opportunities and services in return for conservation commitments”, so presenting economic development as more of a reward for conservation action, rather than a key element of a

³ Among other things, this calls for “a series of major ICAD projects”

sustainable development process from which conservation action and commitment would emerge;

- the Prodoc states⁴ “a range of benefits will be provided to landowners on an ongoing basis, in return for development rights forgone in conservation agreements. These benefits may include, but are not limited to: health services, education and training services, employment, agricultural development programmes, business development programmes, resource management decision-making forums, boundary identification, resource monitoring and management systems” - yet, though Output 1.4 provided for the implementation of “ICAD benefit delivery methods”, apart from a \$66,000 allocation for a consultancy to investigate economic development options there was no financial provision at all for economic or social development;
- “involvement of women” was listed as a special consideration, and yet no provision was made in the project design for activities which would serve to facilitate practical application of this important issue;
- the five year span of activities designed to lead to the establishment of new conservation areas underestimated the time required for this on customary land, and there was a naïve expectation of early firm landowner commitment to conservation; and
- there was no provision for monitoring and evaluation of project activities.

III PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

Fortunately, in implementation, Project management was able to avoid some of the difficulties posed by these shortcomings in design; for instance, by identifying alternative sources of funding for a small scale timber milling project at the Lak ICAD Area of Interest, and by dramatically changing the approach to customary landowners by developing the long-term community development approach used in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD AOI. In addition, the opportunity was taken in December, 1996, to make changes to Outputs and Activities to suit the changed circumstances in which the project was then operating, and the changed approach to community participation.

A. Activities

Actions arising from the TPR of December, 1996

The Mission first assessed the extent to which the recommendations emerging from the MTR, and subsequently accepted by the TPR, had been implemented. Its findings are that:

1. The outputs of immediate objective 1 were revised as decided by the TPR and, on the assumption that this revision was subsequently used as the basis for activities over the 15 month period since the MTR, the Mission has used the revision as a basis for evaluating activities.

⁴ page 26, final para.

Changes were also made to objectives 2 and 3 at this time, through a task force set up to review the original project design.

2. This important MTR recommendation bore no fruit. A Programme logframe was not produced, and nor were success criteria identified and documented for use in final evaluation. The task was attempted, but Project staff reported difficulty in rationalising the activities being undertaken, these differing significantly from Prodoc prescriptions as a result of changes occasioned by the shift of approach between Lak and Bismarck-Ramu. The Mission understands that the task was not easy, but holds to the view that a useful logframe, with indicators and success criteria could, and should, still have been produced.

3. Objective 2 has been advanced, though there has as yet been no firm decision by DEC on the place and role of the CRC. Provision for the transfer of execution responsibility to DEC has not been adequate but much of the reason for this derives from the difficulty of planning for and implementing a transfer in the chronic uncertainty afflicting the Department.

4. The draft Framework Plan for Bismarck-Ramu was not revised.

5. Contact has been made with the mining company, since renamed as Highlands Pacific, and Project staff have participated in a stakeholders meeting conducted by the company. There has been some consultation with Madang Province.

6. There has been limited contact with developments in the Lak area, DEC staff being severely circumscribed in terms of travel funds. However, some information has been obtained through radio links.

7. The recommendation regarding risks which can arise through application of the Incorporated Land Groups Act has been noted but circumstances for implementing this recommendation have not arisen.

8. It is noteworthy that the findings of the Social Feasibility study are such that, in effect, they provide direct support for the MTR recommendation for an “incremental approach” to the establishment of a conservation regime.

9. Efforts have been made, and some success achieved, in effecting closer integration of the CRC within DEC’s Nature Conservation Division. However, there has been disappointing progress in effecting linkages with other Divisions of the Department, though it can be said that more DEC staff are accessing CRC resources. There has also been an increase in public use, from resource owners and NGOs.

10. Improvements in information distribution have been effected, additional seminars conducted, and guided training provided for DEC officers on secondment to the CRC.

11. A position of Advocacy/Communications Specialist has been created and filled and is effectively addressing this recommendation for improved editing and structure of Project reports.

12. At the initiative of the CRC, a DEC-chaired Conservation Area Task Force was established, one of its functions being to address the recommendation that the placement of the CRC be examined with a view to its being made relevant to all divisions of DEC and to other departments, and to NGOs. Disappointingly, the Mission has to report that no progress has been made on this vitally important matter.
13. The proposed new DEC structure has not been formally approved, and the chances of this were reduced by the announcement, during the Mission, that the Department of Environment and Conservation was to be reduced in status to that of Office.
14. There has been some use of CRC resources by officers of other government departments, and by some resource owners and NGOs.
15. A workshop to compare ICAD experience was organised and held in September, 1997, and a valuable set of papers arising from this exercise is almost ready for publication.
16. There has been some interaction between Project staff and Madang Province.
17. The depleted and uncertain circumstances of DEC have made it impractical to undertake the formulation of a comprehensive training plan.
18. Though there have been improvements in Programme management, there remains an uncomfortable “gap” between Madang based and Port Moresby based operations.
19. Project staff appreciate the need for more attention to gender issues in the implementation of activities, but little has been achieved in this respect. Several initiatives were taken but all lapsed. For example, a big effort was made to contract the services of a woman to share the work of the Social Feasibility Study in Bismarck-Ramu. For a time, success was anticipated, but for personal reasons the candidate had to withdraw. Even so, the Mission believes that more could have been done in other ways.
20. The absence of technical backup for the Project is still keenly felt. The MTR recommendation had mentioned the GEF Secretariat as a source of the required support. In the course of a visit to PNG for other reasons, a member of the GEF Secretariat has since had an opportunity to meet with Project staff, and to develop some appreciation of the difficulties encountered in PNG. However, it is understood that the Secretariat is not geared and staffed to assist in this regard. The Mission feels that this need should have been addressed in Project design, and technical support made available through an arrangement between appropriate PNG and overseas institutions.

Activities during the period from the MTR to the present

Note: a summary of the points raised in the text of this section is at Annex 2.

This is a descriptive evaluation of activities as defined by Project staff, following on the December, 1996 TPR recommendation that the outputs and activities be to revised to accommodate the shifts in Project orientation which had developed following the termination of activities in the Lak ICAD AOI. The Mission has found it difficult, in some cases, to conduct the evaluation according to this

revision. In some places activities do not clearly relate to outputs. In other places, activities are not in a logical sequence, overlap with other activities under separate outputs, seem out of place (e.g. 1.2.1, which seems to be redundant), or have not been included (e.g. Output 2.1: *The CRC established and managed effectively*; has no provision for an activity to undertake establishment and management).

In this section (IIIA), only activities for Immediate Objectives 1 and 2 are considered. One outcome of the recent revision has been that the three outputs of Immediate Objective 3, have “lost” their activities. The Mission has resisted the temptation to conclude that, without activities, there can be no outputs and, so, Immediate Objective 3 cannot be achieved. Instead, since there are no activities to evaluate in this section, there has been no alternative but to take up the evaluation of “actions” addressing Immediate Objective 3 later, in section IVC (PROJECT RESULTS - Outputs).

1.1.1 Identification of lessons learned from the first ICAD site

This activity has been satisfactorily completed.

1.1.2 Documentation of lessons learned from the first ICAD site

The Project’s excellent record of documentation of results has continued. A major output of the Project since the MTR has been publication of the well designed and illustrated ‘Race for the Rainforest: Evaluating Lessons from an Integrated Conservation and Development “Experiment” in New Ireland, Papua New Guinea. This text is the result of extensive consultation with numerous Lak stakeholders, as well as much ‘soul-searching’ on the part of Project staff who were involved in designing and implementing activities at Lak. This document is ‘reader friendly’ and is an important resource for field workers, technicians and planners. Its Chapter 5 - *Lessons learned from the Lak ICAD Project* is considered by the Mission to be “required reading”. Both present and past Project staff are commended for the transparency demonstrated in articulating, and widely sharing, the lessons learned through experience in the Lak ICAD AOI. A number of other good reports have also been produced since the MTR. These are listed at Annex 3.

1.1.3 Marketing of lessons learned, nationally and internationally

Following an initial mail-out, reports are subsequently distributed upon request. Several overseas conferences attended by various Project staff have provided important opportunities for marketing Project reports. So as to reduce mailing costs, and to provide wider opportunities for disseminating Project information, the Project has established a World Wide Web Site from which key Project reports of universal interest can be downloaded to interested parties. The Mission feels that this activity has been successfully conducted.

1.2.1 Selecting or rejecting a second prospective ICAD site in the Bismarck-Ramu area of interest

In line with the recommendations of the MTR and the TPR of December, 1996, work has proceeded in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI. Specification of this as an activity appears to have been unnecessary.

1.2.2 Community Entry Phase satisfactorily progressed

Since the Bismarck-Ramu Project began, thirty four communities have been visited by Project staff at least once (including the preliminary technical patrols). As anticipated, the community development process is at different stages in these communities. As outlined in the MTR Report, the participatory approach being trialled in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD requires ‘bottom-up’ planning which means that communities must be allowed to determine their own schedule and readiness to proceed with follow-on activities. Further, the community development process is ‘uneven’ and consequently, some communities require longer to complete the Community Entry, Assessment and Education stages.

A number of external factors have affected the progress of community development activity in Bismarck-Ramu during 1997. The national election held in June 1997 seriously impeded the work of the CDTs for several months. Curtailment of all field activity during this period was necessary to ensure the community development process did not become politicised, and that the safety of the workers was maintained in the volatile atmosphere which characterises electioneering in PNG. Accordingly, the last pre-election patrol took place in April 1997 and the first post-election patrol was conducted in September 1997. During the latter patrol however, the election process for local level government councils was taking place. This served to further disrupt the community development process. Consequently, one patrol to the Jimi area had to be shortened due to tribal fighting. Similarly, people in the Ramu area were distracted during this patrol due to confusion over polling arrangements and were unable to focus on the community development process. Following the national and local elections, villages in the AOI were affected by a severe drought and consequently one patrol was shortened due to food shortages. Recently an influenza epidemic has swept the area, killing many people and leaving a large number of communities to function at reduced capacity. This too has had an effect on patrols to the area. Given the number of external constraints facing the community development workers over the past year, it is to their great credit that so much has been achieved.

In discussions with the CDT members, they reiterated the importance and effectiveness of Community Entry as the basis of all further work. Overall, the Bismarck-Ramu team has developed good relationships with local people in most of the communities visited. Some communities are demonstrating self-initiative and have begun organising themselves to address their identified problems (as outlined in 1.5.2 and 1.6.3).

The Mission is impressed with the conduct of this activity.

1.2.3 Social Feasibility Study satisfactorily progressed

As a result of lessons learned through the Project’s involvement with the Lak ICAD, and in particular the conclusion that the Lak implementation team had an insufficient understanding of the local socio-economic situation, it was decided that the collection of socio-cultural data must be an integral part of the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD. Much of the needed data was obtained through what was termed a ‘Social Feasibility Study’ (SFS), so named as it was unclear whether or not communities in the AOI had an interest in biodiversity conservation. This work was carried out under a contract with the Papua New Guinea National Research Institute (NRI).

Under this contract, a Social Feasibility Coordinator was required to complete the following tasks: conduct a literature review of census information and past research in ethno-biology, subsistence systems and anthropology with regard to the AOI; meet with people living inside and outside the AOI to investigate population and demographic changes, subsistence uses, community leadership and local institutions; assess their level of self-motivation and the potential for collaboration and capacity for income generation; establish a research plan; perform base mapping exercises to establish proprietary rights; and finally, to collate all research information and prepare a comprehensive report documenting major findings and posing recommendations for future work in the area.

The Coordinator was also required to participate in the briefing and debriefing of the Community Development Teams (CDTs), to assist them with patrol documentation and to work in close collaboration with the Project's community programme throughout the SFS process. The Social Feasibility Study was completed in December 1997. Two reports were prepared by the SFS Coordinator: (1) 'The Bismarck-Ramu Social Feasibility Study: Overview and Recommendations', and (2) a monograph prepared for the National Research Institute titled 'Between Cash and Conviction: Results of the Social Feasibility Study of the Bismarck-Ramu Integrated Conservation And Development Project'. These reports comprehensively detail many socio-cultural aspects of life in the AOI and provide recommendations for future anthropological studies needed to underpin the community development process. Some further detail is at Annex 4.

The Mission was impressed with the quality of the investigation undertaken and of the reports which emerged from it. The insights gleaned through this process have been translated into practical recommendations which will provide valuable guidance for any future activities in the Bismarck-Ramu area. The international interest in ICAD philosophy and approaches also is well served by these reports as they demonstrate the interrelationships between community development activities and anthropological studies.

It is unfortunate that circumstances meant that the SFS had to be carried out exclusively by an expatriate male anthropologist. A sterling effort was made by the Project Manager and CTA to arrange for a female anthropologist to participate, but in the end this effort was to no avail. The reports need to be read with an understanding that the much needed female "perspective" is lacking. This statement is, however, not to be taken as a criticism of the researcher involved.

From the SFS Coordinator's close association with the CDT it is expected that some capacity building was effected. Nevertheless it is clear, in retrospect, that the outputs of the SFS would have been improved had the terms of reference made specific provision for a measure of capacity building for the Community Development Team, by the SFS Coordinator.

1.2.4 Developing a base to service the Bismarck-Ramu Area of Interest

There has been much discussion amongst Bismarck-Ramu team members about the relative advantages and disadvantages to establishing a Project base in the AOI. At this point in the community development process it is generally believed that a permanent presence in any of the communities visited to date may foster dependence on Project personnel and circumvent their potential for self-reliant action. Instead, it has been suggested that when target communities become more organised, and they have shown they are capable of sustained and focused activity, a

staff person located in the area may be a viable option. However, Project personnel stress this may not be necessary since they also believe that if the community development approach successfully “re-empowers” communities, they will not need the Project’s help in this way.

There has also been reluctance on the part of Project staff to pursue the establishment of a base in the AOI due to the Project’s negative experience in this regard in the village of Pimbum. During preliminary technical patrols a radio was positioned by Project staff in this village. This was interpreted as ‘cargo’ and this led to community expectations of further ‘cargo’, which provoked much controversy within the area. In 1996 two members of the Bismarck-Ramu team were held hostage for 24 hours by a group not pleased with the choice of a location for the radio. The radio was recently removed as it continually dominated discussions between CDT members and these communities. The conclusion reached was that if the existence of a radio created such jealousy among community members, a Base would only serve to exacerbate this problem.

