

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TF023491

GEF MSP - YEMEN : PROTECTED AREAS MANAGEMENT PROJECT

GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000088572 - John Bryant Collier
Approving Manager: 00000021236 - Sherif Kamel F. Arif

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Yemen
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	7022 - MNSRE
Grant Start Date / Closing Date	02/29/2000 to 10/31/2005
Program Manager	
Original Grant Amount	740,000.00
Grant Amount	740,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	615,217.84 as of 06/30/2005
Disbursed 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005	47,046.00
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components/Outputs, Execution, Program(GEFIA), Completion, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives:

IMPROVING THE MANAGEMENT AND RESTORATION OF TWO PILOT AREAS, JEBEL'S BURA AND HAWF AND ASSOCIATED BIODIVERSITY

Overall progress from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Rating: Satisfactory(Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Comment:

The overall GO is upgraded to satisfactory because during the final six months of the Project, both the Hawf and Jebal Bura'a activities were completed.

Overall progress from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

Rating: Satisfactory(Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Comment:

Implementation of activities in both Hawf and Jebel Bura'a were completed during the final six months of the project. This project has also suffered from a difficulty in obtaining the required local funding.

The new road in Jebel Bura'a, that the government is constructing remains an issue. A proper environmental impact assessment has still not been conducted.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

None

Expected follow up (if any): Follow up project or grant (non-Bank funded)

Comment on follow up:

None

End Date of Last Site Visit: 07/15/2005

Restructuring of Grant:

None

Activity Risk

Rating:

Comment:

None

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

Summary of key issue and pending actions for management attention are listed below.

Critical Issues:

The potential deficit in the Jebel Bura'a contract is due to the fact that the contract was denominated in Pounds Sterling Rather than US\$.

Thankfully, the dollar rose against the pound during the last six months of the project. During the TTLs recent mission to Yemen, it was agreed with the EPA that after the final accounting for the grant is completed, if there is a remaining deficit, the EPA will request supplemental financing from the GEF (through the Bank) for the expected small difference.

ROAD CONSTRUCTION IN JEBEL BURA'A

By Whom: EPA AND MWE

By When:

Status: Pending

Date Resolved:

JEBEL BURA'A PAM REMAINS BEHIND SCHEDULE

By Whom: PROJECT MANAGER

By When: APRIL 2005

Status: Completed

Date Resolved: 06/30/2005

JEBEL BURA'A CONTRACT DEFICIT

By Whom: PMU AND WORLD BANK

By When: MARCH 2005

Status: Pending

Date Resolved:

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005

None

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

PAM PLANS DEVELOPED AND IMPLEMENTED

Baseline PROTECTED AREAS IDENTIFIED

Value:

Date:

Progress to Plans developed

Date:

Date:

Target Value:

Date:

COMPONENTS/OUTPUTS

Output and Implementation by Component

PAM PLANS - JEBEL BURA'A

Implementation Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Rating:

Status: Completed

Planned Output: Protected area management plans

Actual Output: Completed

LEGAL, INSTITUTIONAL, REGULATORY FRAMEW

Implementation Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Rating:

Status: Completed

Planned Output: Draft Legal Framework

Actual Output: Completed

PUBLIC AWARENESS CAMPAIGNS

Implementation Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Rating:

Status: Completed

Planned Output: National and local awareness campaigns

Actual Output: Completed

IMPLEMENTATION OF PRIORITY ACTIVITIES

Implementation Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Rating:

Status: Completed

Planned Output: Study tours, training, facility upgrades

Actual Output: Completed

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

PAM PLANS HAWF

Implementation Rating: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)
Status: Completed
Planned Output: Protected area management plan
Actual Output: Completed

Comment on planned and actual Output

PAM PLANS for Jebel Bura'a: Implementation was seriously delayed for Jebel Bura'a until the last six months of the project, when a concerted effort by the PMU and the consultant resulted in the completion of planned activities. The rating has been upgraded to moderately satisfactory since the activities were completed on time; however, there was no time for detailed review or follow-up, therefore, for this component, the team feels that "satisfactory" has not been fully achieved.

