

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TF093667

TIGER FUTURES: MAINSTREAMING CONSERVATION IN LARGE LANDSCAPES PROJECT GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000086163 - Andrey V. Kushlin
Approving Manager: 00000164267 - Keshav Varma

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Asia
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	585 - CPF
Grant Start Date / End Date	02/11/2009 to 12/31/2011
Program Manager	Karin Shepardson
Original Grant Amount	950,000.00
Grant Amount	950,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	949,994.77 as of 06/30/2012
Disbursed 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012	949,994.77
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements, Internal Comments.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:

The development objective is to mainstream conservation across large landscapes through enhanced protection of tigers and their habitats.

Overall progress from 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Rating: Satisfactory(Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Comment:

The Project has provided significant and timely contributions to the technical underpinnings of the Global Tiger Initiative (GTI), a flagship partnership of 13 tiger range countries and leading international and national partner organizations united to save wild tigers from extinction. The Project has specifically supported a high-impact study on tiger conservation needs assessment and financing options, as well as escorted national stakeholder consultations in all the tiger range countries (subgrant to WWF) that helped guide their governments and GTI partners in developing the Global Tiger Recovery Program that was subsequently endorsed at the Tiger Summit.

Overall progress from 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

Rating: Satisfactory(Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Comment:

Component 1 (Building national and regional commitment for tiger conservation) and Component 2 (Gap analysis of financing needs for effective tiger conservation) have been implemented with very close alignment and coordination with other Global Tiger Initiative and TRC activities leading up to the November 2010 Tiger Summit and the subsequent launch of the Global Tiger Recovery Program in March 2011. Component 3 (Building regional capacity and transnational cooperation to address wildlife trade) was relatively more self-standing, and there had been a delay in the start of its activities (TRAFFIC, the implementing partner, was subcontracted only in March 2010). This delay has been subsequently offset by steady progress in the field (especially in Vietnam, Indonesia and Lao PDR) due to effective leveraging of partner inputs. Now all project activities have been fully completed.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

The MSP Objective was to assist in mainstreaming of conservation across large landscapes through enhanced protection of tigers and their habitats in the Tiger Range Countries (TRCs) - Bangladesh, Bhutan, Cambodia, China, India, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Nepal, Russia, Thailand, Vietnam) by: (a) enhancing institutional capacity and political commitment at national and regional levels; (b) identifying financial needs for tiger conservation work in the future; and (c) developing model approaches to controlling trade in tigers and their prey. The MSP was an integral part of the larger collective efforts under the Global Tiger Initiative (GTI), involving TRC governments and international partners, which led to the participatory development of the Global Tiger Recovery Program (GTRP). The GTRP was endorsed and launched by the TRC Heads of Governments at the St. Petersburg Global Tiger Summit in November 2010.

The MSP had three components: Component I - Building national and regional commitment for tiger conservation; Component II - Gap analysis of financing needs for effective tiger conservation; and Component III - Building regional capacity and transnational cooperation to address wildlife trade. Project activities are summarized below.

Component I - Building national and regional commitment for tiger conservation. It comprised 3 principal activities:

(a) A series of high-level country dialogues, supported by the World Bank and involving sector agencies; other national stakeholders and NGOs. The aim was to enhance national level policies and actions exhibiting awareness of the threats facing tigers and their prey.

(b) A technical strategic workshop, to bring together government officials directly responsible for tiger conservation in each of the range states with other technical experts, to agree on range-wide strategies and approaches to tiger conservation, and

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

address trans-boundary issues. This would also serve as the strategic planning workshop for tigers authorized under CITES Decision 14.70, made at the 2007 CITES Conference of the Parties. The workshop would also provide the technical background to support the 2010 Tiger Summit.

(c) Support to the 2010 Global Tiger Summit, to bring high-level attention to the conservation issues, and national-level commitments to support tiger conservation in the long term. This component would raise awareness and help to build the political will that is essential in achieving the enforcement and regulatory systems necessary to meet the project objective.

Outcomes: (i) strengthened national policies and action plans to address threats to tigers and habitats; (ii) increased technical knowledge on tiger conservation and wildlife trade; and (iii) improved regional cooperation on tiger conservation and wildlife trade issues.

Component II - Gap analysis of financing needs for effective tiger conservation. It involved 2 activities:

(a) Detailed analysis of the funds and human resources currently deployed for tiger conservation in key model sites and along specific trade routes to control illegal and unsustainable trade in tigers and their prey. Assessment would be made of where current resources are sufficient within those areas, and how much more might be required to be truly effective to achieve the long-term goal of sustainable financing and human resources for conserving tigers and their prey. Extrapolation of those results to tigers in sites across their range and trade routes emanating from them would be conducted, to determine the full future costs of conserving tigers and their habitats across their full current range, and potentially to restore highly degraded populations in parts of their recent historic range. The initial results of the gap analysis would feed directly into the technical workshop under Component I (b).