The Mission understands the circumstances faced by project staff in reaching this decision and supports their decision.

1.3.1 Training in Participatory Management Planning

Training in Participatory Management Planning in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI is based on ‘learning by doing’. One of the guiding principles of community development practice is the fundamental requirement that all Project staff and field workers are actively engaged and committed to the participatory approach.

With regard to capacity building and management training objectives, the CDT members remain heavily involved in decision-making concerning all aspects of the Community Development approach carried out in the AOI. For example, they have guided the development of the ‘Church Liaison Strategy’ and are currently involved in vetting the new ‘Conservation Strategy’. The CDT members also have considerable input into planning the location and activities to be carried out in each patrol. In addition, the more experienced CDT members are actively involved in training the newer members of the team. Decisions regarding the composition of patrols are made by the Management Team to ensure the skills, abilities and personalities of the CDT members are matched to the needs of target communities. All of the CDT members reported feeling personally empowered through their involvement with this Project. In fact, many likened the experience of community development to their own personal development, and described significant growth in their self-confidence and maturity. The female CDT members reported feeling less intimidated and more able to assert themselves in all situations.

Given the generalist expertise required by the CDT members in promoting self-reliance, further training in appropriate technologies was an identified need. In addition, the CDTs make use of traditional knowledge held by village elders in all target communities.⁵ The Mission is of the view that further training in progressive agriculture techniques, illness prevention strategies, water supply options etc. may be a useful addition to the training programme.

⁵ They are, incidentally, encouraged to seek input from elders in their own villages. This way, some CDT members have developed knowledge in the use of ‘bush medicine’.

Overall, the Mission is pleased with the quality of training and recommends it as a model for consideration in other ICAD projects.

1.3.2 Training in Community Entry Techniques

The Mission feels that this activity is so closely related and linked to 1.3.1 that it would have been more practical to include it with 1.3.1.

As stated in the MTR Report, the community development approach being used in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD places great importance on the initial contact and quality of the early interaction with local people. Community Entry is considered critical to the overall success of the community development approach in order to reduce preconceived barriers that frequently exist between project workers and rural people, and to dissuade expectations of forthcoming 'cargo'. In addition, proper Community Entry is essential to developing relationships that are based on mutual trust and respect.

Training in Community Entry techniques continues to be provided to the CDTs as part of their Briefing and Debriefing sessions. A Handbook outlining the community development approach being used in Bismarck-Ramu has recently been prepared by the Community Development Trainer, based on the experience of the CDTs to date. This document outlines the theory of Community Entry (titled 'Why do we do the Things we Do?') and lists the tasks involved in this phase of the community development process.

The primary methodology for training the CDTs in Community Entry involves having the community workers share experiences regarding how people have entered their villages. These stories are used to analyse how various approaches were perceived, and how these approaches are either facilitative or detrimental to future work in the community. The Trainer also makes use of role-plays, playback or stop-action drama techniques and employs numerous listening exercises to reinforce the Community Entry theory. These training methods have been designed to enable the CDT members to practice new techniques and to provide opportunities for constructive feedback. All training is done in a participatory manner. Also, particular attention is devoted to ensuring that all CDT members are sensitive to gender issues that frequently deter women from taking an active part in community discussions. Specific techniques are used to ensure all stakeholders have an equitable voice in the development process.

1.3.3 Training in Development Education

The entire community development process is considered by the Bismarck-Ramu team to constitute 'development education'. While it is acknowledged that the 'education' of local people is an essential aspect of this process and that learning mechanisms from outside the community may be required at some future point, the approach taken at Bismarck-Ramu stresses the need for local communities to educate themselves. Project workers now refer to this as the 're-empowerment' of communities.

The Education Phase of the process occurs approximately 1-2 weeks after Community Entry has taken place, and generally begins with community meetings. At these meetings the CDTs make presentations on community development, rooting people in their history and culture. The objective

of these sessions is for people to think about what self-reliance means, to bolster their self-respect and to reinforce pride in being Papua New Guinean. The primary purpose of this phase of the process is for communities to begin educating themselves. The role of the CDT is to assist in extrapolating information, to encourage the community to talk among themselves and to continually reinforce messages about self-reliance.

Education and awareness is treated as an important part of the empowerment process. In conventional development practice, the educational component often consists of informing people about the project, preparing them to contribute to its implementation and then providing technical assistance. These projects are often not sustained by the community since they did not arise from the needs and goals of the community. Conversely, 'education for awareness' can propel group dynamics to the point where communities become committed to organising themselves to achieving common objectives based on their aspirations.

The Education phase of the community development cycle is continually discussed and modified during the CDT Briefings and Debriefings. The theory which guides this process is outlined in the Handbook compiled by the Project's Trainer. However, it is important to stress that this Handbook is not prescriptive and is continually being modified in response to feedback from the CDTs. Hence, a supplementary document was produced regarding the Development Education Approach titled 'Issues, Topics and Reasons'. The training methods used by the CDT Trainer in this regard are similar to those described in Output 1.3.2.

In Mission discussions with the CDT members, they emphasised the central importance of continuing training in all aspects of community development and participatory planning. In addition, they highly value the Project Trainer's knowledge, feedback, encouragement and approach. The Mission feels that this is a very pleasing result.

1.3.4 Training in Conservation Education

As described, below, under 1.5.2, the Bismarck-Ramu team has recently developed a 'Conservation Strategy' in response to communities in the AOI which have demonstrated a readiness to proceed in this area. The Project's Bismarck-Ramu Area Manager, a DEC staffer, has assumed primary responsibility for the development of this strategy and is to take the leading role in implementation. In preparation for this work, numerous training materials have been gathered, and in some cases modified to suit the needs of people residing in the area. A local artist has been engaged to design posters depicting the choices people face, and the likely outcome of these choices with respect to the use of their natural resources. These depictions are of excellent quality and it appears they have been extremely useful in the community assessment and education process to date.

A special training session is planned for the CDTs to review all aspects of the Conservation Strategy, including the range of choices facing communities who proceed with resource management planning. It is critical that the CDT members are fully apprised of the requirements and processes to be followed in achieving legal conservation status. General conservation education is provided to the CDTs on environmental issues in Papua New Guinea during their Briefing and Debriefing sessions.

Overall, the Mission feels that although it might be argued that conservation education should have begun earlier, the current activity is commendable.

1.4.1 Community self-assessment of land use

Facilitating the self-assessment of land use patterns is routinely carried out by the CDTs as part of the community development process and is conducted at the Community Assessment Phase. The CDTs make use of PRA tools to assist communities analyse how they presently use and manage their natural resources and how current practice is different from past resource ‘management’ strategies. Through the course of these activities, communities always raise concern over ‘conservation’ issues. For example, they frequently describe wildlife that was previously plentiful but is now scarce, or gardens that were previously more abundant, or water that was pure and accessible, or restricted areas that no longer exist. The process of self-assessing land use practice and community concerns that arise in this regard provides the basis for propelling people to the next stage of the community development process.

Hence, the self-assessment of land-use is a critical first step in fostering the communities understanding and their desire to consider conservation activities. Nonetheless, there are many other factors that influence whether the process of land use self-assessments will lead to the actualisation of a protected area. These factors are discussed in 1.5.2 ‘Conducting Community Mobilisation Phase’.

1.4.2 Conducting Participatory Rural Appraisal studies

This activity would best have been dealt with as an integral part of activity 1.2.2 (‘Community Entry Phase satisfactory progressed’). While PRA tools have been used extensively in the community development process, these techniques cannot be considered an end in and of themselves. Rather, Participatory Rural Appraisal tools are a means of eliciting authentic responses from villagers, and are used to encourage communities to assess inter-related aspects of the lives.

The Patrol Reports prepared by the CDTs detail the specific PRA techniques that have been used, their effectiveness in various situations, and suggest where specific tools need to be modified to better suit the local context. The MTR had expressed concern regarding the tendency of the CDTs to rely too heavily on PRA tools at the expense of relationship building and ‘storying’ with communities. The Mission is able to report that this is no longer a problem. In addition, work has been done on adapting techniques developed by other organisations that are conducting community development activities in Papua New Guinea, for example World Wildlife Foundation.

1.4.3 Surveying opportunities for income generation

As noted in the Community Development Specialist’s report (MTR Mission Report, Vol. 2), there is an active debate among community development theorists concerning how much emphasis should be given to developing the economic base of a project as a ‘springboard’ into the broader process of participation. The same debate pervades discussions of ICAD approach and methodology, with regard to whether the development of an economic base is a critical incentive and sustainable motivator for conservation conviction.

The approach taken in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD AOI is that micro-enterprise development is most likely to occur during the Mobilisation Phase of the community development process, but only provided this is an expressed goal of local people. Project staff believe strongly that before facilitating any small business development activities, there is a need to ensure that economic activities will not detract from the Project's primary goal of developing the organisational base for participation. They argue that until the community becomes organised (or mobilised), there is no basis to sustain the economic activity.

Since communities in the AOI are not yet at the Mobilisation stage of the Community Development Process there is no plan for income earning activities. The Mission recognises that participatory community development projects must remain flexible in order that interventions are responsive to specific local needs. It is noted that Project staff have held discussions with relevant organisations in the public and private sector which may be able to provide assistance to communities in micro-enterprise development when the timing is right. The Mission is also satisfied that relevant data about viable options for small business development in the AOI are being gathered, through the work of the CDTs, the Social Feasibility Study and reports emerging from an Australian Centre For International Agricultural Research (ACIAR) project on smallholder farming systems in parts of the AOI.

The Project initiative in contracting for the development of a monograph titled 'Small Business Development in Papua New Guinea: Lessons' (Brooks, 1996) is commended by the Mission. This document provides an excellent overview of successes, failures and lessons learned in small business development in the Papua New Guinean context.

1.5.1 Identifying and mobilising NGO partner

The Project has worked for some time with the Christensen Institute as the sole NGO partner, with some good results. The losses to the Project from the recent demise of this Institute, while real, have not been such that Project activities have been seriously hampered.

The identification and mobilisation of other NGO partners is expected to arise following the community assessment and analysis process. Until a community has identified and prioritised its needs, the necessity for outside expertise will not be known. The role of the CDTs is to assist in linking communities who have reached the 'Mobilisation Phase' of the process with organisations that offer assistance in specific areas.

The Project staff have established contact with numerous NGOs and other public institutions to explore the possibilities for collaboration and service provision in the AOI. These organisations include; the Business Enterprise Support Team (BEST), Save the Children Fund, the Institute of Medical Research (IMR), the European Union, the Salvation Army, District and Provincial Health and Education authorities and a local theatre group.

1.5.2 Conducting Community Mobilisation Phase

The Mission is of the view that the Project staff are well prepared for dealing with this phase, which is only now being entered, and by only a small number of communities, as yet. A fuller discussion of the Mission's views on this activity is at Annex 5.

1.5.3 Identifying and Establishing ICAD Decision Making Forums

After a community has identified its development problems (Assessment Phase), and discussed possible solutions (Analysis Phase), a prerequisite to addressing these issues is community organisation. The Project has elected to avoid suggesting the formation of committees and the Mission firmly supports this approach. Rather, the community is encouraged to discuss its existing procedures for decision making and, should these not be adequate to the task, encourage the villagers, themselves, to identify and implement the needed changes. Some information on how this process has evolved with regard to the establishment of an ICAD decision-making forum in one community, is provided under 1.6.4, below.

The Mission notes that this activity remains at a very early stage, but supports the process adopted.

1.5.4 Development of an ICAD Project Logframe process

Recommendation 2 of the December, 1996, was “the overall Programme design be presented in logframe format with more clearly worded activities and with a set of success criteria suitable for the next review.”

In April 1997 a praiseworthy initiative was taken, involving all Project management staff, (with the exception of Acting Project Manager, who was not available) from the CRC and from the Bismarck Ramu team to develop a logframe for 1997 activities in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI. This three-day gathering produced a broad-based document with activities, verifiable indicators, means of verification and risk assessment. However, there was no subsequent monitoring and evaluation using this draft logframe. Nor was the Bismarck-Ramu logframe subjected to a gender analysis despite the fact that the TPR recommendation 19 required more serious attention to gender issues in programme implementation. For the most part, the indicators listed in Bismarck-Ramu Logframe document are quantitative as opposed to qualitative, which poses problems when assessing a community development process.

Another concern is that the Bismarck-Ramu logframe produced was based on the following objectives: (1) Successful management of a Protected Area within the Bismarck-Ramu area; and (2) The establishment, under the Conservation Areas Act, of a conservation area between the Bismarck range and the Ramu River using ICAD processes. Given that recommendation 8 of the December, 1996 TPR had specified that ‘an incremental approach’ be considered for the establishment of a conservation regime in Bismarck-Ramu (as opposed to the Prodoc specification of applying the comprehensive, “top down” Conservation Areas Act, 1980), it is a concern that this recommendation was not accommodated in the logframe. However, it has been recognised elsewhere, appropriate provision having been made for it in the formulation of a conservation strategy under 1.5.5.

No action was apparent on recommendation 4 of the TPR, which urged that the Bismarck-Ramu Framework Plan be updated, and submitted to GoPNG for formal acceptance. It was also expected that, among other things, greater emphasis be placed on participation as an explicit objective of the Project’s activities. This was backed by the MTR Report which recommended the development of qualitative indicators directly linked to the participatory process underway in the AOI. In addition,

it was recommended that Project design documents be regularly reviewed to encourage flexibility, responsiveness and inclusiveness at all levels of the Project. However, Bismarck-Ramu management staff did not respond as expected.

The Mission is disappointed that the expected Project logframe was not in place for the final evaluation, and notes difficulties faced by Project staff in developing a logframe which would need to “rationalise” and accommodate outputs and activities which had evolved from shifts in implementation which were made more in response to external events than to any logical process of project planning.

1.5.5 Developing Conservation Management Systems

This activity provides for the formulation of conservation management systems at a later stage in the community development process. At the time of evaluation, one community appeared to have reached the stage at which this activity could be initiated. Meanwhile, a conservation strategy is being developed by Project staff, and this is based on an incremental approach towards the achievement of conservation status.