Comment on component implementation progress

PAM PLANS for Jebel Bura'a: Implementation was seriously delayed for Jebel Bura'a until the last six months of the project, when a concerted effort by the PMU and the consultant resulted in the completion of planned activities. The rating has been upgraded to moderately satisfactory since the activities were completed on time; however, there was no time for detailed review or follow-up, therefore, for this component, the team feels that "satisfactory" has not been fully achieved.

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P057346 - Yemen PROT. AREA MANAGEMENT
Project Status: Lending
Global Focal Area: Biodiversity
Product Line: GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AUTHORITY
Contact: ALI A. FADEEL EPA
Address: MINISTRY OF WATER AND ENV.
Phone: 967 1 218709
Website:
Email: PAMCZMYEM@Y.NET.YE

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Implementation performance ratings from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005 with regard to:

Project Management: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment:

None

Financial Management: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment:

None

Counterpart Funding: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment:

None

Procurement: Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment:

None

Monitoring and Evaluation: Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment:

None

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance:

The project is facing a potential deficit due to currency fluctuations since the contract for Jebel Bura'a was denominated in Pounds Sterling rather than United States Dollars. The situation is improved due to the strengthening of the dollar in the last six months of the project.

PROGRAM

Program Specific Ratings

1. Please rate public involvement - Satisfactory
2. Please rate government commitment - Moderately Satisfactory
3. Please rate safeguard performance - Satisfactory
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability - Moderately Satisfactory

Program Specific Questions

1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged

THE PROJECT HAS NOT LEVERAGED SIGNIFICANT RESOURCES BEYOND THE GOVERNMENT AND LOCAL IN KIND CONTRIBUTIONS.

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

On short reflection, the team has the following three lessons learned to share:

- 1) Medium sized projects like this one should focus more on implementation of activities at the national and community levels rather than on funding large studies.
- 2) The PMU structure for this type of small/medium sized activity should be reconsidered, as it resulted in very high overheads even during periods of project inactivity.
- 3) Close attention to procurement to ensure that contracts are written in same currency as grant is needed to prevent currency fluctuation issues like those facing this project in the last year.

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will elaborate on the lessons learned from the Grant.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability): Rated Uncertain

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will look at the sustainability of activities undertaken as well as the PAM Plans that were drafted in the overall context of Yemen.

Bank Performance: Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005.

Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Modest

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Mobilization of other resources: Rated Negligible

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Knowledge exchange : Rated Modest

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Client's policy / program implementation : Rated Modest

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Efficiency : Rated Satisfactory

Comment:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will specifically look at cost effectiveness of the project, including the PMU structure.

Replicability: Rated Uncertain

Comment:

While the model is replicable, the overall capacity of the EPA within the Government of Yemen remains weak; therefore, such an activity is unlikely to be replicated without some sort of external financing.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will include a section on detailed recommendations to stakeholders based on the final outcome of the activities.

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

The teams major recommendation is that medium sized projects like this should remain linked to larger IBRD/IDA investments primarily for a more cost effective approach to managing the project at the country level.

PROCESSING

Manager's comments on this GRM report:

None

GRM report history - Requested on 07/07/2005, due on 07/31/2005

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Ref. TF023491
Printed On: 11/21/2011

Reporting Period: 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005
Report Type: Completion
Report Status: Approved

Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Submitted for Approval	John Bryant Collier	Submitted	08/08/2005
Approved by Manager	Sherif Kamel F. Arif	Approved	08/08/2005

DOCUMENTS

None

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
01/01/2000	06/30/2000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2000	12/31/2000	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2001	06/30/2001	0.00	0.00	75,000.00	75,000.00
07/01/2001	12/31/2001	0.00	0.00	75,000.00	0.00
01/01/2002	06/30/2002	0.00	0.00	0.00	75,000.00-
07/01/2002	12/31/2002	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2003	06/30/2003	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2003	12/31/2003	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2004	06/30/2004	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2004	12/31/2004	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2005	06/30/2005	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2005	12/31/2005	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00