(b) Developing strategies for potential new and innovative financing mechanisms. The project would investigate potential new models for developing a sufficient, sustainable funding base for tiger conservation by exploring a range of options, as new financing mechanisms for biodiversity conservation are rapidly coming into play. The net result would be a greatly deepened understanding of sustainable financing mechanisms for tiger conservation.

Outcomes: (i) identification of the realistic and clear targets for funding tiger conservation for both government expenditures and donor funds, and (ii) mobilizing new financing for tiger conservation.

Component III - Building regional capacity and transnational cooperation to address wildlife trade.

Component comprises an integrated program to build capacity and transnational cooperation between wildlife trade management and enforcement agencies in two countries critical to controlling trade in tigers and their prey - China and Vietnam (other countries were also added during the course of MSP implementation). It would develop model approaches to addressing illegal trade in tigers and their prey, and would do so at places identified by previous analyses as important to controlling such trade: key cross-border trading points and major markets and consumption centers for illegal wildlife. The component would finance activities within each of the focal countries, and regional activities including multi-country dialogues and training programs. Activities would build on the experiences and long-term relationships of WCS and TRAFFIC, where they have already had significant success in working with local partners to conserve tigers and other wildlife, and in learning about and addressing the complex nature of the wildlife trade. Activities would include:

(a) Situation analysis for China, Lao PDR and Vietnam focal points A situation analysis would be undertaken at each of the selected market and border sites to bring together current knowledge of: existing trade controls and levels of enforcement effort; existing staff capacity (number of personnel/person days currently applied to implementing trade controls, access to necessary equipment and information resources, knowledge base); recent and ongoing conservation investments to address illegal wildlife trade; and known current levels of trade. This information would be used to support the development of model approaches for improving implementation of wildlife trade controls; target capacity building and regional cooperation efforts; and measure changes in illegal trade resulting from these and other efforts. It would also be a foundational step in determining human and financial resources required to ensure the effective control of illegal trade in tigers and their prey, linked to Component II (a).

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF093667	Reporting Period:	02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Printed On:	04/22/2013	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

(b) China capacity building program Activities would focus on Guangdong Province as a major consumer of illegal wildlife coming into China from many countries and would coordinate with actions across westward into Guangxi and Yunnan Provinces to manage the trade chain coming into Guangdong through the land borders from Lao PDR and Vietnam (see changes in the section below on Restructuring).

(c) Vietnam capacity building program Vietnam is both a major consumer of wildlife, and also a transit country whereby wildlife is imported from other countries to its west and south, and re-exported on to China. The focus would be on Quang Ninh province bordering with China, which contains the Mong Cai border gate and others.

(d) Transnational program promoting regional cooperation This would include support for the expansion of efforts under the ASEAN-China dialogue process to address illegal trade in wildlife, with a specific emphasis on establishing cooperative information exchange mechanisms to stop the cross-border trade in tigers and other threatened species. Exchanges between China, Laos, and Vietnam would be organized in border cities identified as key locations for cross-border wildlife trade. This would complement ASEAN-WEN and UNDOC efforts to enhance cooperation among these countries.

(e) Developing Guidance for Model Approaches to Controlling Trade in Tigers and Other Illegal Wildlife Trade Lessons learned and successful approaches piloted during training sessions would be compiled to provide guidance for a model approach to identifying and then putting into place actions needed to reduce illegal hunting and trade of tigers. The guidance would be used to roll out training in other tiger range and consumer states, to combat illegal trade of tigers and other threatened species.

Expected follow up (if any): Expanded capacity

Comment on follow up:

The MSP outcomes on conservation priorities and financing needs in individual Tiger Range Countries and globally have been critical to inform the GTRP and the decisions of the 2010 Global Tiger Summit, which played significant catalytic role in mobilizing national and international financing for tiger conservation. The adopted GTRP was based on National Tiger Recovery Plans, developed under the project, to be implemented by each TRC with the combination of national financing and the support from the donors. The MSP led to expanded in-country capacity to plan and implement on-the-ground activities under the national priority components of the GTRP.

As of March 2013, the confirmed donor financing for follow-up actions under GTRP amounted to USD 120.0 million. In addition to the leveraged GEF5 projects (through WB and UNDP), major contributors to date are the World Bank (USD 43 million); European Commission (USD 12 million); WWF and Wildlife Conservation Society (consolidating various funding sources through respective programs, USD 10 million and USD 7 million respectively).

The Save Our Species (SOS) program implemented by IUCN with World Bank, GEF and private funding has approved a follow-up project with WCS for further development and deployment of field activities related to SMART patrolling in TRCs and other countries.

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:

Although activities on capacity building in China were included in the original project design (subcomponent 3d), the Government of China (GEF Focal Point) has chosen not to proceed with these activities, and on March 20, 2009 the Grant Agreement was amended to allow allocation of grant resources for additional Tiger Range Countries - Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, Thailand - within the scope of this Component, instead of China.

Activity Risk

Rating: Modest Risk (Original Risk Rating is Negligible or Low Risk)

Comment:

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Funding was assigned for low risk activities, including analytical work, international workshops and capacity building to build national capacity to address illegal wildlife trade of tigers and their prey along trade routes.