1.6.1 Defining areas of development support

As outlined in the Community Development Handbook titled ‘Why Do we Do the Things We Do?’ the process of identifying areas of development support (and facilitating community planning in this regard) follows Community Entry, Education and Assessment. (These stages of the community development process are outlined in 1.2.2 and 1.3.3). The Bismarck-Ramu team believes it is essential that communities identify, for themselves, the kind of ‘development support’ required, as well as the way in which this support is provided. The overall goal of the Community Planning Phase is to mobilise communities to achieve their respective goals. Hence, care must be taken to ensure that people do not become dependent on the CDTs to define the kind of support they need, or to arrange this on their behalf. Rather, the role of the CDTs is to assist communities in considering various support options and, if needed, to provide information on outside resources and services available. It is important to note here that the CDTs themselves do not provide development support programmes.

The Bismarck-Ramu Project team stressed that all communities are likely to adopt different approaches to planning, consistent with their existing planning and decision-making structures. If these mechanisms are lacking, the CDT will encourage the community to develop appropriate new. The overall role of the CDTs during the Planning Phase of the process is to assist communities in establishing their vision (i.e., What do they want to change?) and to develop realistic plans based on their prioritised concerns. During the Analysis Phase, communities are assisted in exploring possible solutions to address these issues, and are encouraged to develop self-reliant strategies whenever possible. If assistance from the ‘outside’ is genuinely required, communities are given information on available services and encouraged to initiate contact with those organisations.

The Mission notes that this activity is at an early stage.

1.6.2 Preparation of development support programme

Progress in this area is described in 1.5.1 ‘Identifying and Mobilising NGO Partner(s)’, in 1.6.1 ‘Defining Areas of Development Support’ and in 1.6.4 ‘Implementing the Development Support Programme’. It is important to reiterate that the preparation of a development support programme is done in response to the specific needs and priorities of each community as part of its specific Mobilisation strategy.

1.6.3 Reviewing options for the delivery of the development support programme

Communities in the AOI consistently identify health and education as their most immediate concerns, the delivery of a development support programme is considered a critical step in achieving subsequent conservation objectives. An example of how this has been operationalised in the AOI is outlined in Annex 6.

1.6.4 Implementing the development support programme

Since the Project is not funded to implement development support it is possible only to act as an advocate regarding development needs, bringing these to the attention of agencies who are potentially able to address this matter. Project staff have been active in doing this.

1.7.1 Implementing an education programme for church leaders and congregations

The Mission is of the view that the Coordinator deserves particular commendation for the successful execution of this activity. He has consistently produced quarterly reports which clearly outline the activities undertaken, the process followed, the constraints faced and the identification of short and long term goals. These reports are organised under various headings and outputs; indicators and timeframes are clearly noted.

Further consideration needs to be given to the gender component of the Church liaison work to ensure women are involved in the visioning, planning and implementation of all aspects of this work.

1.7.2 Implementing education programmes for schoolteachers and students

The Project has as yet paid little attention to education programmes for teachers and students in the Bismarck-Ramu area. In discussions with Community Development Team members, they consider this an ‘important missing link’ and believe that schools now need to be targeted as part of the community development process. One of the reasons for delayed progress in this area was due to the termination of the Project’s Education Coordinator/Producer. It appears that much of the work carried out by this individual was not coordinated within the larger community process, as is the case for the Church Liaison Strategy and the Conservation Strategy. Consequently, the Project does not have a clearly articulated plan for addressing the implementation of an education programme for teachers and students in the AOI.

This deficiency in Project planning seems to be the result of general confusion regarding the terms of reference for this position. For example, the staff remain unclear as to who the Education Coordinator/Producer was accountable, and whether the intended ‘outputs’ were specific to the AOI.

Nonetheless, some accomplishments in this area should be noted. Preparation work has been done in compiling a list of all schools in the AOI, their location and the level of classes offered. Several meetings have also been held with the Madang Teachers College to explore potential areas of collaboration, although this has not yet led to any specific activity. A local artist has been engaged and has produced numerous posters and other resource materials of excellent quality. Following the development of an Education Strategy, it is intended that these resources will be used extensively in working with schools in the AOI. The management team believes that CDT members should receive specific training in the use of these tools, as well as the overall approach to working with students and teachers. It is also considered essential that any further work in this area is fully integrated into the community development process, and not allowed to drift as was the case.

1.7.3 Implementing Education Programmes for District Administrative Staff

Madang provincial government authorities have attended some training sessions for the CDTs to better understand their role and the community development approach. This involvement has also facilitated discussion about ways of addressing the needs expressed by people in the AOI. In addition, meetings have taken place between Project staff and Provincial workers in Planning, Health and Education to explore areas of possible collaboration. These meetings are highlighted under other outputs. The CDT members have also begun to meet with district level workers to discuss their work and assess the level of support they may be able to provide to communities.

The Mission sees the sensitisation and education of Provincial fieldworkers as a key aspect of sustainability of Project efforts and is encouraged by the actions taken under this activity.

1.7.4 Developing Education Programme Training Materials

As noted in 1.7.2, the same constraints apply to the development of education programme training materials. While it is apparent that a considerable volume of material was produced in this area, these resources were not subject to a peer review process. Hence, many of the materials produced by the Education Coordinator were considered inappropriate for use in the AOI. Some work has been done on simplifying these materials and translating them into local language. The importance of further coordination regarding all Project activities, and ensuring there are effective mechanisms for review is apparent.

The CTA is to be commended for taking the initiative to associate the Project with the Curriculum Division, Department of Education, in the development of the first 'Environmental Studies' syllabus, currently being piloted in lower primary schools. The Education Department valued the involvement and knowledge of the Project's staff and were keen to maintain contact with the Project and access resources in the CRC when needed.

2.1.1 Recruiting CRC staff

Recruitment needs as outlined in the TPR⁶ have all been met. As planned, no new Project staff appointments have been made since the last TPR.

⁶ Appendix 3 of the TPR Report of December, 1996 outlines the CRC recruitment needs for 1997

2.1.2 Mobilising short - term consultants.

A number of short term consultants has been mobilised.

2.2.1 Making technical inputs to ICAD sites

Technical inputs made have been primarily sociological/anthropological. No provision was made for biodiversity survey work during the period since the MTR, because of the decision to adopt a lower profile, community entry approach. Technical inputs are assessed to have been adequate.

2.2.2 Providing training programmes for national ICAD personnel

Further training for Papua New Guinean Project personnel, and for DEC staff, has been conducted, and is listed in Annex 3. While, overall, a satisfactory result, the Mission nevertheless is disappointed that it has not been possible to have a fresh training needs assessment undertaken (MTR recommendation 17), and that the training has not involved PNG training institutions.

2.2.3 Facilitating NGO participation

The Mission feels that the effort of Project staff in facilitating NGO participation through exchanges of information and ideas has been good. It particularly notes the September, 1996 Motupore workshop on ICADs, organised by the Project, which the Mission regards as an important milestone in the development of suitable approaches to ICAD establishment in PNG's particular circumstances, and which facilitated a broad and lively NGO participation.

2.2.4 Networking communicating

Networking has improved through expanded mailing lists and the establishment of a Web page on the Internet. One important outcome of the Motupore workshop has been the establishment of committees to improve coordination of the various ICAD activities of NGOs. One such committee is an Economic Incentives Committee. CRC also assumed the responsibility for a materials clearing house. A commendable initiative has been taken to develop cooperative linkages with environmental organisations in Malaysia. The great majority of logging operations in PNG is Malaysian.

2.3.1 Supporting DEC's Conservation Area Task Force

Following the MTR⁷, the December, 1996 TPR adopted "the rotational secondment of DEC officers to the CRC". It was subsequently agreed that a Conservation Task Force be formed by DEC to implement this resolution. The Task Force got off to a good start, with a clear outline of its draft role, tasks and responsibilities, prepared by CRC staff. One member of DEC with responsibilities in social assessment was attached to the CRC for five weeks. This appears to have been a very successful exercise, particularly bearing in mind that the CRC at the time had only the Project

⁷ Recommendations 9 and 10 of the MTR addressed a need for more DEC staff to be given opportunities to acquire conservation development knowledge and skills through the CRC.

Manager and CTA as staff and it is to their credit that they found the time to structure and guide this attachment.

The task force is seen as the key to giving effect to the MTR recommendations regarding additional effort to impart skills and knowledge to DEC staff. At the time of the MTR there was a strong “push” by DEC for more attention by the Project to this matter. It is very unfortunate, then, that task force has not been convened by its DEC Chairman since the first meeting.

Note:

The redesigned project presents no activities for Immediate Objective 3. The evaluation of “actions” taken towards achieving this objective has been undertaken on the basis of its outputs, in IVC, below.

B. Quality of monitoring and backstopping

One of the weaknesses of the original project design is that it makes no provision for monitoring and evaluation of Project activities, either internal or external. This deficiency was identified at the MTR and yet the recommendation that a fully equipped logframe be prepared was not followed.

Methodology for the community development process, which has emerged as one of the major results of the Project, is incomplete without provision for the establishment of benchmark indicators against which changes in community perception and actions can be detected.

Administrative backstopping by UNDP/PNG, appears to have been adequate, but this office was not in a position to provide technical support. The need for technical backstopping was a matter of particular concern at the time of the MTR. As reported in IIIA, above, the Mission feels that this need should have been addressed in Project design, and technical support made available through an arrangement between appropriate PNG and overseas institutions.

IV PROJECT RESULTS

A. Relevance

There is no question that the Project’s objectives were, and remain, relevant to PNG’s needs. The initial approach to ICAD definition and establishment was short on relevance in that it was primarily technical, to the detriment of the social base for biodiversity conservation under Melanesian customary land tenure. However, the adjustments needed to make it relevant were made, with the result that the late-starting Bismarck-Ramu ICAD process is now proceeding well.

DEC institutional strengthening remains as relevant as ever; a pressing need.

The importance of a CRC is more widely recognised now among government and non-government agencies in PNG than at the outset. Its relevance, if anything, has increased, and it is being seen

now in terms of a broader role than originally envisaged - as an information source underpinning sustainable use and protection of biodiversity, accessible to the full range of government and non-government agencies in need of such information. And, so has the relevance of the concept of a conservation Trust Fund improved, this now being widely accepted, and on the verge of implementation.

Bearing in mind the recent GoPNG devolution policy and legislation it is important that the Project be relevant to the Province. The importance of Provincial linkages was stressed in the MTR Report (Matching programme implementation with decentralisation policy; pages 31-32). However, the Mission found that within the Madang Province administration there was a concern that it had not been adequately briefed on the Project, nor kept up to date with developments. That having been said, the Province feels the ICAD objective for Bismarck-Ramu is relevant. Also, the Project's community development training was given high praise and is viewed as a model for effective distribution of Provincial services in rural areas.

B. Efficiency

Project efficiency has been severely compromised by DEC uncertainties, a change of CTA and an extended gap between appointments, and a change also in postings to the critical role of DEC Project Manager.

Difficulties in maximising efficiency can be expected where a Project base is necessarily located in a national capital, far removed from its field base, and encountering frequent telecommunications difficulties. In the case of this project, management inefficiency arising from this separation has been compounded by the history of development of the Madang base. During the hiatus between CTAs the Madang team faced a particularly difficult situation, at a time when it was addressing the important issue of change of approach to community involvement in biodiversity conservation. A situation appears to have developed in which the absence of leadership was overcome through an innovative approach to management and to methodological development which involved all team members having an equal say in matters. The approach is epitomised by the term "Quaker meetings", used to describe the forum in which decisions were reached. This appeared to have been effective in carrying the team through the period of difficulty. However, efficient project management requires overall guidance and this, the Madang team now appears reluctant to accept, preferring to continue with the system which it developed to suit special circumstances.

Though a detailed investigation of the subject was not made by the Mission, the overall impression is that the use of equipment and of vehicles was efficient and that these were well maintained. The Project has at times faced, but resisted, threats to efficient vehicle use from demands of a DEC officer for private use of a project vehicle.

In an unexpected way the Project has contributed to the efficiency and productivity of DEC through supplies of paper, toner, etc., without which DEC's capacity to contribute to and benefit from the CRC would have been further reduced.

C. Outputs

This Outputs evaluation is presented in summary form - except that in the case of the outputs of Immediate Objective 3, for which there were no activities to evaluate in section IIIA, greater detail is provided:

1.1 Publicising and promoting lessons learned from the first ICAD site

The Project has done well in analysing, documenting and promoting the lessons learned.

1.2 Establishing a second ICAD site

An early stage in “establishing” the social basis for conservation at a second site, at Bismarck-Ramu, has been reached. Bearing in mind the social complexities of the situation in which community development work is being undertaken, this is considered to be a satisfactory achievement. A situation has been reached where one community has approached Madang based staff requesting guidance in the establishment of a conservation area which could well become the first step in an incremental process of additions of conservation areas which might eventually be linked and managed in such a way as to achieve ICAD status.

1.3 Training of Bismarck-Ramu CDTs

The training appears to have been of high quality, and the Community Development Team members clearly exhibit a high level of motivation and competent PRA and other relevant skills. The strong focus on PRA and on the community development process has, however, resulted in conservation education having been delayed.

1.4 Base data gathered about the ICAD sites and their peoples

The quality and quantity of data gathered is considered to be adequate, acknowledging that some of the planned biological survey work in the Bismarck-Ramu has not been done because of a decision not to proceed until a later stage in the community development process is reached. It is pleasing to note that a significant amount of useful data has emerged from community self-assessment. This is a good indicator of communities accepting “ownership” of the process.

1.5 An ICAD planning and decision making process established and operating

The NGO partner has withdrawn from operations in PNG, for reasons not connected with the Project. Some good inputs to the Project were provided by this NGO. Approaches have been made towards other potential NGO partners in respect of the provision of services in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD AOI but with no clear result. The community mobilisation process is about to be commenced, and staff appear to be well trained and otherwise prepared for this.

The failure to carry through the Bismarck-Ramu logframe preparation process to completion is a significant disappointment.

1.6 Facilitating options for community development

This output is dependent on the mobilisation stage being reached by each community in the community development process. Few communities have yet reached the required stage. The original project design had called for the development and implementation of a development support programme. However, this was unrealistic as the Project is geared and funded only to identify possibilities and to encourage other agencies to implement.

1.7 Implementing an ICAD education programme for local institutions

A competent strategy for churches has been developed, and implementation has begun. There has been little progress with respect to other target groups, except that there has been some useful training with government administrative and extension staff. Some Training materials appear not to have been peer reviewed for suitability for their intended audiences.

The Mission notes and applauds an initiative taken to link with and assist in the development of a national lower primary school curriculum in environmental studies.

2.1 The CRC established and managed effectively

Activities of this output address only the recruiting of staff and consultants. There are no activities addressing establishment and management.

