

INTERNAL BANK REPORT

World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) System

TF023492 - GEF MSP - YEMEN : COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT ALONG THE GULF OF ADEN
GEFIA - GEF-IBRD AS IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

Task Team Leader: 00000088572 - John Bryant Collier
Approving Manager: 00000021236 - Sherif Kamel F. Arif

Summary Information			
TF Status	ACTV	Orig. Grant Amount	725,000.00
Recipient Country	Yemen	Grant Amount	725,000.00
Executed By	Recipient	Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Managing Unit	7022 - MNSRE	Cumulative Disbursements	280,443.50 as of 06/30/2005
Grant Start Date / Closing Date	02/29/2000 to 06/30/2005	Disbursed 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005	21,002.86
Program Manager	Samuel G. Wedderburn	Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Outcome, Components, Execution, Program(GEFIA), ICM, Processing, Attached Documents, Disbursements, Internal Comments.

OVERVIEW

a) Overall Assessments and Ratings

Grant Objectives :

CONSERVATION OF COASTAL AND MARINE BIODIVERSITY IN THE TWO PILOT SECTIONS OF BALHAF-BURUM AND SHARMA-JETHMUN ALONG THE GULF OF ADEN

Overall progress from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005 with regard to :

Achieving Grant Objectives :

Rating : Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Unsatisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Comment :

After significant pressure from the Bank and EPA, the PMU and consulting consortium charged with preparing the protected areas plans for the two coastal areas covered under this project developed a workplan and completed the planned grant activities, working up until the closing date of the Grant. As the activities were completed, the rating has been upgraded to moderately satisfactory.

The project continued to suffer from a difficulty in obtaining the required local funding.

Overall progress from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005 with regard to :

Implementation of Grant Activities :

Rating : Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Comment :

The Activities were completed at the end of June 2005, prior to the closing date. The final results are being evaluated by the EPA and

Reporting Period : 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005**Report Type : ICM by PM****Status : Approved**

Bank.

b) Grant follow-up and structure**Description and context of Grant :**

None

Expected follow up (if any) : Follow up Bank project/loan/credit/grant**Comment on follow up :**

None

End Date of Last Site Visit : 07/15/2005**Restructuring of Grant :**

None

c) Critical Issues and Pending Actions for Management Attention

Summary of key issue and pending actions for management attention are listed below .

Critical Issues :

The Activities were completed at the end of June 2005, prior to the closing date. The final results are being evaluated by the EPA and Bank.

01. DELIVERY OF CZM CONTRACT

By Whom : CONSULTANT AND PMU
By When : JUNE 2005
Status : Completed
Date Resolved : 06/30/2005

OUTCOME**a) Comments on outcome archived from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005**

None

b) Grant outcome indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

01. DEVELOPMENT OF CZM PLANS FOR PILOT AREAS

Baseline Value : NO CZM KNOWLEDGE ON GULF OF ADEN COAST
Date :
Progress to Date : Moderate increase in CZM knowledge
Date :
Target Value :
Date :

COMPONENTS

a) Output and Implementation by Component

01. COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT

Implementation Rating : **Moderately Satisfactory** (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Status : Completed

Planned Output : Coastal Zone Management Plans

Actual Output : Completed

02. PILOT MEASURES

Implementation Rating : **Satisfactory** (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Status : Completed

Planned Output : Study tours, training, facility upgrades

Actual Output : Completed

03. AWARENESS BUILDING

Implementation Rating : **Satisfactory** (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Status : Completed

Planned Output : Public awareness campaign

Actual Output : Completed

b) Comment on planned and actual output

None

c) Comments on component implementation progress

The contract with the selected Consulting Consortium MacAlister Elliott & Partners Limited of UK and the Scientific Council for Systems & Applied Sciences (SCSAS) of Yemen has been signed on October 19, 2004. The implementation of activities has been delayed and the World Bank is highly concerned that the Consulting Consortium McAlister Elliott & SCSAS will not be able to fulfill the contractual obligations within remaining project time frame and with existing management approach.

Currently, designated international and national consultants are not in place and this would cause further delay. This indicates that this consortium does not realize the consequences of not being proactive in the implementation of the contract and benefits that local communities in the area and GOY as a whole will lose as a result of their ignorance. For example the GOY might lose the chance of getting new GEF Grants.

Since the last report, the Project and the consortium have entered into a dialogue and are beginning to resolve their differences. During the TTL's visit in December 2004, the need for all parties to be flexible and to work towards achieving the objectives prior to the closing date of June 30, 2005 was emphasized. At this juncture, the Team is moderately optimistic that the grant activities will be completed on time.