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

There are currently no issues and actions for Management attention.

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

Strengthened commitments and action for conservation of wild tigers and their habitats in at least 10 range states

Baseline Low commitment and ad-hoc piecemeal implementation

Value:

Date: 09/30/2008

Progress to National Tiger Recovery Priorities developed and approved by Governments, with funding requirements clarifies
Date: and priority actions started, in all 13 range states

Date: 06/30/2011

Target Value: National Tiger Recovery Priorities developed and approved by Governments, with funding requirements clarifies
and priority actions started, in all 13 range states

Date: 06/30/2011

Strengthened activities to address illegal wildlife trade in tigers and tiger parts in at least 2 range states with key wildlife markets

Baseline Activities to address illegal wildlife trade in key wildlife markets ad-hoc and piecemeal, with low in-country
Value: capacity

Date: 09/30/2008

Progress to Interagency committees and wildlife enforcement networks (WENs) activated and strengthened in Vietnam, Lao
Date: PDR and Indonesia, with increased seizures

Date: 06/30/2011

Target Value: Interagency committees and wildlife enforcement networks (WENs) activated and strengthened in Vietnam, Lao
PDR and Indonesia, with increased seizures

Date: 06/30/2011

COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

Output and Implementation by Component

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF093667	Reporting Period:	02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Printed On:	04/22/2013	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

Building national and regional commitment for tiger conservation

Implementation Rating:	Highly Satisfactory
Status:	Completed
Planned Output:	High-level country workshops, strategic workshop, support to Tiger Summit
Actual Output:	High-level country workshops, strategic workshop, support to Tiger Summit

Gap analysis of financing needs for effective tiger conservation

Implementation Rating:	Satisfactory
Status:	Completed
Planned Output:	Analysis of funding and capacity gaps for tiger conservation; strategies for new and innovative financing
Actual Output:	Analysis of funding and capacity gaps for tiger conservation; strategies for new and innovative financing

Building regional capacity and transnational cooperation to address wildlife trade

Implementation Rating:	Moderately Satisfactory
Status:	Completed
Planned Output:	Situation analysis and capacity building programs in China and Vietnam; promotion of regional cooperation and guidance for model approaches
Actual Output:	Situation analysis and capacity building programs in Lao, Vietnam, Indonesia; promotion of regional cooperation and workshops on model approaches

Comment on planned and actual Output

See above. No additional comments.

Comment on component implementation progress

Component 1. Building national and regional commitment for tiger conservation

(a) Country-dialogue workshops. Technical assistance was provided to TRC governments, particularly Indonesia, Malaysia, Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Vietnam and Thailand, on the development of their National Tiger Recovery Plans (NTRPs). Inputs were provided to local government representatives that participated in the GTI meetings in Kathmandu, Hua Hin, and Bali, and in the Global Tiger Summit in St. Petersburg. These dialogs, and more importantly, the NTRPs, directly informed the content of the Global Tiger Recovery Program (GTRP), now owned collectively by the thirteen TRCs. Country-dialogue workshops supported the authorities in setting expectations, establishing responsibilities, and improving inter-agency coordination.

(b) Strategic technical workshop. It was originally planned that this activity would support IUCN's inputs into the Global Tiger Workshop in Kathmandu, Nepal (October 2009). In July 2009, IUCN revised its plans for engaging with this workshop, and the event was successfully delivered by the GTI through other arrangements (<http://www.globaltigerinitiative.org/2009/12/15/the-kathmandu-files/>). In response, WCS has agreed with the Bank to reallocate this activity's budget to another Strategic Technical Workshop that WCS and WWF jointly hosted on May 27, 2010, in Bangkok, Thailand, to help coordinate international NGO support to tiger conservation. In attendance were WWF, WCS, TRAFFIC and Freeland. The meeting helped align approaches and how NGOs would support range states with preparing their NTRPs and the commitments at the summit. The meeting also covered areas of strategic relevance, including approaches to law enforcement, monitoring and trade reduction. Out of this meeting came a revised MIST/SMART strategy and an improved sharing of responsibilities for supporting range states.

(c) The Global Tiger Summit was held in St. Petersburg, Russia on November 21-24, 2010 and was a success. It was hosted and

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF093667	Reporting Period:	02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Printed On:	04/22/2013	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

chaired by the Prime Minister of Russia and was attended by high-level delegations from all Tiger Range Countries. Delegations of Bangladesh, China, Lao PDR and Nepal were led by Prime Ministers. The Summit was also attended by the President of the World Bank Group, GEF Chairperson, top officials of other multilateral and bilateral donors and financiers, relevant development organizations of the UN family and convention secretariats. The Summit endorsed and launched the Global Tiger Recovery Program and provided a solid platform for the subsequent joint collaborative action by stakeholders in building respective operational and financial architecture for the GTRP and in implementing the Program.

In preparation for the summit, WWF and WCS worked with the relevant TRC national agencies responsible for tiger conservation to ensure that their National Tiger Recovery Plans were of high quality. The NTRPs were the key national documents that informed the creation and content of the Global Tiger Recovery Program.