On the assumption that this is an oversight, the Mission notes a more settled management “climate” as compared with the situation at the time of the MTR, with evidence of sustained efficiency and productivity

2.2 Support from the CRC for ICAD projects

Technical inputs to ICAD sites have been adequate. However, training for national ICAD personnel has been less than anticipated, and the uncertainties within DEC have contributed greatly to this. That having been said, there clearly have been substantial training gains for a small number of individuals who have worked on attachment to the CRC. There have been some gains in facilitating NGO participation, and in networking.

2.3 Integration of the CRC into DEC’s newly decentralised structure

A Conservation Area Task Force, properly tasked for its important work, was established, but has been convened only once, so its job is far from complete. The Mission has a major concern regarding the sustainability of the CRC. This requires a firm DEC decision to centralise this important unit within the Department, and to make its holdings accessible to relevant government and non-government users. Further, there is a need for official assurances that CRC will be allocated the required management staff, and backed by adequate funding.

3.1 Investigating the feasibility of establishing a PNG Conservation Trust Fund

Good recent progress has been made in Phase 1 of the establishment of the PNG CTF. Issues and comments from stakeholders including Government, Landowners and NGOs were solicited and reported in March 1997 and the concept has been well received. Following this were two milestone events: a Consultation and Planning Forum (27 - 28 May 1997), and a Framework for a PNG CTF meeting (11 November 1997)

Following this, a full feasibility study was conducted, which focused on three main themes - the significance of customary land ownership; environment awareness and education; and local empowerment.

The next step envisaged is the preparation of an information paper to go to the NEC of the GoPNG for Cabinet level endorsement.

This concept was also widely presented to a wide audience outside PNG including TNC offices world-wide, and SPREP. The capitalisation needs of the PNG CTF have been incorporated in a World Bank Forestry Sector project proposal.

Below is a chronology with time frames for activities required to establish the CTF⁸.

Activities	Time Frame
Creation of a Trust Fund Steering Committee	January 1998
Commence Capital Fund Raising	January 1998 - ongoing
Legal research/ preparation of draft by laws	January - March 1998
Registry of Trust Funds as legal entity (or adoption of enabling legislation)	March - July 1998
Election of Board and Trustees	September 1998
Organisational meeting, adoption of operating strategies and organisational structure	October 1998
Contracting staff and Asset managers (s)	November - January 1999
Preparation and adoption of first annual work plan, investment strategy	March - July 1999

The Mission is pleased to note the good progress made on this output, with an excellent result. This output is notable for its very wide stakeholder participation. Though yet to meet the Prodoc

⁸ This is contained in a Memorandum to the Conservation Trust Fund Working Group, RE: Revised Framework for the PNG Conservation Trust Fund, 1 December 1997. By B. Ginn and Wep Kanawi (from meeting of 11 November 1997)

expectation that it be established by the completion of the Project, this output, widely supported by government agencies and NGOs, now has sufficient momentum to carry forward to completion.

3.2 Promoting the establishment by DEC of a National Conservation Council

In the light of fresh legal opinion on the Conservation Areas Act, this output has been seen to have less significance than was envisaged in the original Prodoc. The Mission is not unduly concerned about lack of progress towards this output, particularly as what it views as more practical approaches are now being mooted (e.g. strengthening of the legislative provisions for WMAs to convert them to simply constituted conservation areas). The CRC has prepared and circulated a discussion paper on this.

3.3 Development of the government's executing capacity for national execution

DEC had submitted a new structure to the Department of Personnel Management for approval, at that Department's request. However no decision was made. A NEC (Cabinet) decision of 27/1/98 subsequently included a downgrading of DEC's departmental status to that of office. At the time of the Mission efforts were being made by various stakeholders to have this decision reversed (and not least from the Minister of Environment, who was absent at the time the decision was taken!)

The Prodoc outlined seven positions as counterparts to be funded by DEC. At the time of this evaluation only three positions were being funded. The budget allocation for DEC's execution of the project has diminished from year to year. The Mission was told that this was the result of Divisional work plans being ignored and budget allocations being diverted to ad hoc trips and expenses which had not been budgeted for. Unfortunately, such problems appear not to be uncommon within DEC.

Public Investment Programmes (PIP)s within GoPNG make provision for counterpart funding from donors. PIPs within DEC include the Biodiversity Conservation and Resources Management Programme, through which CRC operates, a European Union funded Mine Monitoring Project, and an AusAID supported Institutional Strengthening Programme. In the 1997 Budget allocations, the Biodiversity Conservation and Management Programme was the only one of these three in DEC which did not receive any allocation.

This output is far from satisfactory completion and requires urgent, immediate attention. The parlous nature of DEC seriously compromises the potential for DEC execution, but it must be pointed out that an expectation arising from recent administrative reforms is that Provincial governments must have a stronger role. It is clear to the Mission that the target for national execution should be Madang Province, with policy and technical support by DEC and the Department of Planning and Implementation.

D. Immediate objectives

1. To establish pilot ICADs to develop innovative methodologies for conservation of biodiversity.

Two prospective ICAD sites of high biodiversity value were identified and Programme activities carried out in both. Conservation objectives were deemed unachievable in the first of these sites (Lak) and activities there were terminated in August, 1996. However, a useful body of information on the area's terrestrial and marine biodiversity was obtained. The latter, only, has been published. Customary land owning groups were identified and a process of land group incorporation was commenced with a view to formal incorporation of these groups as a basis for ICAD planning and management. This action is particularly significant in that it facilitates the identification of the customary groups, publicises this, and provides legal backing for customary claims which otherwise remain open to manipulation.⁹

Valuable lessons on approach and methodology have been learned from Lak. These have been documented in the excellent publication, *Race for the Rainforest*, of which Chapter 5 is vital reading for all involved in project design and implementation in rural PNG. These lessons were subsequently applied in a newly developed approach to the second ICAD site (Bismarck-Ramu). This approach has a strong sociocultural orientation and a more realistic, longer term perspective. The Programme's experience in approaches and methods for community based biodiversity conservation has been keenly watched by other agencies engaged in this type of activity in PNG. They, too, have learned from the Programme experience, which has been well documented and disseminated.

The necessarily long time needed for ICAD definition and establishment through this socially sensitive and responsive process means that, while important steps towards biodiversity conservation have been achieved in Bismarck-Ramu over a two year period, the objective of a formal ICAD management regime cannot be met for some time.

From its quick "arm's length" assessment of current circumstances at Lak¹⁰, where logging has been suspended as a consequence of low export log prices, the Mission has the impression of a re-awakening of Lak community interest in the ICAD concept. Though the Lak communities have yet to act to adopt a sustainable biodiversity use regime (made difficult because their customary rights have been transferred to another entity, the Metlak Development Corporation, and a logging licence is still in force, even though not now actively used), there are indications of a wish to address this. A newly elected (November, 1997) local level government, with greater powers than that which preceded it, because of the new decentralised arrangements (Konoagil LLG), appears intent on discouraging heavy machinery logging and round log exports. Even though logging has degraded local lowland rainforest, a considerable level of biodiversity is believed to remain in this area.

To reflect the course taken by the Project, it would be appropriate to rephrase Immediate Objective 1 as **To develop innovative methodologies for conservation of biodiversity and establish pilot ICADs**¹¹. On the basis of this rephrasing, then, the Mission would conclude that:

⁹ It should be noted that this legislation does have some risks, in that customary resource users who are not also part of the group of owners may risk dispossession. This point has been explained in the MTR Report at page 28, Vol. 1.

¹⁰ Two Mission members met, in Rabaul, with four representatives of the Lak ICAD AOI, including a principal landowner, the Lak Project Conservation Area Manager and his wife, the President of the Konoagil Local Level Government, and the Officer-in-Charge of one of the Government stations in the LLG area.

¹¹ The Prodoc wording is: **To establish pilot ICADs to develop innovative methodologies for conservation of biodiversity.**

- in **Bismarck-Ramu**, vital early stages in the community development process have been achieved, using a methodology developed for the purpose and which is considered to be very successful and relevant for other areas of PNG; and there is emerging evidence of moves by communities which, through a gradual incremental process, could eventually lead to an ICAD of viable size; while,
- in the **Lak** area there appears to be a re-emergence of interest in the ICAD concept, reinforcing an expectation implicit in MTR Recommendation 6, which called for a “watching brief” to be maintained, and demonstrating that the earlier Project intervention, though wrongly timed, should not be regarded as a failure.

2. To provide institutional strengthening to the Department of Environment and Conservation for conservation of biodiversity.

A Conservation Resource Centre has been established and has produced a great deal of data and other information. However, much of this has been phrased for a readership of academics and other professionals. It is only during the past 15 months that serious attention has been paid to the need to re-present reports in forms suitable for others in PNG who need the information. Networking, particularly among NGOs, and including a range of Government departments, has not developed as far as anticipated.

For a long time DEC staff did not perceive the CRC as being an integral part of their organisation and at that time it cannot be said to have been contributing as much to DEC institutional strengthening as was expected from the Programme design. The situation has improved considerably during the final stages of the Project, close attention having been paid by the CTA and DEC Project Manager to this important issue. DEC’s capacity to benefit from training through the CRC, and to take real control of the CRC, continues to be compromised by the lack of direction, declining budget, staff reductions, and the ensuing low morale which has prevailed in the Department for some time.

Until such time as DEC makes the decision needed to place the CRC on a sufficiently strong footing to be able to perform its important role, there remains a question as to how effective has been the Project effort in CRC establishment towards achieving Objective 2.

3. To establish an institutional, legal, financial, and policy framework for the expansion and future maintenance of the conservation system.

Reporting from activities to effect the establishment of a conservation trust fund from which to fund biodiversity conservation was very late. However, the results have been good and this key output has reached an advanced stage, making the prospect of a CTF real, and its advent, close. No action has been taken to implement the provision of the Conservation Areas Act, 1980, for the formation of a National Conservation Council but this is not viewed by the Mission as being as significant a lapse as the project designers would have envisaged. There is, as yet, no clear strategy and

timetable for developing the PNG Government's executing capacity and transferring execution functions to national control. The Mission understands the difficulties faced by Project staff, both DEC and contracted, in getting clear guidance from DEC senior management on this important matter.

E. Development objective

To expand the conservation system of Papua New Guinea to provide for biodiversity conservation.

This goal is reflected in the DEC Strategic Plan which was operational at the time the Project was designed. While, with no ICAD established, the Project cannot claim to have achieved this goal in terms of an expansion of area, the Mission believes that it can be said that the Project has been successful in advancing prospects for ICAD establishment through:

- developing and introducing better methods for community “entry” leading to, and through, a community development process from which biodiversity conservation commitment and practice emerges;
- achieving a compilation of social, cultural, and biodiversity data about two areas of very high biodiversity significance and where there are prospects for the eventual establishment of ICAD regimes;
- the development of a concept and mechanism for a conservation trust fund designed to provide financial resources for implementation of biodiversity at the level which is critical in PNG - landowner and community groups - and the achievement of widespread government, NGO and donor support for this; and
- establishing a Conservation Resource Centre which, provided arrangements are promptly made by the GoPNG for its proper administrative placement and for its continued operation, will play a crucial role as a central information node linked with relevant government and non-government agencies.

Against these real achievements, and while not wishing to detract from them, it has to be observed that during the tenure of the Project the national basis for the conservation system has continued to degrade through the weakening of DEC, and through the systemic disrespect for the national Constitution and for laws and procedures established to bring order, and perhaps even sustainability, to the exploitation of forest resources.

Had the significance of the new administrative order been fully appreciated - with Provinces given new and strengthened responsibilities for development, conservation and environmental management - then the consequences of the DEC decline could have been (and still can be) eased. This requires promotional work with the Provinces to help them to understand how to assume their responsibilities in these areas, to administratively restructure, to establish appropriate positions, and to do this in such a way that conservation and environmental management roles are appropriately associated with development planning.

F Effectiveness

A major constraint on the effectiveness of the project has been the continuing uncertainty and low morale in the Department of Environment and Conservation. While the Department will admit to deficiencies within itself, the ultimate cause of this problem is the failure of successive national governments to give the recognition and support which this key institution needs. In recent times the Department's very survival has been under threat, and it has been starved of travel funds and, even, of funds for basic materials needed to sustain activities in offices. It can be said that, through the project support provided through the CRC an unplanned contribution to the effectiveness of the Nature Conservation Division has been made simply through the provision of paper, toner, and other such basic items.

The momentum and effectiveness of project work was at risk over a nine month gap between CTAs. This problem was compounded by a change in DEC Project Manager. In the event the Project was sustained through the efforts of two project staff who, with the DEC Project Manager, did a commendable job in keeping the Project afloat, while at the same time carrying other responsibilities for which they had been contracted. It was, however, inevitable that effectiveness was reduced during this period and that this lapse has made it difficult for the current CTA and DEC Project Manager to re-establish an effective management regime. One of the discernible costs of this period was the apparent drift of CRC away from DEC. This was a strong perception of DEC at the time of the MTR, since eased.

The effectiveness of the Project at the community level has been compromised by the unrealistic Prodoc estimates of the time needed for the establishment of a genuine community based commitment to biodiversity conservation, and, since no Prodoc provision was made for funding them, by the apparent expectation that development services would materialise from other sources.

G. Capacity building

Though some individual DEC staff have responded well to capacity building exercises, circumstances in DEC have not been good for capacity building and there has been no discernible overall improvement,. The situation has been explained in earlier sections of this report. Other donor funded projects seeking to assist DEC in this way have also fallen far short of planned targets in this respect, and notably the AusAID funded Institutional Strengthening Project. At another level, that of ICAD AOI community, there certainly has been some successful capacity building, as one of the outcomes of the carefully prepared community development process implemented by the Project's Community Development Teams in the Bismarck-Ramu.

The Project was not designed to provide capacity building for local NGOs, which perhaps should have been part of the brief. Even so, it can be argued that the capacity of NGOs to participate in ICAD work has been helped by association with the Project, participation in workshops organised by the CRC, and also through the free exchanges of information and understanding which has characterised the Project's *modus operandi*.

H. Impact

While the Project has not had the expected beneficial impact on DEC capacity, a number of positive impacts has resulted. The information base for biodiversity conservation has been improved and this has leveraged joint activities (with UNEP, among others) to improve national data management. PNG NGOs involved in biodiversity conservation work have benefited from information exchanges and Project workshop participation. It is probably not unreasonable to suggest that the NGO community has also been favourably impacted by the “transparency” demonstrated in the ready sharing of less successful results from the Project, notably the lessons learned from the Lak experience.