Reporting Period : 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005**Report Type : ICM by PM****Status : Approved**

EXECUTION**a) Bank project related to the grant**

Project ID / Name : P070219 - Yemen COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT
Project Status : Lending
Global Focal Area : Biodiversity
Product Line : GM - GEF Medium Sized Program

b) Implementating agency and contact details

Agency : ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AUTHORITY
Contact : ALI A. FADEEL, EPA
Address : MINISTRY OF WATER & ENVIRONMENT
Phone : 967 1 218709 Email : PAMCZMYEM@Y.NET.YE
Website :

c) Implementation performance ratings from 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005 with regard to :

Project Management : Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Unsatisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment :
None

Financial Management : Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment :
None

Counterpart Funding : Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment :
None

Procurement : Satisfactory (Previously Rated Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment :
None

Monitoring and Evaluation : Moderately Satisfactory (Previously Rated Moderately Satisfactory on 12/31/2004)

Brief Comment :
None

Additional Comments on Implementation Performance :

None

PROGRAM (GEFIA)**Program Specific Ratings**

1. Please rate public involvement SATISFACTORY
2. Please rate government commitment MODERATELY SATISFACTORY
3. Please rate safeguard performance SATISFACTORY
4. Please rate arrangements for sustainability MODERATELY SATISFACTORY

Program Specific Questions

1. Please comment on additional resources leveraged
FEW ADDITIONAL RESOURCES, BEYOND THE GOVERNMENT AND LOCAL IN-KIND CONTRIBUTIONS HAVE BEEN LEVERAGED.

ICM - IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION MEMORANDUM**a) Outcome of completed , grant financed activities****Outcome with regard to development / strengthening of institutions: Rated Modest**

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Outcome with regard to mobilization of other resources: Rated Negligible

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Outcome with regard to knowledge exchange : Rated Modest

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

Outcome with regard to client policy / program implementation : Rated Modest

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will detail the impact of the Grant.

b) Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned**Main lessons learned :**

On short reflection, the team has the following three lessons learned to share:

- 1) Medium sized projects like this one should focus more on implementation of activities at the national and community levels rather

Reporting Period : 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005**Report Type : ICM by PM****Status : Approved**

than on funding large studies.

2) The PMU structure for this type of small/medium sized activity should be reconsidered, as it resulted in very high overheads even during periods of project inactivity.

3) Close attention to procurement to ensure that contracts are written in same currency as grant is needed to prevent currency fluctuation issues like those facing this project in the last year.

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will elaborate on the lessons learned from the Grant.

Main recommendations to stakeholders :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will include a section on detailed recommendations to stakeholders based on the final outcome of the activities.

Main recommendations to bank management :

The teams major recommendation is that medium sized projects like this should remain linked to larger IBRD/IDA investments primarily for a more cost effective approach to managing the project at the country level.

Assessment of bank performance : Rated Satisfactory

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005.

Assessment of cost effectiveness : Rated Moderately Satisfactory

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will specifically look at cost effectiveness of the project, including the PMU structure.

Assessment of sustainability (likelihood of): Rated Uncertain

Comment :

Per GEF Policy, the Task Team will conduct a detailed ICM for these activities, which should be completed in November 2005. The ICM will look at the sustainability of activities undertaken as well as the PAM Plans that were drafted in the overall context of Yemen.

Assessment of replicability: Rated Uncertain

Comment :

While the model is replicable, the overall capacity of the EPA within the Government of Yemen remains weak; therefore, such an activity is unlikely to be replicated without some sort of external financing.

Reporting Period : 01/01/2005 to 06/30/2005

Report Type : ICM by PM

Status : Approved

PROCESSING**a) Manager's comments on this GRM report :**

None

b) GRM report history - Requested on 07/07/2005 , Due On 07/31/2005

Action	Name	Status	Date
Created	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Changed	John Bryant Collier	Draft	08/08/2005
Submitted for Approval	John Bryant Collier	Submitted	08/08/2005
Approved by Manager	Sherif Kamel F. Arif	Approved	08/08/2005

DOCUMENTS ATTACHED

None

DISBURSEMENTS**Disbursement Summary in USD**

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
01/01/2000	06/30/2000				
07/01/2000	12/31/2000				
01/01/2001	06/30/2001			75,000.00	75,000.00
07/01/2001	12/31/2001			75,000.00	
01/01/2002	06/30/2002			90,150.00	15,150.00
07/01/2002	12/31/2002			125,844.02	35,694.02
01/01/2003	06/30/2003			141,871.72	16,027.70
07/01/2003	12/31/2003			141,871.72	
01/01/2004	06/30/2004			213,367.69	71,495.97
07/01/2004	12/31/2004			259,440.64	46,072.95
01/01/2005	06/30/2005			280,443.50	21,002.86

INTERNAL COMMENTS

None