Component II - Gap analysis of financing needs for effective tiger conservation

Deliverables of this component were centered around the report: "Avoiding the Unthinkable: What will it cost to prevent tigers becoming extinct in the wild?". The report, which was based on the inputs of over 130 people from across the sites where tigers still persist, was designed to provide an assessment of what it would take to reverse the decline in tigers and how much that would cost. An overall costing of every activity deemed important to recover tigers was seen to be neither practical nor useful, especially where costings could not be linked to a result (e.g. demand reduction). Instead the authors focused on the practical requirements for stemming the decline of tigers at the sites that will be the sources of recovery for the species. The final report was one of the 8 thematic papers underpinning the Summit deliberations and was posted on Summit's portal www.tigersummit.ru. The report included chapters on minimum standards for monitoring and law enforcement, as well as the financial costings and, importantly, most inputs came from those working at the field level rather than relying on remote-sensing or GIS. The report and the suggested approach received strong support from TRC governments. A subsequent paper was also published in a major peer-reviewed journal summarizing the results of the report, with authors from the Global Environment Facility, World Bank, University of Cambridge, IUCN Species Survival Committee and University of Minnesota.

Component III - Building regional capacity and transnational cooperation to address wildlife trade

TRAFFIC carried out five capacity-building workshops focused primarily on international trade and enforcement controls and improving co-operation on wildlife trade between Vietnam, Indonesia, Cambodia and Laos. These workshops were based upon TRAFFIC's global experience in CITES and other international trade issues, and were successfully implemented as follows:

Internationally, 35 leaders of key enforcement agencies at a central level and from a number of key border provinces (e.g. Quang Ninh, Quang Tri, Hanoi, Ho Chi Minh and Tay Ninh): CITES MA, Forest Protection Department, Customs Anti-smuggling Department, Environmental Police, Agricultural and Rural Security, Market Control, Border Army, Economic Investigation Police, Transport Police, Interpol-Viet Nam NCB, and the Supreme People's Procuracy were introduced to the communication, coordination, analysis and other support services provided by Interpol, WCO RILO, CITES, ASEAN-WEN, and UNODC for global co-operation on wildlife crime issues at a workshop in Hanoi. In addition, an overview of best practices and case studies of their effective use was provided, and a facilitated discussion focused on how these could be utilized in the Vietnamese context.

The first bilateral meeting was held between Indonesia and Vietnam on wildlife crime enforcement co-operation. 27 Police, Forestry and Customs officials from both countries met in Hai Phong port where many cases of illegally shipped Pangolins of Indonesian origin have been seized. Delegations agreed to utilize direct communications between agencies to share information, share wildlife legislation and make recommendations to their respective governments to develop a formal bi-lateral MoU on wildlife crime enforcement co-operation.

At the provincial level 149 law enforcement and government officers from Tay Ninh, Quang Binh and Quang Tri provinces in Vietnam and their adjacent bordering provinces of Kampong Cham (Cambodia) and Khammuane and Savannakhet (Lao PDR) were provided local-language information on regional wildlife trade flows and legal regulations on wildlife protection and trade control in Vietnam, Cambodia and Lao PDR at bi-lateral workshops held in the border towns. These workshops provided a forum to discuss mechanisms to improve cross-border cooperation on wildlife crime law enforcement and participants agreed upon

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref.	TF093667	Reporting Period:	02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Printed On:	04/22/2013	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

supporting cross-border investigations, developing joint border-patrols and monitoring; integrating wildlife trafficking into the agenda of future enforcement meetings that are regularly held between provincial agencies; and direct sharing of information at the provincial level.

Participant details:

- 1) Tay Ninh (Vietnam): 9 national and 33 provincial level law enforcement and government officers; Kampong Cham (Cambodia): 20 provincial level law enforcement and government officers.
- 2) Quang Binh (Vietnam): 6 national and 28 provincial level law enforcement and government officers; Khammuane (Lao PDR): 14 provincial level law enforcement and government officers.
- 3) Quang Tri (Vietnam): 8 national and 39 provincial level law enforcement and government officers; Savannakhet (Lao PDR): 15 provincial level law enforcement and government officers.

WCS-Vietnam Extensive training in detecting and stopping illegal wildlife trade was held for 174 law enforcement officers from a number of different agencies including police, customs, border army, forest protection department, quarantine/animal health, prosecutors from Quang Ninh province, selected neighboring cities (e.g. Hai Phong) and the central level. The training included species and wildlife product identification, wildlife crime laws, investigation techniques (including interrogation, source management, surveillance, search and seizure), placement of seized wildlife, and the health risks associated with wildlife trade. WCS Vietnam also carried out a study of illegal cross-border wildlife trade that compiled the most comprehensive analysis of border trade on the Vietnam-China border to date. The study provided a detailed site description (including key smuggling routes); compiles legal recorded wildlife trade (including the first review of CITES permits vs Customs records in the country and unprecedented cooperation between the two agencies); information from undercover investigations (e.g. on the main gangs involved and their MO); an overview of enforcement in the province (capacity, resources), and a review of detection and prosecution of wildlife crimes. The analysis provides a baseline for monitoring wildlife crimes at the border and also an important tool in lobbying government to address the border areas. We did not collect information on the levels of tiger trade as this was too dangerous for our surveyors to collect but we developed proxy measures such as counting illegal vehicle crossings. The analysis has been extended with co-funding from CEPF and under these funds we are about to roll-out a communications campaign to disseminate these findings to the very top of the Vietnamese government including briefings to the National Assembly, the National Anti-corruption Steering committee, the Vietnam Wildlife Enforcement Network and national and international media.