The CRC has been successful not only as a source of information but also as a source of ideas. Deserving of special mention is the initiative in taking up the concept of “carbon offsets”, developing this in a PNG context, and promoting it both nationally and internationally, so opening up an innovative opportunity for the country. This has also broadened horizons, and served to facilitate consideration of PNG’s role in the implementation of the Climate Change Convention. The success in bringing the concept of a conservation trust fund to an advanced stage of development, and to widespread acceptance, is considered to have the potential to have a major favourable impact on biodiversity use and protection.

It is noteworthy that, though there is not yet an ICAD in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI, it is through Project efforts that this area, despite the commercial potential of its lower forests, remains excluded from the list of areas identified in the National Forest Plan for Papua New Guinea (1996) as open for licensing for timber extraction.

Though the point has been elaborated on elsewhere in this report, it needs to be stated again, here, that the ICAD community development methodology has had a positive impact not only on biodiversity conservation but potentially on all aspects of rural development. One example of a secondary impact is the CDT member who returned to his home village after training and found that his newly acquired knowledge and skills were welcomed as a contribution to a community meeting from which a decision emerged on a logging proposal. The proposal was rejected.

One important area where the Mission would have hoped to be able to report a substantial beneficial impact is at the level of Provincial government. Relations between Project and Province have certainly not been bad, but they have not been of sufficient depth for any favourable impact to be discernible in terms of, for instance, the recognition by Madang Province of the special characteristics of Bismarck-Ramu and the linkage of Project effort there, with the Province’s development planning.

I. Sustainability

The conservation trust fund concept has reached a point from which, with the momentum it has gained, it is considered to be sustainable. The ICAD methodology, provided it is skilfully documented for application by others, before the Project closes, can also be described as sustainable.

A clear resolve by DEC senior management is needed to properly locate and support the CRC before it can be regarded as a sustainable output. In other respects there are difficult questions about the sustainability of DEC itself. To a degree, the continuing threat of further DEC reduction

could be alleviated by a determined effort by the Department to transfer appropriate functions and staff to Provincial level, as is intended under national policy on devolution. This is a move which all national Departments find difficult. However, the future of ICAD prospects in areas such as Bismarck-Ramu clearly rests heavily on close integration of biodiversity objectives with the planning philosophy and direction of Madang Province. More to the point, the Mission is of the view that Bismarck-Ramu activities cannot be sustainable unless Madang Province has a direct role, with DEC providing policy and technical support.

J. Contribution to PNG's obligations under the Convention on Biological Diversity

The project has made a number of contributions towards PNG fulfilling its obligations under the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD). The PNG Country Study, one of the better compilations of information among the many produced by parties to the Convention, was prepared and published through the CRC. Subsequently, CRC assisted DEC in the next step, formulation of a national biodiversity strategy. Unfortunately, the late 1994 version submitted to DEC has yet to be actively considered, and formalised, by the Department.

A consideration of Project outcomes in relation to specific clauses of the Convention shows that it has contributed to PNG's obligations to:

- Develop national strategies, plans and programmes for the conservation and sustainable use of biological diversity (Clause 6);
- Establish a system of protected areas (8); and to
- Promote understanding of the requirements for effective biodiversity conservation (13);

It has also produced results which assist PNG to:

- Identify, and monitor changes in, ecosystems of special interest in terms of the conservation of biological diversity (7).

K. The "climate" for biodiversity conservation in PNG

Because of the record of policy and procedural abuse which characterises GoPNG practice in the forestry sector, those who monitor efforts to protect representative samples of forest biodiversity continually seek indicators of political will for conservation. The current situation at a national level offers few positive signs.

The point was made in the MTR Report, and bears repeating, that in PNG (and other Melanesian countries) it is a mistake to too closely relate national political "will" to the potential for biodiversity conservation. One major factor which distinguishes PNG from, for instance, countries of Africa and Asia, is the high percentage of land (and associated coastal sea) which is politically controlled not by the State but by customary resource owners. This is no less than 97% of PNG's land.

While the State can, should, and does set guidelines for the development of the nation's land and sea resources, and establishes structures and procedures to facilitate such development, it is the resource owners themselves who decide on development and conservation. Operating in a modern world, they are poorly equipped with knowledge and skills to carry this responsibility. Poor political will at national and provincial levels certainly frustrates conservation efforts, and much more could be achieved through improved government. However the fact remains that, since power to determine the fate of biodiversity rests largely at the resource owner community level, it is at this level that the will for conservation needs continual assessment and support. Such assessment is very difficult. Innovative efforts to undertake such assessments are at the core of the ICAD approach being applied in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD AOI.

When faced with a need to decide on a proposal for a large scale use of forests, for agriculture or timber extraction, landowners are pressured to make irrevocable decisions on the basis of;

- very limited information about options, benefits and costs;
- an ignorance of laws and government procedures;
- in circumstances where there is a depressing lack of basic medical and educational services;
- and in the context of very attractive inducements of cash and goods proffered by those who seek to gain control of a resource owning group's timber rights.

Often superimposed on this troubling scenario of inadequacy and inequity is "the Judas factor", introduced by individuals who have a direct or indirect customary claim to the use of group resources and who, being better informed about laws and procedures, use this knowledge to exploit their kinsmen's ignorance and helplessness and so divert the rewards from a transfer of resource rights to themselves, effectively dispossessing their own people. This situation is not overstated; it is real, and it is commonplace.

The approach in use in Bismarck-Ramu recognises this reality and attempts to facilitate a "climate" in which a community is enabled to identify and address its weaknesses - with assistance and information provided as called for by the community itself.

Chapter 5 of "Race for the Rainforest" eloquently summarises the complex situation at community level and offers a clear and readable outline of the complex issues to be addressed in working with PNG landowner communities. It is highly recommended that this Chapter be closely studied by those who seek to properly understand the socio-political context in which the Project has had to operate.

L. Overall appraisal

An overall appraisal is presented with reference to a paraphrased, abbreviated version of the "Expected end of project situation" (Prodoc page 17):

A Conservation Resource Centre will have been established, ... to provide skills development support for the establishment of ICAD areas and to enhance DEC's capacities in conservation policy development and planning. Associated with the CRC, a strong

network of partner relationships ... national and provincial government agencies, NGOs and elsewhere, to help in the process of extending the conservation system.

A CRC has been established, with a good record in reporting and publishing; a reasonable record in DEC staff training bearing in mind the difficulty in establishing a sound training plan because of instability in the Department; and an excellent record of training for community development workers through the Project's Madang base. However, limited effort by DEC senior management to respond to properly targeted and well presented CRC initiatives has meant that the Department's capacities in conservation policy development and planning have not significantly improved. There have been some achievements in networking, though to a lesser extent than was envisaged at project design. Little has been achieved in developing partner relationships with national government agencies other than DEC, and the record of liaison with Provincial governments is inadequate.

At least two new conservation areas established under the Conservation Areas Act ... demonstrating integration of conservation with development to meet the needs of landowners. ... methodologies will have been developed and tested and the capacity built to initiate and implement further ICAD projects.

No conservation areas have been established. The reasons for this are explored, discussed and explained in detail elsewhere in this report, in the MTR Report on this Project and, most thoroughly, in "Race for the Rainforest". In summary, the Mission is of the opinion that good progress is being made in establishing a satisfactory social base for sustainable biodiversity conservation in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI. It bears repeating what was stated in the MTR Report, that the area is very remote, its communities have relatively little contact with the modern world, there are no roads, and that few communities of the area have even basic educational, health services. These communities are small and scattered and, despite their complex social connections and interactions they are always fragmented and are sometimes rivals in dispute over land.

There is a long way to go, but it has been reported that the first of the communities participating in the Project's community development process has reached the point at which it has opted for a conservation regime for at least part of the forest over which it has customary tenure. If this intention is converted into a conservation area then this could be the first decisive step in an incremental process towards the eventual amalgamation of adjacent community based conservation areas. Eventually, and provided that adequate basic services are provided to the area and that communities are assisted towards establishing appropriate forms of economic development, these separate community areas may merge to form an ICAD of sufficient size to meet the original target level for biodiversity conservation.

While the experience in the Lak ICAD AOI, where Project objectives of community based sustainable use of forest resources conflicted with a well funded and politically backed timber "mining" operation, was very difficult for all concerned, it must not be seen as a failure. The situation encountered was of a type which is common in PNG. The timing of Project interventions was wrong, yet a considered reflection on the history of Project involvement leads to the conclusion that intervention at that time, under slightly different circumstances, may still have been successful. The Mission's quick appraisal of the current situation at Lak leads it to conclude that an ICAD of high biodiversity value may still be possible in southern New Ireland.

Capacity within CRC to provide input into conservation policy and management planning, etc. .. A trained person capable of managing the CRC will be in place and staff with appropriate skills will have been recruited and given experience and training.

The uncertainties regarding the placement of the CRC within DEC, and the chronic problem of DEC staff attrition and funding shortfalls has made it impossible to establish the level of capacity intended, and there is no guarantee that the staff who have been appropriately skilled will staff the CRC.

Within the CRC network, a capacity to carry out participatory rural appraisal and to plan and implement socio-economic development projects ... Systems for resource inventories and monitoring and procedures for delivering a range of social services and development support programmes will be in place.

A good capacity to carry out PRA at Project level has been developed. It is possible that some of those trained will be employed by NGOs, or possibly the Madang Province, and this would constitute an achievement in extending capacity within “the CRC network”. However, this “network” is not as well developed as was envisaged at project design. The Project has greatly boosted the capacity of staff of the Biodiversity Assessment Branch of DEC’s Nature Conservation Division in computer based biodiversity data management, including mapping.

Within each ICAD, landowner-DEC co-management; management plans and conservation agreements.

As there are no ICADs, there is no co-management and no management plans or conservation agreements. One community in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD AOI is reported to have reached a point in the community development process from which it might be expected a biodiversity management strategy and, later, plans, could be expected to emerge.

A National Conservation Council in place and operational; an operational Biodiversity Trust Fund.

The Council has not been established and, though its establishment is a worthwhile objective, the Mission does not see its absence as having as much significance for the establishment of ICADs as was envisaged at project design. More practical legislative avenues are being investigated. The concept and mechanism for the establishment of a conservation trust fund has been developed to an advanced stage.

Annex 1**List of individuals consulted by the Mission**

Kembi Watoka	Deputy Director	DEC
Mick Raga	acting Assistant Director, Nature Conservation Division	DEC
John Genolagani	acting Assistant Director, Biodiversity Management	DEC
Sam Antiko	acting Director, Field Services	DEC
Lester Seri	acting Assistant Director, Species Management	DEC
John Chitoba	Bismarck-Ramu ICAD Site Manager	DEC
Felix Kinbag	acting Biodiversity Project Manager	DEC
Wep Kanawi	Consultant	The Nature Conservancy, Port Moresby office
Peter Witham	Resident Representative	UNDP
Finn Reske-Nielsen	Deputy Resident Representative	UNDP
Jaru Bisa	Sustainable Development Adviser	UNDP
Jorgen Skytte Jensen	Professional Officer	UNDP
Nikhil Sekhran		GEF Secretariat, New York
William Asigau	former UNDP National Programme Officer, and GEF Small Grants Coordinator	Conservation Melanesia
Jeremaiah Andrew	Assistant Secretary, Multilateral Aid, Foreign Aid Division	Dept of Planning and Implementation
Michael Dalton	Programme Advisor	SNDPs, Dept of Planning and Implementation
Mike Parsons	CTA, Biodiversity Programme	CRC/UNDP
Mike Hedemark	Conservation biologist	CRC/UNDP
Lisle Irwin	Bismarck-Ramu ICAD site adviser	CRC/UNDP
Leo Yat Paol	Church and school liaison	Christensen Research Institute
Barry Lalley	ICAD Community development trainer	

Colin Filer	Consultant, ICAD social feasibility	PNG National Research Institute
Flip van Helden	Consultant, ICAD social feasibility	PNG National Research Institute
Anita van Breda		Conservation Melanesia
Elvit Remas		Lak community
Francesca Remas		Lak community
Philip Toanusi	Principal landowner	Lak community
Morris Uku	President	Konoagil Local Government Council, Southern New Ireland
Allan Kayape	Officer-in-Charge	Lamasa Government Station, Southern New Ireland
Kimang Okira	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Casper Poin	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Grace Kua	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Cherubim Lou	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Clara Mime	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Anita Bagora	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Alphonse Mopar	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Wina Kayonga	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Peter Moikia	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Victoria Kaynang	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Pangasa Boehner	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Wina Kayonga	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Paul Skoro	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Xavier Winata	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Thomas Warr	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
Gloria Leo	Community development team member	Project Office, Madang
John Bulage	Community development	Project Office, Madang

Phil Barker	team member	
Lance Hill	Adviser	Office of the Prime Minister
	Deputy vice Chancellor,	University of Papua New
	and Head of Biology	Guinea
Ricky Kasek Kumung	Provincial Planner	Madang Province
John Bossi	Former Education Officer	Madang Province
Vei Makam	District Administrator	Middle Ramu District
Otto Avarosi	Information Adviser	Madang Province
Angus Barnes	Second Secretary,	AusAID
	Development Assistance	
Xuan Hoang		AusAID
Russell Jackson	A/Curriculum Officer	Dept of Education
Bernadette Aihi	P/Curriculum Officer	Dept of Education
Korapa Lassa	A/Curriculum Officer	Dept of Education
Sipou	P/Curriculum Officer	Dept of Education
Peter Hunnam	Director	World Wide Fund for
		Nature (South Pacific
		Programme)
Paul Chatterton	Consultant to World Wide	
	Fund for Nature (South	
	Pacific Programme)	
Kelly Kalit		World Wide Fund for
		Nature (South Pacific
		Programme), Port Moresby
		office
Diane Goodwillie		World Wide Fund for
		Nature (South Pacific
		Programme)
Samuel Kimbu		Wau Ecology Institute
Timothy King		Pacific Heritage
		Foundation, Rabaul

Annex 2**Summary assessment of the status of Programme activities as at January, 1998**

Code	Short form description	Status	Comment
Immediate Objective 1: Establish ICADs, develop methodologies			
1.1	Lessons learned		
1.1.1	<i>Identification of lessons</i>	Done.	Project staff have been particularly attentive to the identification and application of lessons learned.
1.1.2	<i>Documentation</i>	The excellent record of documentation of project results reported at MTR has continued.	Some action has been taken to reproduce materials in forms suitable for local rural audiences.
1.1.3	<i>Marketing</i>	Project documents have been actively "marketed" so as to facilitate widespread application of ICAD methodology.	The establishment of an Internet "Web" page from which documents can be directly accessed is a wise move.
1.2	Second ICAD site		
1.2.1	<i>Bismarck-Ramu area of interest</i>	As recommended by the MTR, efforts continue in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI.	
1.2.2	<i>Community entry</i>	A total of 34 communities has been engaged in the community development process.	While reasonable progress has been achieved, it could have been greater had there not been interruptions from national and local elections, a period of severe drought, and a serious influenza outbreak which resulted in several patrols being postponed.
1.2.3	<i>Social feasibility study</i>	Study completed and fully documented.	An excellent report, from which emerge good practical

			recommendations. Needs to be integrated with community development findings.
1.2.4	<i>Service base</i>	Has been actively considered, but decision taken that it is too early a stage in the process of “community engagement” to establish a base.	Earlier experience with the suspicions and jealousies which arose after a radio was installed for project communications - and which resulted in the house arrest of project staff - underline how far-reaching are the ramifications of a decision on this matter.
1.3	CDT training		
1.3.1	<i>Participatory management planning</i>	16 CDT members trained since fieldwork began in Bismarck-Ramu.	The participatory methodology developed through the project has been very successful in empowering CDTs for effective fieldwork.
1.3.2	<i>Community entry techniques</i>	Training is provided as an integral part of every pre-Patrol briefing and post-Patrol debriefing.	
1.3.3	<i>Development education</i>	Regarded and treated by the CDTs as an integral part of the community development process which they are facilitating and is perceived by them to be proceeding satisfactorily. Independent evaluation has not been possible.	All but one of the communities engaged in the process is still at the early stage of the community development process. Training in the identification of development options is underway.
1.3.4	<i>Conservation education</i>	A strategy for conservation education has been prepared and is about to be applied to the first of the communities to have reached the point of seeking information and guidance on conservation options.	The strategy arises from the community development process, is conceptual, and needs to be further refined as experience and information is gained.
1.4	ICAD data		
1.4.1	<i>Community data</i>	A great body of valuable data,	

		primarily sociocultural, but also threats to biodiversity, has been obtained through CDT work and reporting, and through the recently reported Social Feasibility Study (1.2.3) and through ACIAR reports.	
1.4.2	<i>PRA studies</i>	PRA training has been provided.	PRA has been used to assist communities to assess their circumstances and is incorporated with other community development techniques. Community mapping has been useful in helping communities consider conservation issues.
1.4.3	<i>Income generation opportunities</i>	Not specifically addressed with participating communities, but much debated among Project staff with respect to the timing and style of proposed interventions at the appropriate stage in the community development process.	Further consideration needs to be given to the role of economic development in biodiversity conservation, and how issues related to this can be incorporated into the community development process.
1.5	ICAD process established		
1.5.1	<i>NGO Partner</i>	The Project has worked with the Christensen Research Institute as the NGO partner and this relationship has produced some good outputs.	The recent closure of the CRI facility at Madang is a major disappointment, but it does not compromise prospects for a satisfactory conclusion to the Project. Had the role of the subcontracted NGO been more clearly defined, many of the problems encountered could have been avoided.
1.5.2	<i>Community mobilisation</i>	In one community, it is evident that the mobilisation phase has been reached, and this has led to numerous self-help initiatives in health and education. These achievements form the basis of a	Clear evidence of a community's capacity to organise, lead and be led, is an essential pre-requisite to sustainable conservation efforts.

		conservation strategy which is ready for implementation.	
1.5.3	<i>ICAD decision making forums</i>	Several of the participating communities are in the process of establishing decision making and problem solving systems.	It is important that where systems exist and are functional, communities be encouraged to accept and use these.
1.5.4	<i>ICAD project logframe process</i>	Bismarck-Ramu staff have been engaged in an exercise to systematically plan their work using a logical framework approach.	A creditable attempt was made to engage project staff in developing the logframe, to facilitate ownership and responsibility. However, it did not proceed past an early draft. Recommendation 4 of the December 1996 TPR, to revise and formalise the draft Framework Plan for Bismarck Ramu, was not actioned.
1.5.5	<i>Conservation management systems</i>	A conservation strategy has been prepared for use in guiding the development of each participating community's conservation management system.	
1.6	Options for community development services		
1.6.1	<i>Defining development support areas</i>	Results are beginning to emerge from the process of community education assessment and analysis.	Significant achievement reported in one community; status of the others remains unclear.
1.6.2	<i>Preparation of development support programme</i>	Discussions have been held with Provincial and District officials, and NGOs, regarding development support.	The prodoc makes no provision for funding of development support. Project staff can only serve in a facilitation role.
1.6.3	<i>Delivery of development support</i>		Comment at 1.6.2 applies. Annex 6 provides an example.
1.6.4	<i>Implementation of development support</i>	None.	Comment at 1.6.2 applies.

1.7	ICAD education programme		
1.7.1	<i>Churches</i>	Strategy developed, but implementation is in the early stages.	The coordinator of activities under this strategy is commended for the quality of work and for the quality and consistency of reporting.
1.7.2	<i>Schools</i>	No clear strategy for conservation education in schools is yet apparent.	
1.7.3	<i>Administrators</i>	Some Provincial and District administrators have been engaged in conservation education.	Among other things, through this activity the Project has developed a basis for support at Provincial and District levels.
1.7.4	<i>Education training materials</i>	Some materials produced.	Some are inappropriate to their target audience, and this points to the need to have a peer review process in place.
Immediate Objective 2: DEC Institutional Strengthening			
2.1	CRC established		
2.1.1	<i>CRC staff recruited</i>	No new staff planned for the period, and none appointed.	
2.1.2	<i>CRC consultants</i>		The Advocacy/Communications role is particularly important, arising from Recommendation 11 of the December, 1996 TPR. As a result, some earlier shortcomings regarding preparation and dissemination of Project results are now being effectively addressed. Quality of consultant reports is not always good. Work on WMA guidelines, for instance, needs much further clarification of

			language.
2.2	CRC support for ICAD activities		
2.2.1	<i>Technical inputs to ICAD sites</i>	Sociological data provided	No biological and ecological inputs as biodiversity conservation activities not appropriate at the stage reached in the community development process.
2.2.2	<i>Training for ICADs</i>	Several individuals with roles in ICAD establishment have participated in training activities overseas and in-house.	The range of training subjects has been broad- from computer skills to social impact assessment. All training has been relevant.
2.2.3	<i>NGO participation</i>	Active, and improved participation of NGOs.	Keynote events such as the September, 1996 workshop on ICADs served an important function in facilitating NGO participation.
2.2.4	<i>Networking</i>	Improved networking.	
2.3	CRC integrated into DEC		
2.3.1	<i>Support for Conservation Area Task Force</i>	CATF established, under DEC Chairmanship, but subsequently lapsed. Decision regarding placement of CRC within the Department has not yet been taken.	Arises from recommendation 9 of the December 1996 TPR. Established with clear TOR and got off to a good start, but no further meetings organised by DEC chair. If the CRC is to properly serve its mandate it needs to be placed centrally in the DEC structure, rather than being identified as at present, with a single Division.
Immediate Objective 3: Legal, financial and policy framework for the conservation system			

3.1	Conservation Trust Fund		
3.1.1	<i>Feasibility study</i>	Completed.	A creditable effort, well researched and based on a wide and extensive consultation.
3.1.2	<i>Analysis of study</i>	An advanced stage reached in defining and formulating the concept, and a structure and means of implementation.	The concept now needs formal government approval.
3.1.3	<i>Funding submissions</i>	Negotiations with potential donors have been initiated.	Capitalisation of the proposed fund is embraced by a World Bank Forestry Sector Project Proposal.
3.2	National Conservation Council		An assumption embodied in the project design was that appointments to the Council were a necessary pre-requisite to the effective implementation of the <i>Conservation Areas Act</i> . . This has since been demonstrated <u>not</u> to be the case and, so, this output has lost much of its significance.
3.2.1	<i>Feasibility study</i>	No report.	Even though judged of lesser significance, the decision not to proceed with this study, there should be a written justification for this.
3.2.2	<i>Analysis of study</i>	No.	
3.2.3	<i>Drafting instructions, staffing</i>	No.	
3.3	Development of government national execution capacity	Many instances of improved individual capacity, but continuing erosion of the DEC budget, staff losses and chronic uncertainty regarding the	This finding is common to all projects with an element of DEC institutional capacity building. Though uncertainty in DEC greatly frustrates implementation

		agency's future makes it difficult to discern a measurable improvement in national execution capacity.	of the activities of this output, it is important that these activities proceed in an appropriate form.
3.3.1	<i>Government capacity assessment</i>	Paper not produced	This activity should be undertaken before project termination.
3.3.2	<i>Paper on transfer timetable, for MTR</i>	Paper not produced	This activity should be undertaken before project termination.
3.3.3	<i>Training workshop on national execution</i>	No plans for workshop	This is a sound idea and should be implemented if at all possible. However, adding this to the large list of tasks which the CTA is expected to undertake could jeopardise prospects for other activities.

Annex 3**List of reports produced, and training conducted, since the MTR**Reports

- Hedemark, M. 1997. Biodiversity Data Management Institutional Survey Report, Number one: ***Biodiversity Data of Papua New Guinea and Related Natural Resource Information***. Department of Environment & Conservation - PNG/United Nations Environment Programme - GEF/0313/94-47. PNG Biodiversity Data Management Programme.
- Hedemark M. and Peters, P. 1997. Biodiversity Data Management Institutional Survey Report, Number two: ***Catalogue of Biodiversity Data Holdings for Papua New Guinea***. Department of Environment & Conservation - PNG/United Nations Environment Programme - GEF/0313/94-47. PNG Biodiversity Data Management Programme.
- Hedemark, M., Hamilton, S. and Takeuchi, W. 1997. Report on the First Bismarck-Ramu Biological Survey with Sociological and Logistical comments. Department of Environment & Conservation - PNG/United Nations Environment Programme - OPS - PNG/93/G31. PNG Biodiversity Data Management Programme.
- McCallum, R. and Sekhran, N. 1997. ***Race for the Rainforest. Evaluating Lessons from an Integrated Conservation and Development "Experiment" in New Ireland, Papua New Guinea***. Department of Environment & Conservation - PNG/United Nations Environment Programme - Global Environment Facility OPS - PNG/93/G31. PNG Biodiversity Data Management Programme

Bismarck-Ramu ICAD AOI Reports

- Helden van, F. 1997. Group structure and marriage rules in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD area. Social Feasibility Study Papers No.2. National Research Institute, Waigani.
- Helden van, F. 1997. Physical and Human Geography of the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD area. Social Feasibility Study Papers No.3. National Research Institute, Waigani.
- Helden van, F. 1997. Infrastructure and Government Services in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD area. Social Feasibility Study Papers No.4. National Research Institute, Waigani.
- Helden van, F. 1997. The Economy of the Bismarck-Ramu Area. Social Feasibility Study Paper No.6. National Research Institute, Waigani.
- Helden van, F. "Kampani bilong Environment" Community motivation for Biodiversity conservation in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD area. Proceedings of the second ICAD Practitioners Conference.

Report of the Fourth Round of Community Development Patrols in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD Area of Interest. March 1997. To the villages of Dungo and Nolumb in the Bubulsunga area of the Jimi Valley, and to the villages of Sepu, Yawetama, Wara Bruk and Boisa along the Ramu River and to the villages of Foroko, Yangal, Kukapang, Ukul and Miale in the Ramu Valley.

Report of the Fifth Round of Community Development Patrols in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD Area of Interest. April-May 1997. To the villages of Wambin and Dungo in the Bubulsunga area of the Jimi Valley, and to the villages of Sepu, Wara Bruk and Boisa along the Ramu River and to the villages of Foroko, Yangal, Kukapang, Ukul and Miale in the Ramu Valley.

Report of the Sixth Round of Community Development Patrols in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD Area of Interest. August 1997. To the villages of Sepu, and Garaligut along the Ramu River and to the villages of Foroko, Brimde, Wara Laplap, Yangal, Kukapang, Ukul and Miale in the Ramu Valley.

Report of the Seventh Round of Community Development Patrols in the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD Area of Interest. September-October 1997. To the villages of Kol, Wambin, Dungo, Nolumb, Klenol, Kaike, and Bubkile in the Jimi Valley, and to the villages of Sepu and Garaligut along the Ramu River, and to the villages of Foroko/Brimde, Yangal, Kukapang, Ukul and Miale in the Ramu Valley.

The Bismarck-Ramu Conservation Initiative of the Department of Environment & Conservation: An Integrated Conservation and Development (ICAD) Approach. (L. Orsak)

General Papers

Carbon offset: An option for carbon dioxide mitigation and also as an economic opportunity for forest management and biodiversity conservation in Papua New Guinea (S.Saulei)

Carbon offset: An additional or alternative economic incentives for ICADs in Papua New Guinea (S. Saulei)

The economic potential of non-timber forest products in ICAD processes in Papua New Guinea (S.Saulei & J. Aruga)

Are economic incentives for ICADS conducive to conservation in Papua New Guinea? (S. Saulei & J. Genolagani)

Botanical prospecting and Carbon offset concessions in forest management area (M. Parson & S. Saulei)

Tourism as an economic incentive for conservation (M. Parsons)

The Lak carbon swap initiative: Lessons learnt from a Papua New Guinea proposal to the United States Initiative on Joint Implementation (USIJ) (M. Parsons)

Bioprospecting: An Internet Reader (M Parsons)

Environmental or conservation education: How do they relate to one another? Essay No.1. (L. Orsak)

Awareness is not education! Some underlying concepts for conservation education in Papua New Guinea. Essay No.2 (L.Orsak)

The Problem with Preaching: Getting conservation messages across orally to local communities: Essay No.3 (L. Orsak)

Conservation education in Papua New Guinea: Today's Melanesian context. Essay No.4. (L.Orsak)

A strategic roadmap for conservation education in Papua New Guinea. Essay No.5 (L.Orsak)

Why conservation education is critical for projects that promote environmentally friendly economic incentives. Essay No.6 (L. Orsak)

Why conservation education must be a component for projects that promote environmentally friendly economic incentives. Essay No.7 (L.Orsak)

Conservation or Development? No! Conservation for Development! Essay No.8. (L. Orsak)

Nature conservation versus natural resource conservation: How each focus fits into a conservation education framework for Papua New Guinea. Essay No.10 (L.Orsak)

Nature conservation education in Papua New Guinea: Should we concentrate on biological diversity, habitats or just saving the 'useful things? Essay No.11 (L.Orsak)

Towards sustainable development in Papua New Guinea: Eight village-based activities that would dramatically reduce local natural resource depletion. Essay No.12 (L.Orsak)

What Conservation Education Materials are available in Papua New Guinea? An Analysis of the Conservation Melanesia Listings Catalogue. Essay No.18. (L. Orsak)

The 1993 Varirata Statement Applied. What Constitute a 'PNG Non Government Organisation (L.Orsak)

Capacity building, awareness, and advocacy: Achieving Education in Papua New Guinea on Environmental Issues and Natural Resource Conservation (L.Orsak)

Ol risos bilong yumi. A grassroots newsletter of facts about our resources (L.Orsak)

Papua New Guinea's special wildlife. How we can protect it and use it for our development. Education Material No.16 (L.Orsak)

Sustaining the 'Sustainable Timber Use' activities: Why comprehensive education must be integrated into small-scale sawmilling assistance programs (L.Orsak)

Relationship of 'conservation' to development', Wildlife on PNG's coins and Wildlife Management Areas. Newspaper articles for the World Environment Day (L.Orsak)

Capacity-building, Awareness, and Advocacy: Achieving education in Papua New Guinea on environmental issues and natural resource conservation. Discussion Paper (L.Orsak)

Earth Summit +5: Special Session of the General Assembly to Review and Appraise the Implementation of Agenda 21, New York 23-27 June 1997: A Supplementary Background Paper on the Implementation of Agenda 21 with Particular Reference to Biodiversity Conservation for the Papua New Guinea Country Report (J.Genolagani & S. Saulei).