WCS Vietnam has developed successful models for tackling wildlife trade in other provinces of Vietnam (Lam Dong and Dong Nai province) although on a lower level of criminality, and those took 3-4 years to see results. This has brought lessons and experience from those provinces to Quang Ninh and the funds from the World Bank have allowed us to make great progress in understanding how to tackle illegal wildlife trade on a border where the main perpetrators of illegal wildlife trade are also involved in other serious crimes such as human and drug trafficking.

WCS-Indonesia catalyzed training to improve capacity in the national police, customs, quarantine, and judiciary in handling wildlife law cases. It also promoted media coverage to increase Indonesian society's awareness on tiger trade issues while at the same time ensuring the transparency of court process. Training targeted specific audiences, such as local community, students, police officers, forest rangers, civil investigators, and judges. More than 300 law enforcement personnel (mostly from provinces in Sumatra where tigers still remain), consisting of police, forest rangers, civil investigators, customs, quarantine staffs, and legal prosecutors have been trained in species identification, conservation laws, evident handling, and wildlife crime typology. This series of training was conducted in collaboration with ICITAP (International Criminal Investigative Training Assistant Program) of US Department of Justice and resulted in the formation of a Regional Communication Forum to foster better communication and information sharing among those agencies. To improve their skill in species identification, WCS-Indonesia developed, published, and distributed 1,000 copies of pet trade monitoring book and 1,000 copies of species identification field guide. This suit of trainings and interventions have successfully increased the arrest to prosecution ratio to 70% for wildlife crimes against the national background of only 5% (the figure of 70% comes from WCS's tracking of the wildlife crimes cases it catalyzes, the figure of 5% comes from a review of public records of the outcomes of wildlife crimes cases).

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P112108 - Tiger Futures
Project Status: Lending
Global Focal Area: Biodiversity
Product Line: GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: Wildlife Conservation Society
Contact: John Robinson
Address: 2300 Southern Boulevard, Bronx, NY 10460-1099, U.S.A.
Phone: +1-718-220-7165 Email: jrobinson@wcs.org
Website: <http://www.wcs.org>

Implementation performance ratings from 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012 with regard to:

Project Management: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Brief Comment:

WCS project management team worked effectively, with proper back-up always in place when decision-makers were traveling.

Financial Management: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Brief Comment:

None

Counterpart Funding: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Brief Comment:

None

Procurement: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Brief Comment:

None

Monitoring and Evaluation: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 06/30/2009)

Brief Comment:

None

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:

No additional comments.

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

PROGRAM

Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement - Satisfactory
2. Please rate government commitment - Satisfactory
3. Please rate safeguard performance - Satisfactory
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability - Satisfactory

Program Specific Questions

1 .Please comment on additional resources leveraged

GEF grant to WCS was leveraged by \$550,000 of WCS's own resources, plus cofinancing from implementation partners (\$177,148 from WWF and \$200,000 from TRAFFIC), and there was an overall leverage of over \$1 million from the World Bank under the Global Tiger Initiative and Tiger Summit preparation. Cofinancing table is attached.

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

This MSP played important role in the preparation for the successful 2010 Global Tiger Summit in Russia, which was a result of a broader effort led by the GTI, TRCs and global partners since 2008. Valuable project experience in organizing consultations in each TRC on National Tiger Recovery Plans will be further used by the GTI in multi-stakeholder participatory planning and implementation reviews of the Global Tiger Recovery Program.

Key operational lessons learned from the field activities in TRCs are summarized below.

1. The strategy that is most likely to successfully conserve tigers is one that focuses on ensuring inviolability and connectivity of Tiger Source Sites (referred to as #critical tiger breeding habitats# in the St. Petersburg Declaration on Tiger Conservation) within the Tiger Conservation Landscapes. Ideally Tiger Source Sites are as free as possible from human activities, are protected robustly by strong, field-based law enforcement efforts, and are monitored regularly for the tiger and tiger prey populations using the best wildlife science, while their buffer zones and connectivity corridors are properly managed for overall conservation objectives. With the importance of Tiger Source Sites in mind, recommendations for the stakeholders include: (i) for national governments to take more ownership over their tiger populations and thus cover more of the costs of tiger conservation; (ii) for the international conservation community to more efficiently channel tiger conservation resources towards the most critical tiger conservation interventions; and (iii) for the wildlife science community to monitor tiger and tiger prey populations more efficiently thereby saving tiger conservation resources.
2. Reaching out beyond environment ministries to agencies such as the judiciary and the police, as well as the press, are also innovations that proved to be successful and which may have applications for most tiger stakeholders.
3. On the enforcement side it is important to consistently tackle all aspects of an illegal poaching incident - from its detection, to the collection of evidence, the arrest, the prosecution and finally to the delivery of punishments based upon the highest quality judicial review. Doing so ensures that a high percentage of poachers are punished, and the punishment coupled with the media coverage serves as a deterrent to future poachers. A further lesson learned here is that improving the capacity of the police, customs officials, the judiciary and the media all require training curricula carefully tailored to the specific needs of each.
4. The most significant negative lesson learned from the Grant activities is that any tiger conservation effort that is not fully linked to an on-the-ground understanding of the tiger conservation threats is doomed to fail. There are just a handful of geographic areas left in Asia that are capable of supporting greater than 100 tigers. Given how few such areas are left, any tiger conservation effort that ignores the realities that each of these areas are facing is bound to waste precious tiger

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

conservation resources. The main recommendation for all stakeholders is, therefore, to become very familiar with the specific issues facing each landscape and continue to expend tiger conservation resources on tiger protection and tiger monitoring in a manner that is tailored to the specific situations found at each of these landscapes.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated Likely

Comment:

The overall outcomes of the project were generally greater than planned, with many of them expected to have lasting impact. While much will depend on the range-state governments' commitment to conserve and recover tigers, the regional and global support structure to back-up this commitment is now in place. Project deliverables were an integral part of the broader GTI process to establish sound institutional architecture and long-term financing arrangements for the implementation of the Global Tiger Recovery Program. The Summit of the TRC Heads of Governments resulted in building high-level political commitments for tiger and habitat conservation in the range states, which further empowers TRCs and global partners to establish institutional and financing frameworks for the long-term sustainable operation of the GTRP with a goal to double the number of wild tigers by 2022.

The sustainability is likely as the GTRP is based on the country-driven National Tiger Recovery Plans fully linked to the well recognized long-term national priorities, and since TRC governments demonstrated strong political commitment to tiger conservation. However, considering that pressures of rampant wildlife trade continue and political commitments have a cyclical nature, the following factors remain essential for the success: (i) the continued strong ownership of the GTRP by the Tiger Range Countries; (ii) readiness of national authorities to transform political will of TRC leaders into operational decisions on the ground in critical thematic areas, and (iii) adequate and timely mobilization of external to TRC funding by donors.

Project efforts on the ground to achieve tiger conservation through illegal trade reduction activities are also likely to be sustained. Many of the individuals trained through the Grant will continue in positions of influence within agencies that regulate trade within their countries. The training they received through the Grant will continue to lead to greater levels of enforcement against the illegal trade in tigers and tiger prey and thus will continue to benefit tiger conservation efforts.

Bank Performance: Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

The Bank provided extensive support to the Recipient in finalizing the MSP proposal and in coordinating the GEF-funded activities in the broader GTI operational context. The project technical and institutional design and the implementation arrangements were appropriate. Supervision had to be close in view of the significant technical value and high political profile of the activities (such as TRC national consultations on NTRPs), and their strategic significance for the global GTI agenda.

Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Substantial

Comment:

The project was built on ongoing programs, policies and political commitments of TRCs, as all of them ratified the Convention on Biological Diversity as well as prepared Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans, which support the conservation of natural habitats and the threatened biodiversity within them. Many of the most important biodiversity areas in each country overlap with the 76 Tiger Conservation Landscapes identified by the leading tiger scientists. Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Indonesia, Malaysia, Myanmar, Nepal, Russia, and Thailand all had operational National Tiger Action Plans, which varied in scope and detail but all reflected the common needs to increase resources to strengthen site-based conservation, control poaching and the illegal trade, improve capacity development, integrate the needs of tigers with formal development plans, and build constituencies of concern at national and especially at local levels.

The project also directly contributed to the implementation by TRCs, particularly by Vietnam and Lao PDR (two important countries in the commodity chain of tiger products), of their obligations under CITES.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Mobilization of other resources: Rated Substantial

Comment:

See attachment "Summary of Resource Announcements at Summit"

Knowledge exchange : Rated Substantial

Comment:

The entire Global Tiger Recovery Program jointly prepared by 13 Tiger Range Countries and multiple international partner organizations represents the capstone of the enormous technical and institutional knowledge that was generated and mobilized during the Tiger Summit preparation process. The series of national and cross-border provincial workshops organized by TRAFFIC between Vietnam and Lao PDR contributed to a boost of information and knowledge exchange on wildlife law enforcement and helped accelerate establishment of national Wildlife Enforcement Networks in these countries. The project also provided critical inputs to the subsequent international expert workshop on reducing demand in wildlife products hosted by TRAFFIC in Hong Kong in November 2011.

Client's policy / program implementation : Rated Substantial

Comment:

The project generated significant impacts on the TRCs' policy and program development on tiger and wildlife conservation, as summarized below.