Biological Papers

Natural Forest Regeneration 10 years after clear - fell logging in the Gogol Valley, Madang Province and its implications to the 35-year cutting cycle in Papua New Guinea (S. Saulei & M. Parsons).

Documents in Preparations

Proceedings of the second ICAD Practitioners Conference, Motupore Island, 1-5th September, 1997 (S. Saulei).

Community Development Booklet (B. Lalley)

Training Courses

17th February - 7th March, 1997 Participatory Conservation Management course at the Regional Community Forestry Training Centre, Kasetsart University, Thailand (J.Chitoo)

9 - 10th April, 1997: Closing the communication gap Workshop: Australian Climate Change Programs, Macquarie University, Sydney (M.Parsons & S.Saulei)

9 - 20th June, 1997. Community Development Team training at CRI, Madang (All old and new CDTs)

21st July - 2nd August, 1997. Community Development Team workshop at CRI, Madang (All old CDTs)

18-22 August, 1997. Third SPREP 2nd Climate Change & Sea Level Rise Conference at Noumea, New Caledonia (S.Saulei)

24 - 29th August with a debriefing from 30th August - 1st September, 1997. Community Development Team workshop, CRI, Madang (New CDTs)

1-5th September, 1997. Second ICAD Conference at Motupore Island, UPNG (M.Parsons & S.Saulei, 18 NGOs including the Bismarck-Ramu CDTs)

1 - 26th September, 1997 Environmental Management Training course on Integrated Conservation & Development, YC James Yen Centre, IIRR, Silang, Cavite, Philippines (L. Yat)

1-3rd October, 1997. Society for the Conservation of Nature Meeting, Vancouver, Canada (Bolisa Iova - National Museum using avian fauna data from Bismarck-Ramu ICAD project)

29th October, 1997. Association of Foresters of PNG, FRI, Lae (S.Saulei)

1-10th December, 1997. Third Conference of the Parties of the UNFCCC, Kyoto (S.Saulei)

CRC training for DEC and non-DEC personnel

1. *Biodiversity Data Management*

Biodiversity data management training was provided by the Conservation Biologist during 1997, covering staff from both DEC and non-DEC agencies.

2. *Conservation Task Force Training*

A training plan was developed for this Task Force, with Mr Sambeok from the Division of Environment - Social Impact Assessment Unit covering the six weeks attachment to CRC in June, 1997.

3. *DEC Informal Ad Hoc Rok Rok Seminars*

CRC facilitated this informal seminar programme of DEC, providing three speakers: Drs S.Saulei and L. Tacconi, and Mr F. van Helden. Mr J. Chitoo was the third CRC scheduled speaker who was unable to give a talk due to heavy work commitments. Through out the year a total of four such presentation were made during 1997, which was well attended by DEC staff, including the Acting Deputy Secretary.

DEC Administrative Staff

CRC contributed in training Ms Aidah Somake of DEC's Biodiversity Assessment Branch in preparation of a full colour illustrated book publication for print.

In addition, Mr Rai Kula from the same Branch was trained in the first half of the year in the use of microsoft word 7 software.

5. ICAD Practitioners' Workshop

CRC organised the second ICAD conference/workshop held from the 1-5th September, 1997, with a total of sixty participants, mostly the NGOs who are implementing and managing ICAD projects.

Annex 4

Social background to Bismarck-Ramu: the Social Feasibility Study Report

The Bismarck-Ramu Social Feasibility Study offers recommendations that can be grouped generally under the headings: Environmental Issues, the Community Development Process, Service Delivery, Income Generation and Educational Awareness.

With regard to environmental issues, the SFS suggests further research be conducted on the forest resources in the AOI so that the commercial potential of the timber resources is better understood. Further it was recommended that the Project gain a better understanding of the likely social impact of the mining operations and explore the possibilities for future cooperation with these companies. The SFS considers it essential that the Project avoid giving local people the impression that they have to choose between the Company (i.e., economic development) and conservation, as in the Lak situation. The SFS Coordinator suggests that if the Project strikes up a cooperative relationship with the mining company, its biodiversity conservation activities could be regarded as ‘incremental’ to mining activities and in this way possibly facilitate future GEF funding. The advantages and disadvantages of this suggestion need to be thoroughly considered as part of the Project’s ‘Conservation Strategy’.

With respect to the use of community development methodology as a means of solidifying conservation conviction, the SFS states that the best opportunities for soliciting genuine participation of local people appears to be in the Ramu River area. The area densely inhabited by Jimi settlers was considered by the SFS Coordinator to be an unlikely target area for conservation due to the relatively high population density as well as the high levels of mistrust and/or conflict between traditional landowners and the settlers. The SFS Coordinator strongly recommends that the Project not get involved in demarcating land in contested areas. Rather, it is suggested that the Project should focus on those areas least subject to conflicting use and ownership claims and to use an ILG process to establish membership groups and their land boundaries in the area. According to the findings of the SFS, the best opportunities for conservation lie with the Ramu River clans at Sepu - and possibly with the Aidem of Miale who are the traditional landowners of a large part of the Bismarck fall.

Project staff were also encouraged to carefully consider the reasons why local people may express an interest in conservation, as conservation in the ‘western sense’ does not appear to be part of the traditional ethos. (However, It is interesting to note here that all Papua New Guinean field workers do not share this view. See the Conservation Strategy for further detail on this important topic). The SFS goes on to say that the lack of a conservation ethic among communities in the Bismarck-Ramu puts the Project in a position where it will have to link conservation initiatives to issues which local people find important and which may move them to think about natural resource management. For example, people residing in the Ramu area are primarily concerned with the encroachment of Jimi settlers into their area. Hence, the SFS suggests the Project will need to consider means to reduce the incentive for this migration. One such strategy may be to provide/broker services to these areas as part of the larger strategy to conserve land in other parts of the AOI by reducing the incentive to move into untouched areas of high biodiversity. In this way

the Project could adapt a 'regional approach' to conservation in the AOI by attempting to influence resettlement patterns by focusing on service provision in high density areas.

The SFS makes clear that the Project will have to consciously decide which motivations it finds acceptable to base its conservation work and conviction building on. In this regard the lessons learned through the Lak experience are highly relevant. It is clear therefore that all Project interventions will need to take into account the various groups of allied and culturally related clans.

The recommendation of the SFS concerning the topic of service provision within the AOI is that the Project should focus on the issues of health and education. This statement arises from the fact that all groups in the Bismarck-Ramu appear to suffer from malnutrition amongst children and women, and high levels of infectious diseases. This combination leads to high death rates in children under the age of five and a generally low growth of population amongst groups in the AOI. The available health services throughout the AOI are extremely poor and show a systematic decline in the case of the Upper Jimi, with little improvement in the Ramu. Because of their concern with population growth and high death rates, health is the most important issue mentioned to the Community Development Teams during the participatory analysis of community problems.

Similarly, education in the Upper Jimi is poor with few opportunities beyond grades 3 or 4 for most people. Most children in the Ramu do not go to school. The SFS suggests that if the Project proceeds, money should be made available to address these issues and, further, mining Projects have the potential to be important partners in the provision of services in the AOI. Additionally, the SFS states that Local Level Governments based in Kol and Walium will play an important role in future Project work and recommends that the Project establish linkages with the LLGs once they have been established under the new Organic Law. Similarly, district officers and provincial governments play an especially important role in the provision of teachers and aid post orderlies and this resource base needs to be further explored. These recommendations raise an important question regarding the role of the Project in providing and brokering services. To what extent should the Project address these issues as a means to achieving conservation goals, especially when health and education continue to arise as the most pressing concerns facing communities in the AOI?

The SFS states that the Project cannot avoid the issue of supporting income-earning activities and better services as part of future work in the Bismarck-Ramu area. The Coordinator predicts this will be a major difficulty in future Project work, as viable income earning activities related to conservation are very limited. It is suggested in this Report that consideration be given to options like the payment of conservation easements through a Conservation Trust Fund or the development of a 'Rangers Programme' as in Crater Mountain.

With regard to environmental education, the SFS recommends that this component of the community development approach be of great importance to the achievement of long-term conservation conviction and related activities. However, the Coordinator stresses it is unrealistic to expect Education alone to form the basis of a successful ICAD Project. Rather, environmental education must be seen as a long-term process where ICAD Projects must be concerned with developing approaches that lead to affirmative conservation action in the here and now and that will be sustained in the long-term. In this regard, the SFS states that acquiring an in-depth knowledge of traditional beliefs and practices regarding man's relationship with nature is important for several

reasons: 1) It serves to strengthen the identity of local groups and foster pride in their rich cultural heritage; 2) it reinforces the interdependency between man and nature; and 3) it provides a platform for the introduction of more western concepts of conservation. This process also serves to “re-empower” people by grounding them in their history and building-up their confidence for affirmative conservation action.

In conclusion, the SFS recommends the Project should take a long-term view of conservation and development in the Bismarck-Ramu area, should be based on the Community Development approach, and should aim to maintain the existing flexibility in the administration of the Project.

The management team for the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD has not yet had an opportunity to study the recommendations arising from the SFS in detail. Overall however, they believe the SFS has contributed valuable information to the community assessment process and much of the work completed in this regard has been incorporated in planning subsequent action in the AOI. However, there are also some areas of fundamental disagreement among the management staff with regard to the SFS findings. For instance, the importance of income-generation activities is afforded varying degrees of importance by individuals on the management team. Continued discussion and debate of these important issues is essential. The need for further anthropological work at this point in the process is unclear. It was suggested that future work be carried out in response to specific needs for supplementary information as they arise. For example, should it become evident that further data is needed on shifting migration patterns, or the viability of particular income generation activity, this would provide an appropriate impetus for carry-on activity. Depending on the information required, the qualifications of the researchers would become apparent. There was also a feeling that the CDT members are in the best position to continue gathering information of a general nature.

Annex 5

Community mobilisation in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI

Conducting Community Mobilisation Phase

The Community Mobilisation Phase must be considered in relationship to the larger Participatory Development Process underway in the Bismarck-Ramu area of interest. In this sense, the mobilisation of communities is the expected outcome of all Project intervention. However, it must be remembered that the issue(s) around which the community becomes ‘mobilised’ may or may not be the anticipated outcome, in Project ‘output’ terms. Incongruity of this nature can occur when local people are allowed to determine their own agenda based on their needs and motivations. This is a direct result of the participatory community development process that seeks, above all else, to empower local people in achieve their goals.

The Project’s role in community mobilisation concerning issues outside of the ‘conservation agenda’ is dealt with in Output 1.6 ‘Facilitating Options for Community Development Services in the ICAD site’. Of significance regarding the objectives of The PNG Biodiversity Project, the Bismarck-Ramu team has also developed a strategic plan for community mobilisation when Conservation becomes the presenting issue. Project workers refer to this approach as ‘The Conservation Strategy’. This strategy was primarily designed by the Site Manager and was vetted by the Bismarck-Ramu management team and the CDTs. Hence, the development of this strategy has been participatory, and builds firmly on the lessons learned through the Lak experience, the Site Manager’s past experiences with the Department of Environment and Conservation, the work of the CDTs as well as the recommendations arising from the Social Feasibility Study.

It is also important to point out that since the time of the MTR, there has been a great deal of progress made regarding the integration of a ‘Conservation Strategy’ within the larger community development approach. This statement does not imply a fundamental shift in ideology or approach by Project staff operating in the AOI. The community development theory employed by the Bismarck-Ramu ICAD initiative has consistently asserted that conservation objectives cannot be viewed in isolation from integral human development objectives; rather the wise use of natural resources will flow as a result of enhanced community empowerment. Hence, the MTR Mission recognised that participation and self-reliance were the primary objectives of the Project and that conservation conviction and all subsequent (sustainable) action would arise as a result of the community development process.

At the time of the MTR, the CDT members were unable to predict when conservation planning would commence since the communities in the AOI must be allowed to determine the own schedule, based on their readiness to embark on this task. In addition, a predetermined strategy for this work was considered inappropriate since the Project needed to remain flexible and responsive to the specific ‘conservation’ interests of communities throughout the AOI. Project staff stressed that the more they learn about the communities, the more focused their intervention becomes. This is congruent with participatory community development theory which validates the need to avoid pre-determining stakeholder outcomes.

Further, it must stressed that Project staff firmly believe that ‘a Conservation Strategy’, although newly named, has always been a part of the community development approach in Bismarck-Ramu. For example, on the second patrol into each area the CDTs work with the community to develop a ‘resource map’ that depicts the village’s present (and past) use of natural resources. The community development process attempts to firmly root people in their history and culture and heavily reinforces the notion that ‘land is life’. Contrary to the approach taken in most ICAD Projects, the field workers do not preach about conservation or environmental degradation in an attempt to obtain the communities’ commitment. Instead, as mentioned in the Community Development Specialist’s Report in Volume 2 of the MTR, the sequence of community development activities designed by the Bismarck-Ramu Project sees community analysis occurring before the educational component of the process. Hence, the focus of involvement by the CDTs is to employ various methods that enable local people to share, enhance and analyse their own lives, according to their terms of reference.