1. Advanced national programming for tiger conservation. Extensive and participatory multi-stakeholder country dialogues undertaken in each Tiger Range Country led to the refinement of the national tiger conservation priorities, which were formulated and formalized in the National Tiger Recovery Plans for each TRC. The NTRPs, all adopted by the respective TRC governments, were made an integral part of the Global Tiger Recovery Program, endorsed and launched by TRC Heads of Governments at the November 2010 Global Tiger Summit in St. Petersburg, Russia. These national-level NTRPs, developed under the project, were critical to inform the global strategic programming made at the Summit.

The Global Tiger Recovery Program provides catalytic framework for the coherent and coordinated development and implementation of conservation projects in all Tiger Range Countries (Bangladesh, Bhutan, Cambodia, China, India, Indonesia, Laos, Malaysia, Myanmar, Nepal, Russian Federation, Thailand, and Vietnam), which would strengthen conservation of the critically endangered wild tiger populations and habitats. That would help to arrest and reverse the current progressing decline in this species and the losses in the related habitats of the high global biodiversity value. The direct global environmental benefits from the Program would include in a short term a decrease in tiger and its habitat losses and, in a longer term # an expected 2 times increase in the number of wild tigers over the next 12 years.

2. Agreed technical approaches to tiger conservation. The Grant has also contributed to a greater recognition of the importance of investing in protection of the Tiger Source Sites (referred to as #critical tiger breeding habitats# in the St. Petersburg Declaration on Tiger Conservation) within the Tiger Conservation Landscapes. Tiger Source Sites should be as free as possible from human activities, protected robustly by strong, field-based law enforcement efforts, and monitored regularly for the tiger and tiger prey populations using the best wildlife science, while their buffer zones and connectivity corridors within the Tiger Conservation Landscapes are properly managed for overall conservation objectives. Focusing on the Tiger Source Sites would significantly strengthen effectiveness and efficiency of the conservation effort. This recognition is now found across many concerned institutions, both within governments and non-governmental, at the sub-national, national, regional and international levels.

3. Strengthening of national conservation institutions through targeted capacity building. As a result of the project's capacity building program, national authorities are now much more focused on using the best scientific practices to monitor their tiger and tiger prey populations. Furthermore, these authorities are much further along in adopting the best practices for ranger patrol based law enforcement and law enforcement monitoring, essential components of any tiger conservation effort. Some national governments are also significantly more capable to implement their own laws that address the illegal trade in tigers and tiger prey. The Grant contributed to these achievements by catalyzing knowledge exchange on tiger and tiger prey population monitoring, and knowledge exchange on best practices for ranger patrolling and detecting and prosecuting cases of illegal trade in tigers and tiger prey.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

4. Mobilization of resources. The project assessed funding gaps and suggested specific actions to raise additional financing for tiger conservation. This analysis was critical to inform the participants of GTI high level meetings and, eventually, the 2010 St. Petersburg Global Tiger Summit, in making strategic planning for resource allocation, thus supporting national and global funding commitments made at the Summit. Key funding commitments for tiger conservation declared by donors at the Summit were reflected in the Summary of Tiger Summit Resource Announcements (attached to the ICM).

By activities on the ground the MSP also contributed to the mobilization of resources at the national level in some TRCs. For example the Government of Thailand increased by 40 the number of ranger patrol staff operating in the Western Forest Complex.

5. New forms of cooperation for tiger conservation. The project catalyzed innovative interprovincial agreements between provinces in Vietnam, Cambodia and Laos to reduce the illegal trade in wildlife (Quang Binh, Tay Ninh, and Quang Tri Provinces in Vietnam, Khammoune and Savannakhet Provinces in Laos, and Kom Pong Cham Province in Cambodia). The MSP also enhanced cooperation between customs offices in Indonesia and Vietnam through site visits by customs officials and the agreed mechanisms for improved information exchange.

Efficiency : Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

Project activities were implemented efficiently. All outcomes and outputs were achieved. The implementation time was reasonable. The timing of specific deliverables was coordinated with the broader GTI agenda and was adequate to properly inform critical GTI meetings in Kathmandu, Hua Hin, Bali and St. Petersburg. As the project was implemented through the leading international conservation organizations #WCS and WWF with complementary technical strengths and extensive practical experience in the countries of operation, the MSP additionally benefited from their individual and cumulative experience, management and technical expertise.

An emphasis on conservation of the tiger as a #flagship#species enabled the project to address more substantive objectives of integrated wildlife and habitat conservation in the tiger range. The environmental benefits were broader and exceeded those of protecting the tiger as individual species. Additionally, the project targeted resources to assure a high quality of the major GTI events lined up in the preparation to the 2010 Global Tiger Summit and as such lead to substantive and measurable commitments to tiger conservation by top political leaders. It is a small investment which can lead to big returns. Thus, the project was also highly cost-effective in relation to achieving the objectives of the GEF strategic programs.

Replicability: Rated Likely

Comment:

The Global Tiger Recovery Program based of the National Tiger Recovery Plans and launched at the Tiger Summit in St. Petersburg would pilot and support replicable initiatives in four broad thematic areas: (i) critical landscape and protected area management, (ii) technology for wildlife protection, (iii) community engagement, and (iv) cooperative management of international landscapes.