The current Conservation Strategy has four phases. The first, and essential, component of the Strategy begins with Community Entry and the absolute importance of building trusting, respectful relationship with villagers. The rationale for this accentuated focus on Entry (relationship building) is dealt with in Output 1.3.2. The second aspect of the Conservation Strategy seeks to build on information gleaned by the CDTs through the Education and Assessment phases of their work. Further information about the objectives and methods employed during Education and Assessment is found in Output 1.3.4. During the Analysis stage of the process, the CDTs work with villagers in exploring possible solutions to address the community’s identified strengths and weaknesses. The emphasis, once again, is on self-reliance and encouraging communities to reflect on solutions that they themselves can implement, rather than waiting for outsiders.

When any form of ‘conservation’ (see below) has been identified by the community as a concern during the Assessment and Analysis stage of the community development process, the role of the CDT is to assist the community explore the basis of their motivation in this area. For example, does the community want ‘conservation’ because it believes it will lead to ‘cargo’ (money or services) from outsiders, or is the interested based on the notion of protecting some aspect of their natural resources, and if so, from whom and why? The Project considers it essential that this step is not rushed in an attempt to demonstrate ‘conservation results’. Should the community-led process be aborted at this stage through a need to demonstrate specific ‘ICAD objectives’, the gains in participation achieved to date will be lost. In this way, the community’s motivation to proceed with conservation must be clearly understood as this forms the basis of their conviction for sustainable action. Consequently, motivation and conviction are considered key determinants in determining the sustainability of any conservation initiative.

The Bismarck-Ramu team also emphasised that all objectives related to ‘conservation’ must take into consideration both ‘western conservation’ (i.e., legally protected areas) and ‘traditional conservation’. In discussions with the Project’s Site Manager and the CDT members, numerous examples were given of ‘traditional conservation strategies’ that are strongly connected and reinforced by cultural beliefs and traditions. For example, Papua New Guineans historically restricted fishing and hunting activities to designated areas, allowed killing of wildlife only during ‘their season’, banished activity in ‘sacred places’, and have clan totem relationships with various species that ensure their protection. Hence, the community development process and the Conservation Strategy build on the assumption that Papua New Guineans are intimately connected

to nature and therefore, have a fundamental belief in 'lukautim bus na graun na wara' (protecting their forest, ground and water).

Once the community identifies 'conservation' as a presenting problem, and the CDTs have assessed that they are genuinely motivated in this regard, the 'Conservation Strategy' commences. First, the CDTs connect the community with the DEC representative (in this case, the Project's Site Manager) who meets with the community and begins to discuss the concept of a 'Natural Resource Management Plan'. It is important to point out that a great deal of work has already been done in preparation for this process. For example, a short-term consultant prepared a document titled 'Setting Up a Wildlife Management Area: A Step by Step Guide for Landowners'. Using this paper as a Guide, and in consultation with the Conservation Management Advisor, the Site Manager compiled a comprehensive list of resource management options currently available in Papua New Guinea. This paper details the distinguishing features of various conservation alternatives and is available in English and Melanesian Pidgin.

It is important to note that all conservation options discussed with the village will be linked back to the community development process, and will be carried out using participatory methodology. Further, people's traditional forms of conservation will be 'embraced' as this forms the basis of all conservation resource use planning. This is considered an essential part of the process because communities must be helped to understand that 'conservation is not a new thin. Rather, the point is stressed that 'conservation' is simply a new term for a concept held has long-standing tradition in local culture. By reinforcing this message, the Project seeks to build on what the community already knows and understands at a fundamental level. In addition to the community meetings held with the DEC representative, outside resource persons will be engaged to give an environment 'pitch', hence reinforcing the people's commitment. A local artist has already prepared numerous posters and other materials for use during the 'environmental campaign'. Other strategies for working with the community include the use of drama and popular theatre techniques,

While this process is taking place, the CDTs will continue to meet with the community during their regular patrols. In this way, they will be in a position to reinforce the work of the DEC representative and can provide encouragement to the community. The DEC representative (i.e., Site Manager) will assist the community, as needed, in having its area gazetted. An example of how the Conservation Strategy is linked with the Community Development approach in one particular community is outlined in Annex 6.

Annex 6

Development support with the Sepu community of the Bismarck-Ramu AOI

For the purpose of this Report, it is not possible to provide a detailed account of all steps taken to assist the community address their concerns. Readers who have an interest in learning more about the work carried out in Sepu are encouraged to refer to the extensive documentation contained in the CDT Patrol Reports.

The Community Development Team began working with the Sepu community in late 1996 and five patrols have now been made to this village. This community moved through the various stages of the Community Development process described earlier with relative ease, and its members began to organise themselves in mid 1997. During the Assessment phase the community identified four major problems: Health (infant mortality was high and numerous illnesses were prevalent); Water Supply (the river was polluted); Education (few people were literate) and 'Conservation' (concern was raised over the effects of the proposed Highlands Pacific nickel cobalt mine at Kurumbukari and the encroachment of Jimi migrants into their area).

Next, the CDTs assisted the community to prioritise these problems and explore solutions to address their concerns. As discussed earlier, an essential first step in this process is to encourage communities to develop solutions that do not rely on outside resources. By attempting to solve problems on their own, the community begins to organise itself and mobilise its own resources, hence creating the basis of sustainable action. With guidance from the CDTs, the community began to explore ways of addressing their health problems since this was their area of primary concern. The CDTs helped the community to see the connection between polluted water and their health problems and this became the impetus for community mobilisation.

In brief, the community assessed that their free roaming pigs were responsible for some of problems related to contaminated water. Consequently, they removed the pigs from the village and river areas. This action improved village hygiene almost immediately and will in the long run, help to address some of the general health problems. In addition, banishing the pigs also meant that the gardens could be moved closer to the village. This reduced the time spent going to and from the garden and allowed the community more time to concentrate on addressing other issues. In addition, gardens were previously located in a forested area that was continually being cut to allow for expansion. This is no longer occurring since the gardens are now located on previously cleared village land. It is important to note here that 'conservation' began to be addressed through this action. It is also relevant to note here that reporting from ACIAR studies on agricultural systems concluded that the primary threat to biodiversity in the AOI is food gardening.

The CDTs have also encouraged the community to take their water to the health department for testing since they were concerned it contained pollutants, and are now awaiting the results. Through the course of these self-initiated activities, the community became more organised and focused. Hence, a house and garden were readied in preparation for an Aid Post Worker whose posting was successfully negotiated with the Department of Health. Unfortunately, this Health Worker left after one month due to fear of 'sanguma' (black magic). However, the community has met with the Department of Health to request another worker. In addition, the community has

identified several local people who would like to receive Health Awareness Training and have asked the CDTs for information on how to arrange this.

Once the community's health and water related problems were addressed, they moved on to their third area of concern, Education. They requested assistance from the CDTs in learning to read and write (they want to be able to read the Bible in 'Tok Pisin'). With the support of the CDTs, the community has now identified several people who will participate in a Literacy Training Programme so that, upon completion, they will be in a position to teach literacy to others in the village. The community is currently gathering information on literacy programmes available through various NGOs.

On the most recent Patrol, the Sepu people told the CDTs that they were now ready to proceed with considering Conservation options. The CDTs spent considerable time discussing the community's motivation in this regard, since this will form the basis of their 'conviction' in this area. The CDTs have assessed this and are satisfied that the community is genuinely concerned with preserving their land due to their regarding the proposed mine and migration of Jimi people as threats to their resources. Consequently, the CDTs suggested to the community that they get in touch with the DEC Representative for their area (in this case, the Project's Site Manager) to further explore conservation options. To date, the community has made one attempt to connect with the DEC representative, but this was unsuccessful. Hence, the Sepu community was said to be 'knocking on the conservation door'. However, despite the temptation for the DEC representative to 'jump in', the Project firmly believes that the community must initiate this contact.

When this contact is made, the Site Manager is prepared to proceed using the Project's 'Conservation Strategy' as outlined in Output 1.5.2.

Annex 7

Education through churches in the Bismarck-Ramu AOI

As noted in the report of the MTR Mission, Churches have a profound influence on daily life in Papua New Guinea. In many villages where government services are lacking, local missions have established aid posts and literacy programmes. In many instances, the Church is often the only remaining communal gathering point, often taking the place of traditional structures. Hence, the Bismarck-Ramu team believed that village pastors offered an untapped and highly credible human resource for the development and support of conservation ethics.

Since the MTR Mission, a great deal of progress has been made in developing a church liaison strategy for the Bismarck-Ramu AOI, although implementation of the strategy has only recently begun. The Mission held extensive discussions with the Church Liaison Coordinator (previously known as the Education Liaison Coordinator) and reviewed numerous reports and materials prepared by this individual. The current Coordinator began work with the Project in July 1996 as a CDT member and participated in several patrols in that capacity. In October 1996 the CL Coordinator position was created when it became clear that the community development process would be enhanced by a specific focus on liaison and coordination with churches at the local and district level. The initial task of the Coordinator was to meet with various church related organisations to explore the potential for collaboration.

Following these consultations, the first Church Liaison Strategy was developed by the Coordinator and vetted by the Bismarck-Ramu management team. This paper outlined the vision and listed broad goals and objectives for the church liaison component of the CD process. Principally, the programme was designed to bolster the understanding and commitment of Christians within the AOI to recognise and respect their rich natural resources and to use these resources in a sustainable manner. The programme also sought to increase the ability and desire of local pastors to advocate responsible resource management practice at the local level. Seventeen distinct activities were outlined in this paper and formed the basis of the Coordinator's work plan for 1997. These activities ranged from gaining a greater understanding of the various churches operating in the AOI, including their organisational structures; forming relationships with key church personnel within the AOI, and at the provincial and national levels; assessing the receptiveness of church personnel to collaborate with the Project on information dissemination; assessing training needs and other forms or support needed to sustain an environmental campaign; liaison with government departments and NGOs, and the preparation and dissemination of relevant materials.

The Coordinator also specified the kind of support required to effectively carry out this work. Assistance has been provided in the way of office space and equipment, funding for travel, training and communication as well as consultative support in carrying out the activities noted above. A time frame was also included in the initial CL Strategy that saw the bulk of 1997 committed to public relations, networking, materials production and the establishment of a Resource Centre. It is important to stress here that the Church Liaison Strategy was not conceived as an independent activity but rather was considered an integral part of the community development process. Hence, close involvement with the CDTs was considered critical, as this partnership would form the basis of planning specific interventions.

The Coordinator is to be commended for producing quarterly reports which clearly outline the activities undertaken, the process followed the constraints faced and the identification of short and long term goals. These reports are organised under various headings and form the basis of a Logframe activity as the outputs; indicators and timeframes are clearly noted. The Coordinator's position was responsible to the Director of the CRI, although primary consultation took place with the Community Development Trainer and other members of the Bismarck-Ramu management team.

The Coordinator focused his attention on the following areas:

(1) Developing a working relationship with various churches and organisations concerned with conservation.

To date the Church Liaison Strategy has been centered in the Kol district due to difficulties faced by the CDTs in pursuing the community development process. The highly fragmented nature of the Jimi communities and their limited capacity for social control has posed significant challenges for the Project (See the CDT patrol reports and the Social Feasibility Study for further explanation). Hence, the CDTs recommended that the most effective method of proceeding with community development in this area be through the churches. As a result, the CL Coordinator has held numerous meetings with the Evangelical Lutheran Church (ELC) district administration in Kol. A proposal has been prepared by a local Pastor for presentation to the 'Circuit Council' (local governing body) for collaboration with the Project in three areas; (i) To include the CL Coordinator as a member of regular church patrols to various outstations; (ii) Conduct training courses for church leaders in the 'circuit center' (Kol) and in specific parishes; and (iii) to work in the newly established High School in Kol. It is important to note that the Pastor taking this proposal forward is the Chaplain of the local High School and is keenly aware the need for further environmental awareness and conservation.

In addition, the Coordinator has begun discussions with the Catholic Church in Kol and is in the early stages of exploring collaborative possibilities. There appears to be some potential to link with their existing Kristian Komuniti Retreat (KKR) Programme that focuses on educational awareness. The CL Coordinator also plans to follow up on these discussions in February 1998. Aside from the local and district church personnel, the CL Coordinator has linked with a number of NGOs and church related institutions. These include the Melanesian Institute, the Environment Officer with the ELC, the Christian Institute of Counselling (CIC), the Melanesian Environment Foundation MEF and the PNG Council of Churches.

(2) Gathering, Producing, Reproducing and Dissemination of Educational Resource Materials

Many resource materials have been collected by the CL Coordinator and other members of the Bismarck-Ramu team from PNG and elsewhere. In addition, the CL Coordinator has written numerous essays and short stories in preparation for future work with churches and schools in the AOI. There has been a serious attempt to integrate Christian theology and environmental stewardship in all aspects of the CL approach. This is consistent with the Project's goal of promoting integral human development where the spiritual dimension of people's lives is afforded the same respect as economic concerns. Similarly to the Conservation Strategy which attempts to weave the tenants of 'traditional conservation with western conservation', the CL strategy attempts to integrate Christian beliefs with indigenous spiritual traditions that recognizes holism,

interdependence and connectedness. The CL Coordinator has also transcribed a number of materials prepared by the former Education Coordinator and others outside the Project into the local vernacular. A local artist has also been engaged to help in the production of relevant materials for use in the AOI.

The CL Coordinator has distributed environmental information to a number of schools and churches throughout the AOI. On each patrol the CDTs carry information to distribute to local pastors as appropriate. Articles have also been written on environmental protection and self-reliance, for the national newspapers.

Overall, it would appear the Church Liaison Strategy has become integral to the community development process, and may in fact facilitate the Project's involvement in areas that would not be possible without the support and involvement of local churches. The CL Coordinator stressed the need to allow the Church Liaison strategy to evolve as the Project progresses rather than pre-determining a long-term strategy. This is consistent with participatory ideology that requires Projects remain flexible to ensure all interventions arise from the people's ideas. Consciousness raising of local pastors regarding environmental issues and the connection to spirituality is seen as a vital component of this process.