MSP activities also generated the following important lessons for replication:

1. The idea of Source Sites embedded within larger landscapes is an approach to the conservation of more than just tigers - it has applicability to many species of large mammals. For example a high percentage of the remaining Asian elephants left in the wild are found in tiger source sites. As the total amount of resources for wildlife conservation is limited, it makes sense to focus those resources down to a geographic scale where they will be able to achieve conservation for a wide variety of threatened species. In the Asian context this would mean focusing down on Source Sites that have important tiger and Asian elephant populations.

2. Another idea of the wide applicability is to consistently tackle all aspects of an illegal poaching incident - from its detection, to the collection of evidence, the arrest, prosecution and finally to the delivery of punishments based upon the highest quality judicial review. The project's focus on work #on the ground#, rather than desk-studies or GIS analyses, has

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

meant that a far greater proportion of time and effort has been expended developing methodologies and approaches between landscapes. For example, the #Avoiding the Unthinkable#report provides examples from three countries and uses other approaches to suggest new methodologies for setting regional standards. These standards are now being developed beyond the life of the project and are intended for adaptation for a wide-range of species and protected areas. There is a particular scope for extension to Africa where increasing pressures on large-bodied and high-value species is similar in nature to the challenges Asian wildlife has been facing.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

To secure further sustainability of the project and Tiger Summit outcomes, Tiger Range Countries and international partner organizations - including WCS, WWF, TRAFFIC, Smithsonian, ADB, bilateral donors etc - shall continue to align their on-going and new activities with the St. Petersburg Declaration, the Thimphu Affirmative Nine-Point Action Agenda on Tiger Conservation (adopted by the 2nd Asian Ministerial Conference on Tiger Conservation in October 2012 in Bhutan) and the recommendations of the GTRP portfolio.

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

To secure further sustainability of the project and Tiger Summit outcomes, the Bank/GEF operations in the Tiger Range Countries and global activities such as the Save Our Species (SOS), CEPF and similar programs shall be aligned as relevant with the St. Petersburg Declaration, the Thimphu Affirmative Nine-Point Action Agenda on Tiger Conservation and the recommendations of the GTRP portfolio. This is already being done, but will require continued focus on maintaining such alignment in specific IDA and GEF-financed projects.

PROCESSING

Manager's comments on this GRM report:

Date:04/22/2013 User ID:WB164267 Name:Mr Keshav Varma Operation
performed:Approved by Manager
approved

GRM report history - Requested on 07/13/2012,due on 09/30/2012

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/27/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/27/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	01/30/2012

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	02/16/2012
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Changed	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Mail sent to Reviewer	Andrey V. Kushlin	Draft	03/28/2013
Submitted for Approval	Andrey V. Kushlin	Submitted	03/28/2013
Mail Sent to PM	Andrey V. Kushlin	Submitted	03/28/2013
Approved by Manager	Keshav Varma	Approved	04/22/2013

DOCUMENTS

List of documents attached to this GRM

- 1) Full-Text Version ICM - P112108
- 2) GEF Letter Agreement with WCS
- 3) Amendment of GEF Letter Agreement with WCS
- 4) Resource Annaouncements at Tiger Summit
- 5) St Petersburg Declaration on Tiger Conservation
- 6) Global Tiger Recovery Program
- 7) Reallocation Request
- 8) Reallocation Notice
- 9) Subgrant WCS-TRAFFIC 01Mar2010
- 10) Subgrant WCS-WWF 15Apr2010
- 11) WCS-WWF Subgrant Amendment 17Nov2010
- 12) Report "Six-Percent Solution" Sep2010
- 13) Report "Costing Tiger Conservation" Mar2010
- 14) WWF Subgrant Final Report
- 15) TRAFFIC Workshop Report # 1
- 16) TRAFFIC Workshop Report # 2
- 17) TRAFFIC Workshop Report # 3
- 18) Cofinancing Table
- 19) Updated Cofinancing Table
- 20) GEF Biodiversity Tracking Tool

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
01/01/2009	06/30/2009	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2009	12/31/2009	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2010	06/30/2010	0.00	0.00	254,609.00	254,609.00
07/01/2010	12/31/2010	0.00	0.00	357,490.23	102,881.23

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF093667
Printed On: 04/22/2013

Reporting Period: 02/11/2009 to 06/30/2012
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

01/01/2011	06/30/2011	0.00	0.00	656,965.77	299,475.54
07/01/2011	12/31/2011	0.00	0.00	767,198.98	110,233.21

INTERNAL COMMENTS

Date:04/22/2013 User ID:WB164267 Name:Mr Keshav Varma Operation performed:Approved by Manager approved

Date:03/28/2013 User ID:WB86163 Name:Mr Andrey V. Kushlin Operation performed:Mail Sent to PM
This Grant Completion Memo was fully prepared and cleared last year, but the system was unable to accept it because of a glitch in the completion date. Submitting now.